

EXHIBIT M

1 AFRAAZ R. IRANI,
2 vs.
3 PALMETTO HEALTH-RICHLAND
4
5

6 COMMITTEE MEETING IN RE
7
8 TERMINATION OF DR. IRANI
9
10

11 Due to the quality of the recorded media, portions were unable
12 to be transcribed. The transcript may also include
13 misinterpreted words. The transcriber was not present at the
14 time of the recording; therefore, this transcript should not be
15 considered verbatim.

16 AUDIO RECORDING WAS TRANSCRIBED BY:
17 Sherri L. Jolley
18 Midwest Litigation Services
19 711 North Eleventh Street
20
21 St. Louis, Missouri 63101
22
23 (314) 644-2191
24
25

T R A N S C R I P T I O N

MS. HILL: (unintelligible) your time. I've already briefed the committee this afternoon on their responsibilities, so I'm going to go ahead and get started. As I introduce people, if you will -- I don't -- have it written down, but probably not in order. So if you'll just raise your hand as I introduce you.

I am Gwen Hill. I'm the interim vice president here at Palmetto Health, in human resources. My role today is the moderator of this committee. I will not be a decision maker or a voting member of this committee.

All right. We're here to consider the matter of Dr. Irani's termination (unintelligible) Dr. Irani is sitting here on the left.

I will introduce everyone. Assisting Dr. Irani is Lynn Hearn (ph), human resource business partner. Representing management today is Dr. Walsh and Dr. Koon. The HR business partner assisting management is Donna Brown. Today's committee members are Mohan Sridaran, resident general psychiatry; Zach Brock, resident, surgery; Allie Giddings, faculty OB/GYN; Davinder Lally, faculty, internal medicine; and Eric Brown, faculty, emergency medicine.

Dr. Irani, the grievance committee members understand the seriousness and the confidential nature of these proceedings. All in the room have been asked to sign a form

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

3

1 indicating they acknowledge the information we hear today is
2 considered as confidential as any information used by Palmetto
3 Health, just as you've been asked, along with your
4 (unintelligible) sign that.

5 My role, again, is the moderator. I'll keep us on
6 task and on time. You're free to share information relevant to
7 today's proceedings. However, if you circle back and repeat, I
8 may ask you to move forward.

9 We will first hear from management. They will have
10 up to one hour to state their case. After they finish I'll ask
11 the committee if they have questions. After the committee has
12 finished its questions, I will ask you, Dr. Irani, if you have
13 questions. Please direct your questions to me during this time.

14
15 After you finish with questions, you will have up to
16 an hour to state your case. Likewise, after you finish, the
17 committee will have an opportunity for questions, and management
18 will then have an opportunity for questions. Make sure you
19 direct your questions to me, as well.

20 Then management will have five minutes to give a
21 concluding statement, followed by your five-minute concluding
22 statement. After the concluding statement, I'll ask the
23 committee if they're ready to vote. If they are not ready, they
24 will ask additional questions. At that point, both management
25 and the employee will be excused. We will let both sides know

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

4

1 the results of the vote by the end of today.

2 Does anyone have any questions about the process
3 we'll follow?

4 None? All right. We'll get started then.

5 DR. WALSH: I want to introduce myself for those of
6 you who don't know me. I'm John Walsh. I'm the chair of
7 orthopedics. David Koon is our program director. Everybody who
8 you are going to hear about as faculty members for orthopedics
9 was present during the entirety of Dr. Irani's residency, with
10 the exception of Dr. Grabowski, who started last August.

11 And the way that we're going to do this is Dave is
12 going to present the details of the case, and then I'll kind of
13 flesh things out and -- as they -- as they develop. These are
14 copies of e-mails and supporting documentation for Afraaz's
15 termination.

16 DR. KOON: I'm Dave Koon. I've been program
17 director for the department of orthopedics since 2006. I came
18 on staff in 2002. I'm a graduate of the University of South
19 Carolina School of Medicine. I finished in 1992. I served ten
20 years in the United States Army, got out in 2002, came to work
21 here at the University.

22 What I'd like to do today is start and kind of
23 describe the events that have occurred over the past couple of
24 years. And the bottom right-hand side of your pages are
25 numbered, and I'll refer to those numbers as we go through the

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

5

1 discussion.

2 Dr. Irani was a very impressive orthopedic applicant
3 to our program several years ago. He was born in California,
4 and he actually double majored at Stanford and attended Stanford
5 School of Medicine. He had multiple awards and publications and
6 research documentation. He had an excellent dean's letter.

7 He scored a respectable 223 on Step 1, and had a very
8 impressive interview with us two years ago. We were really
9 happy to have Dr. Irani join us. And I believe he was in the
10 top 12 of our applicant ranking, so he was highly sought after
11 when he came here.

12 He started his internship in 2010, in July. He had
13 the same rotation schedule as our other interns. In orthopedics
14 they're allowed to have three orthopedic rotations, and the
15 first few months were off-service. So we had fairly limited
16 exposure to Dr. Irani to start off with.

17 I began hearing some concerns from the other
18 services, some general attending comments in the hallway, and
19 specifically came to light when the trauma case managers came to
20 me one day and said, you know, "Dr. Koon, we usually don't have
21 problems with your residents, but here are some issues we're
22 having," and they were issues with time management and not
23 attend -- completing assigned tasks and things like that. And I
24 said, "Fine. I'll take care of it."

25 Please note that this is highly unusual for

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

6

1 orthopedic interns. Usually our interns do very well. You
2 know, we have attendings say, you know, "I want your intern in
3 my program, and we're going to try to recruit them away from
4 you," and things like that. And so having complaints against
5 one of our interns was unusual. And so I asked the chief
6 residents to handle it, which is what I usually do; you know,
7 "You guys talk to Afraaz, see what the deal is and, you know,
8 take care of it." And that was the last I heard of that.

9 The concerns continued, and in December of 2002,
10 while we were walking down the third floor hallway and
11 downstairs, I ran into Afraaz as I was walking across the street
12 to the office, and I talked to him a little bit about it, got
13 his side of the story, and told him that, you know, it was kind
14 of a rough way to start your internship, but he was getting
15 ready to go on an orthopedic service.

16 I said, you know, "You've got a brand-new chance to
17 shine, new attendings, orthopedic attendings. You know, here's
18 your chance to not necessarily start over but open -- or turn
19 the page and get a better start on things."

20 His -- if you look at our New Innovations
21 evaluations -- those are at Pages 1 through 17 -- there are
22 several things that I would like you to take a look at. On Page
23 -- first of all, if you look at the first several pages you'll
24 see that on a scale of one to five, Afraaz was starting to get
25 some twos on some of his evaluations. Now, we recognize that

1 there are different attendings who have different ways of
2 evaluating people, but, again, it was unusual for us to start
3 receiving this type of evaluation from our interns.

4 If you turn to Page 5, you'll notice additional
5 comments. On the top was a comment by Dr. Jones, "I was not
6 confident that Dr. Irani was completely invested in caring for
7 our patients. He did not give me the feeling that he was always
8 truly aware of what was going on with our -- with the patients
9 he was managing on the trauma floor." And that was similar to
10 one of the other attending comments that I had in the hallway.

11 Dr. Bynoe writes down in the -- Line 12, "Could've
12 been more interactive on the service." I noted in 12 -- Line 12
13 that his handwritten notes were essentially illegible, which is
14 something that he and several other residents have, and so I was
15 just going to give him a hard time and -- we actually had one
16 resident that we made stop -- start typing notes because no one
17 could read his notes, and it was, you know, not very helpful for
18 other people on the service, so -- but anyway, that was the
19 comment that I had written.

20 Dr. Jones again says, "He has not shown that he has
21 the desire he requires to support -- my support for caring for
22 my family." Those are very, very unusual comments for us to
23 receive about an intern on our service.

24 They continue onto Page 6, "He needs to step up to
25 being a doctor and become accountable and invested in treating

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

8

1 patients." And then Dr. Jones says, "Overall, still needs to
2 take responsibility for total patient care if they are his
3 patients."

4 And then I note in the middle of the page at Line
5 23, "I've spoken to Dr. Irani at length about his performance
6 thus far in his internship, and he needs significant improvement
7 in several areas. And he seems to understand these issues." So
8 this is something that I had spoken with Dr. Irani on several
9 occasions, and I've made a note of that.

10 If you turn to Page 12, another evaluator,
11 Dr. Mostriani (ph) notes, "Needs to take greater responsibility
12 for the welfare of the patient. Too often would fail to
13 recognize the need for urgency in patient care."

14 If you turn the page to 13, Dr. Ross, who was his
15 chief resident at the VA, says, "Dr. Irani had a rough start at
16 the VA where I first had occasion to work with him. He seems to
17 lack motivation and lack consistency in his patient evaluations
18 and care plans. However, I did see marked improvement by the
19 conclusion of the rotation.

20 His unique personality seems to get in the way of
21 interpersonal relationships, both with peers and staff. He is
22 highly intelligent and his core medical knowledge is excellent,
23 but he needs to temper this with a greater desire to improve his
24 core surgical knowledge base and skill set. I think that he has
25 the incredible potential to become an excellent surgeon, but he

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

9

1 needs to develop motivation and people skills to succeed."

2 So, again, I note that these were highly unusual for
3 our orthopedic interns, and he actually was -- Dr.
4 Irani was met by all three chief residents in 2010 to discuss
5 these issues and seek improvement, which was highly unusual.
6 It's not unusual for the chief residents to be asked to take
7 care of problems with the junior residents, but it was very
8 unusual for us to ask all three residents to do that for Afraaz.

9
10 He did transition to PGY 2 year in July of 2011, but
11 the concerns persisted. And if you note on Page 17, these are
12 several of the comments that he had during his PGY 2 year. And
13 the only reason I'm kind of jumping ahead a little bit, because
14 I'm not going to -- I'm not going to go back to the New
15 Innovations evaluations again, so I just thought it would be
16 worthwhile to look at some of these comments.

17 Dr. Voss notes that, "Somewhat slow and seemed to
18 not be driven by concern for the patient. Punctuality on rounds
19 was a concern. The trauma service is very busy, and he was late
20 for rounds several times. His patient care was inconsistent."
21 And so we have another evaluator who's noting some of the same
22 things that he had problems with as an intern.

23 Dr. Mazoue, one of our sports attendings, notes
24 that, "He also needs to work on his social skills with his
25 professional colleagues -- for example, OR personnel. In

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

10
1 addition, he needs to work on time management and efficiencies,
2 especially in the OR." And then Dr. Voss, on the
3 second-to-the-last notation, "Needs to improve empathy for the
4 patient." So all these concerns that we had near the initial
5 year and a half of Dr. Irani's training.

6 In July of 2011, Dr. Irani was involved in the care
7 of Mr. B, who was a trauma patient.

8 DR. WALSH: Brand-new PGY 2.

9 DR. KOON: Right, he's a brand-new PGY 2 resident.
10 And his initial -- Dr. Irani's initial eval with his patient was
11 11 July, so 11 days into his PGY 2 year. I heard of this
12 through a friend of mine who is a nurse in the emergency room.
13 Diane Savage is her name, and you'll see her name listed on
14 several of the e-mails. Diane has over 26 years of emergency
15 department nursing experience. Diane had an encounter with Dr.
16 Irani and Dr. Iaquinto, and that day documented her experience
17 and what happened in the ED.

18 Dr. Irani evaluated Mr. B at the request of the
19 trauma service. In his notations, he did a very brief history
20 and physical examination where he noted that the sensation was
21 intact to light touch; and then when evaluating his nerves, that
22 he had a radial pulse. He noted that the patient had an open
23 both-bone forearm fracture, that his hand was rotated 180
24 degrees, and that he was moving his fingers.

25 I would consider this fairly inadequate

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

11

1 documentation for a patient in the trauma room. There's no
2 mention of wound debridement, vital signs, pain medications,
3 wound measurements, grade of open fracture, antibiotics given,
4 tetanus, splinting, and there were inadequate radiographs
5 obtained by the orthopedic resident that day, because there was
6 only one single view. There are no post-reduction images, and
7 there was only wound management basically by the ER.

8 The only other documentation we have from Dr.
9 Irani regarding Mr. B was a very brief preoperative note that he
10 wrote the day before he was to go to surgery.

11 In short, the patient had an injury with, I believe,
12 a metal lathe, and Dr. Walsh was actually involved in his care
13 at a later time. That night, Diane Savage documented her
14 experience, and that was on Page 20. And I'll ask your
15 forgiveness. The ER threads are in chronological order,
16 backwards. And so the first -- the first note will be on the
17 20th, and then we're going to go back to 19 and 18.

18 So Dr. -- Diane had concerns about Dr. Irani's wound
19 manipulation, compassion that he did not show to the family.
20 Diane says that she asked him to stop manipulating the extremity
21 so she could get pain medicines, and Dr. Irani basically
22 refused. And this was noted by Dr. Spencer Robinson as well.

23 There was some discussion about how much irrigation
24 was used in the initial wound management by the ER physician,
25 and Dr. Irani says -- stated that -- Diane says Dr. Irani

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

12

1 stated that, "You used two, right?" She said, "No. We used
2 one." And then there was a little bit of back and forth where
3 Diane was under the impression that Dr. Irani wanted her to
4 state that there was two liters instead of one being used. And
5 then Dr. Iaquinto comes down and manipulates the extremity as
6 well.

7 This -- her view of the events was sent to Alice
8 internally, the director of nursing; Dr. Cadalano (ph); and then
9 to Dr. Stevens. Dr. Stevens forwarded the note to me at 10
10 August, and I immediately forwarded that to Dr. Irani, which is
11 on Page 19, for his explanation. Dr. Irani sent me his
12 explanation that night, and that is on Page 18.

13 Also, his recollection of events was forwarded to
14 Diane for her review, just to say, "Is this consistent with what
15 happened?" Please note that Dr. Irani's version of the events
16 was almost one month after the fact.

17 Several questions come to mind when I was reading
18 Dr. Irani's evaluation. First, he notes that he made a note
19 about the pain medications, but it's unclear whether he asked
20 Diane about the pain medications or not. Her recollection was
21 that he did not ask about the pain medications.

22 So his -- he wanted to inspect the wound, see his
23 pain level before approving a possible overdose of narcotics in
24 an 80-year-old male. But Diane notes that he never asked about
25 the pain medications. I'm not sure exactly what Dr. Irani means

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

13

1 by "see his pain level when inspecting the wound." And it's
2 unsure whether he removed the splint or not.

3 Dr. Irani also says that -- on Page 19, second
4 paragraph, he says, "The patient was very thankful throughout,
5 and when I saw him on the floor we've had great interactions."
6 But there's only one documented visit, and that was two days
7 later, which included a brief op note. So I'm not sure how many
8 interactions he had, were any documented, and there's no
9 documentation of a postoperative check that day.

10 Again, Diane notes that there were three witnesses
11 that documented the encounter that she recollected that night of
12 surgery. Dr. Irani also says that, "It was a regrettable
13 decision but one that had to be done. Many of the staff were
14 justifiably horrified at this and wanted us to do more."

15 I'm not sure who he's speaking of, "wanted us to do
16 more," and who was justifiably horrified. Diane Savage notes in
17 her review that the wound was impressive but not the worst she's
18 ever seen.

19 Dr. Irani later accused Diane of lying about the
20 irrigation amount. And when I asked him why she would make this
21 up, he really had no answer. For her to have an encounter,
22 document it that night, and make something like that up would be
23 highly unusual in my knowledge of her.

24 He also states that it's -- he stated that it was
25 the right thing to do. And when I reviewed his physical exam,

1 I'm not sure that there's -- there were indications for a
2 primary amputation in this patient. Again, Dr. Irani noted that
3 the nerves were intact, he had a good radial pulse, and could
4 move his fingers, so I wasn't sure that it was indeed the right
5 thing to do.

6 His version of the events that day seems to be
7 directed at her version rather than documenting the patient
8 care. And so we had concerns that day, and given those concerns
9 led us as a faculty to develop the memoranda for record which is
10 dated 15 August, which is Page 22.

11 And I'll just briefly review this. "Dr. Irani
12 demonstrated a significant lack of compassion and empathy in the
13 patient's care on the initial trauma resuscitation. Mr. B
14 sustained a near forearm amputation. Dr. Irani failed to
15 provide adequate pain medications and ignored nursing requests
16 for same during his initial evaluation. In this encounter, he
17 requested the nurse to lie about his initial
18 irrigation/debridement of the wound."

19 Number 2, "He had repeatedly demonstrated poor
20 communication skills with patient's family, peers, and
21 attending." And this was a concern that the faculty had not
22 only with his initial internship but also with us during the
23 first month that he was on our service.

24 "He has repeatedly demonstrated poor time management
25 with frequent tardiness to required conferences, clinics, and

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

15

1 the operating room." And that's noted on several of the
2 comments that we've already looked at on the New Innovations.

3 "He does not demonstrate effective prioritization of
4 clinical duties, which has resulted in other duties for
5 residents." That was something that two of the junior residents
6 stated that they had extra work to do because he wasn't either
7 efficient in the emergency room or efficient on call with his
8 on-call duties, so I felt that was something that needed to be
9 included in his remediation.

10 Number 5, "He has provided substandard care." One
11 of the substandard cares was he closed a wound while
12 Dr. Abel (ph) was on call with a Vicryl suture, and that's
13 something that he never saw one of us do, and I don't know if he
14 ever read it in a book, but that was something Dr. Abel, who is
15 one of our locum tenens doctors called me and said, "Are you --
16 you know, basically, what's the deal?" And I said, "I don't
17 know what you're talking about." He said, "Well, one of your
18 residents closed a wound with Vicryl." And so when --

19 DR. WALSH: Externally.

20 DR. KOON: Externally. And that was just something
21 that, you know, we would not consider appropriate.

22 He also was involved in a patient of mine when I was
23 on call one night. He got a call from the emergency room at the
24 VA about a patient who was in the early postoperative period
25 after a total knee arthroplasty. The patient had developed

1 cellulitis on his leg. And after a telephone discussion with
2 this physician, Dr. Irani made the decision that he didn't need
3 to see the patient; that Medicine needed to see them, to admit
4 the patient, even though the patient was I believe around ten
5 days after a total joint.

6 Number 6, "He received substandard evaluations
7 during his internship," which we've already gone through.

8 And Number 7, "He displayed a significant lack of
9 attention to detail in his initial PGY 2 rotation," which was
10 actually with Dr. Walsh.

11 Given the fact that we had verbal counseling with
12 residents, verbal counseling with faculty, and the degree of the
13 things that we were seeing this early in his internship, we as a
14 faculty discussed it and recommended to the executive committee
15 of the GMEC that these -- this remediation plan be implemented.

16
17 After their approval, we recommended three and a
18 half months of remediation of this document. This was discussed
19 with Dr. Irani and Paul Lathey (ph), who is our business manager
20 at the office, on the 15th of August, which is Page 23.

21 So the middle of the page is just my notes to Dr.
22 Walsh stating that I discussed it with him, that it had been
23 approved by Dr. Raymond and Dr. Stevens, and that it would be
24 implemented pending full vote in the GMEC at the next meeting.

25 Initially, when Dr. Irani was presented with the

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

17

1 facts in the memorandum, he did not agree with some of the
2 points and complained that some were too vague. He initially
3 laughed about some of them and appeared not to take them very
4 seriously. He then proceeded to offer excuses or rationalize
5 each point that was noted in his deficiencies and argued that he
6 was misunderstood.

7 The only item that he -- in which he agreed to was
8 Item Number 5, that he had not -- should not have closed the
9 wound with Vicryl. And that's when he accused Diane of lying
10 about the events surrounding Mr. B's care.

11 So I informed him that these were the
12 recommendations of the department, that it was -- that the
13 executive committee would probably approve it pending full vote.

14 I encouraged him to review the policy on academic remediation.
15 He was allowed to respond to each item in the memorandum and ask
16 questions.

17 And I informed him at that time that failure to meet
18 the remediation measures could result in remediation or
19 continued probation or possible termination from the program. I
20 gave him a copy of the memo and informed him that he could
21 respond in writing to our recommendations.

22 23 -- at Page 23 is that -- this was discussed with
23 Irani and approved.

24 Page 24 is the approval by the GMEC executive
25 committee on the 15th of August.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

18

1 Pages 26 through 28 are Irani's response in an
2 e-mail -- a response to the remediation measures in an e-mail to
3 Kathy on -- Dr. Stevens -- I'm sorry -- on the 22nd of August.

4 Several things that surprised me about
5 Dr. Irani's response is that if you see in the fourth paragraph
6 from the bottom it says, "I always demonstrate the highest level
7 of compassion and empathy in patient's care." And these
8 basically were not based on other attendings' evaluations.

9 Throughout his response, he says that he was
10 misinterpreted and that others just -- there was a perception
11 that was in error. He says in the second paragraph from the top
12 -- from the bottom, "Regarding the accusation about my lying
13 about patient care, this is a misinterpretation." And that's
14 one thing that we see again and again, that it's somebody else's
15 perception or it's a misinterpretation of what he said or what
16 he meant.

17 He states that he did everything right regarding Mr.
18 B's care and that he had already been given pain medicine even
19 though he didn't ask. And, initially, during my evaluation with
20 him on this topic, he accused Diane of having frequent
21 encounters which were not the best in the emergency room with
22 the orthopedic attendings, and that was one way he tried to
23 explain away that.

24 Regarding Number 2, that he demonstrates poor
25 communication, and the top of Page 27, that he says that he

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

19

1 appreciates the fact -- and, again, in the second line, he may
2 have been misunderstood, and so he's going to make efforts to
3 improve communication.

4 Regarding 3, he doesn't really say anything about an
5 excuse of why he's continually late for conferences and the
6 operating room and frequent tardiness to clinics.

7 In Item 4, he says that he's again misunderstood and
8 that there's perceived tardiness by the attendings. He says, "I
9 always complete my work and I often stay beyond the recommended
10 work hours so as not to burden other residents." All of our
11 residents know that the duty hours is non-negotiable and that
12 you have to abide by them, so never has any faculty or other
13 resident asked him to stay beyond the recommended duty hours.

14 Number 5, he did provide substandard care, and
15 actually admits to that, "Whenever I've been notified of my
16 errors, I proactively make improvements."

17 Number 6, he does not disagree with the substandard
18 evaluations that he has. He actually agrees with them and made
19 significant improvements based on the suggestions that were
20 provided to me.

21 And Number 7, he's a little bit -- he misunderstood
22 what we meant about the attention to detail. That attention to
23 detail was regarding Dr. Walsh and the history and physical
24 examinations in the clinic.

25 I don't know if you wanted to say anything about

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

20

1 that or not.

2 DR. WALSH: Just briefly. When I see a patient in
3 the office who's going to need surgery, either I or the resident
4 will fill out a history and physical at that point. And Afraaz
5 had rotated with me for -- well, for a number of weeks at that
6 point, and I had noted -- generally speaking, at the end of the
7 day, the residents go on up (unintelligible) my dictations and I
8 go through and proof everything, and I noticed that there was
9 repeated mistakes on the H&Ps, so I brought it to his attention.

10 It was a day that we had had several patients who needed
11 surgery.

12 I sat down, was correcting the first one. Afraaz
13 was still there at that point. Countless mistakes were brought
14 to his attention. He corrected them. I turned to the second
15 one, exact same thing -- more mistakes. And so I said, you
16 know, "Why don't you, right now -- while I'm still dictating,
17 why don't you go through these things, fix the things that you
18 can see are in error, and take care of it." So he did that.

19 For the most part, he was able to identify things
20 that he had either omitted or incorrectly documented. The real
21 issue was subsequent to that when he was doing H&Ps beyond that.

22 He either would omit the same things he was before, he would
23 omit other things, he would make the same mistakes, including
24 grossly inadequate documentation -- an extremity exam or -- kind
25 of what the whole point of the H&P is in orthopedics.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

21
1 And I asked him, I said, you know, "Afraaz, this --
2 you know, if you've had the things identified to you and you fix
3 them, and now you continue to make mistakes, but they're always
4 different. It's like every H&P there's something you're leaving
5 or forgetting or, sorry I didn't take care of that or whatever.
6 It just seems completely casual, like you don't care. And there
7 isn't something that's a -- something I can identify, oh, you're
8 not understanding this; let's fix it and take care of it. It
9 just is this scattershot kind of thing that is constantly
10 changing, and basically the -- what it communicates is I don't
11 really care."

12 DR. KOON: If you look on Page 29, this was an
13 e-mail from me to several people just to give an outline of what
14 we were going to do during his remediation process. So I wanted
15 to have complete transparency. I wanted it to be on a schedule.

16 And I wanted other people involved so it would not appear to be
17 a program director versus resident issue. I wanted multiple
18 people involved, and this included chief residents as well.
19 Paul Lathey was included because he's our business administrator
who has HR experience.

20 Dr. Irani was included in the process, and we
21 actually had to change one of his meetings because he was
22 post-call. So this was not something that was set in stone. If
23 something needed to be changed, we'd be more than happy to
24 change it.

25 Page 30 is Dr. Stevens' e-mail noting her decision.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

22

1 She illustrates knowledge of the appeals process. She alludes
2 to the GME policy on appeals process. And Dr. Irani
3 subsequently decided not to request a grievance hearing on this
4 remediation measures -- these remediation measures. So there's
5 no accusation of lack of or unfair due process or appeals
6 policies.

7 Page 31 is an e-mail -- Page 31 and 32 is a
8 memorandum from Dr. Walsh regarding a meeting that he and Dr.
9 Grabowski had with Afraaz.

10 DR. WALSH: Well, it's a relatively detailed memo,
11 and I think the thing at this point -- you know, he began in
12 July of 2011 where he's full-time in orthopedics. This is three
13 months later. And what I'm attempting to summarize in this memo
14 has to do with his performance as an intern on other services,
15 his performance as an intern when he was rotating in
16 orthopedics, and the time period there between July 1st, 2011
17 and the latter part of September.

18 And it's the same thing that I described a moment
19 ago about his performance in H&Ps. It's a checkered behavior
20 that is related to -- it's related to his behavior, it's related
21 to follow-through, it's related to his willingness to accept
22 responsibility, to perhaps initially accept responsibility
23 verbally, and it made zero difference whatsoever in terms of his
24 future behavior after that. So there's some specifics that I
25 tried to address relative to surgical skill and so forth. Most

1 of these things are -- Dave has already covered.

2 If you look at the bottom of the first page, I'm
3 aware of that particular patient with the complex forearm injury
4 because of my role in his care and subsequent care there. And
5 when I talked to Afraaz about that, one of the things that he
6 repeatedly mentioned was that, "Well, I knew him after this was
7 all over with, and he was an inpatient and we had a great
8 relationship and things were okay."

9 And I explained to him that's a patient who has had
10 major trauma, has had different forms of sedative medications;
11 then they had general anesthesia. More often than not they're
12 amnestic for everything prior to that point.

13 So the fact that the patient had a good relationship
14 with him later didn't in any way support the fact that he had
15 done the right thing prior to that, and that the real direct
16 observation or information that we had about his care for that
17 patient beforehand was related to the patient -- or to the
18 hospital staff members who were present and not to patient's
19 recollection several days later.

20 DR. KOON: Page 33 is a memorandum of record that I
21 wrote just basically stating that we again met with Afraaz. We
22 reviewed his six-month evaluation. We solicited his opinion and
23 feedback and progress, and we reviewed each remediation measure
24 and provided feedback. And that was Dr. Walsh and I met with
25 him.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

24

1 And I know that he appeared to gain some insight
2 into his deficiencies. He was on Dr. Guy's service and was
3 enjoying that. And Dr. Guy had been working with him on
4 communicating effectively. And Dr. Guy is definitely our best
5 communicator.

6 And that he -- he does note that -- I did note that
7 he had appealed through the grievance process as outlined in the
8 resident manual and that his appeal was subsequently denied by
9 Dr. Stevens. And then I said we'll meet with him again.

10 Pages 34 and 35 are the second memorandum that I
11 wrote after Dr. Jennifer Wood, who is a chief resident, and I
12 met with Afraaz in the prison clinic. Dr. Irani continued to
13 have problems completing assigned tasks. He was just having
14 problems on the ward.

15 And Dr. Wood had actually asked him to do things
16 that he had not done, and one of those was as simple as the
17 morning list -- print off the morning list each day, get some
18 vital signs, get current labs. And after repeated instances of
19 Dr. Wood telling Irani to do it, it basically wasn't done so she
20 started having the medical students do it instead. And that was
21 something that she addressed with him that morning.

22 Page 35 is -- the bottom one is an e-mail that he
23 sent to me one Thursday night about a patient that he had
24 dictated a transfer summary, and sent me a message stating that
25 he had never participated in the patient's care; Dr. Hoover did

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

25

1 the H&P; and the patient transferred from the VA, and the only
2 thing I can think of is Dr. Wood asked me to put in the
3 discharge order. And so he did the discharge summary
4 afterwards.

5 And I sent him a very terse response back stating
6 that, as a junior resident of a health team, his sense of
7 entitlement was somewhat astounding, that he would write an
8 attending, in the midst of academic remediation, that note,
9 after I'd asked him to do that same thing three separate times.
10 And so part of that was included in that memorandum as well.

11 He had been verbally counseled regarding
12 inappropriate patient care during a pain management problem with
13 one of Dr. Walsh's postoperative patients during this time,
14 where he had instructed the patient to take an inordinate dose
15 of narcotics in the postoperative period.

16 When we discussed this with him, he asked me about
17 the -- what my thoughts were about his remediation, and I said,
18 "Well, I think you'll probably go from Level 2 to Level 1," and
19 this seemed to irritate Dr. Irani. He kind of sat back and
20 rolled his eyes and let a big sigh and said, "All that's going
21 to do is increase my overhead."

22 And I had no idea what he was talking about, so I
23 said, "Afraaz, what are you talking about?" And he went on to
24 describe his keeping of a log, documenting when he answered
25 pages and when he got to clinic and when he got to the OR so as

1 to disprove any allegations of tardiness.

2 During that same time frame, on the 25th and 27th, I
3 had a postoperative patient who had manipulation and had wound
4 drainage after that manipulation. The patient called Dr. Irani
5 twice over the weekend, and not once did Dr. Irani tell the
6 patient to come in, be seen, and be evaluated. And this was
7 less than four months after his -- a similar problem at the VA
8 with another one of the postoperative patients.

9 On the 28th of November, Dr. Irani failed to abide
10 by the attending surgeon's directions in a staff clinic, and
11 became argumentative when confronted by the chief resident.
12 Basically, this was an instance of a gentleman with a foot
13 problem in the staff clinic. Dr. Grabowski said the patient
14 needs a stat MRI. Dr. Irani discussed this with the head nurse
15 and decided to let the patient go home and obtain the MRI on an
16 elective basis.

17 When confronted with this by the chief resident he
18 became argumentative and very defensive. And this was brought
19 up in a subsequent faculty meeting, and even when confronted
20 with Dr. Grabowski and Dr. Wood sitting in the room saying,
21 "This is how it went," he refused to acknowledge a mistake or
22 take responsibility for his actions.

23 And so, all of this together, I thought that we
24 needed to meet with him as a faculty on the 5th and discuss all
25 of these instances.

1 Page 36 is documentation -- or the memo of our
2 meeting with him. We met with Dr. Irani for over an hour and
3 included the vast majority of the orthopedic faculty. It
4 included chief residents Hoover and Wood and Paul Lathey. We
5 asked him several difficult questions, including, you know, "Do
6 you really want to be in an orthopedic program? If you do, do
7 you really want to be here?" Because we were getting the
8 feeling that he just didn't want to be here and he wasn't happy.

9
10 Then the issue came up of him recording phone calls.
11 Several of the residents had come to me with concerns that
12 there were weird sounds when they were talking to Irani, and it
13 was almost as if he was calling, knowing the plan but wanting it
14 confirmed by someone more senior to him. And so I basically
15 asked him if he was recording phone calls, and he admitted to
16 secretly recording Dr. Abel, one of our trauma -- orthopedic
17 trauma locums. And I asked him not to tape-record that faculty
18 meeting.

19 We again reviewed his remediation measures, and he
20 could not admit agreement to any of the initial remediation
21 measures. He continued to complain -- to provide evidence of
22 ongoing patient care and continued to display lack of effective
23 teamwork within the residency framework.

24 After this faculty meeting, the department voted
25 unanimously to place Dr. Irani back on Level 3 -- well, to place

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

28

1 him onto Level 3 remediation. There was a long discussion
2 regarding timeframe for that. There were initial -- there were
3 discussions for three months and six months and four weeks, and
4 basically what we came to was we wanted to place him on Level 3
5 but not affect his graduation date.

6 So we were looking to the future. We were looking
7 to fellowships and things like that. So instead of doing a
8 three-month, we had agreed to a four-week suspension to allow
9 him to have a time-out, to go home to California for a little
10 while and to, you know, start fresh when he came back.

11 The -- that was on the 5th. On the 7th he was
12 involved with a patient, trauma female 375. Trauma female 375
13 was a patient who had multiple orthopedic injuries, multiple
14 severe injuries, and was cared for by different nurses than what
15 were involved with the initial care of the trauma patient, Mr.
16 B. That was on the 7th.

17 I heard about it on the 8th in staff clinic. And
18 that afternoon I went to the ER to speak with Arlene Vance,
19 Elaine Simon, and Diane Savage. I got the same story of the
20 patient encounter from all three nurses -- very detailed
21 accounts that were in agreement in all areas.

22 DR. WALSH: And speaking with them separately.

23 DR. KOON: And speaking with them separately. Yes.

24
25 One of the nurses said, you know, "Dr. Koon, I like

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

29
1 Afraaz. He's kind of a goofy guy. He's kind of Irani." "But,"
2 she said, "he's dangerous with patients." And then she went on
3 to describe what happened.

4 The accounts vary. Pages 38 through 40 are
5 Dr. Nathy's (ph) version of the accounts. Pages 41 through 44
6 are the nurses' accounts of the encounter. And Page 45 and 46
7 is Dr. Irani's encounter.

8 My understanding of what happened -- and the
9 accounts varied from Dr. Irani's, "We did everything perfectly.
10 The patient was well taken care of. Everything was as it should
11 be," to the nurses, where not enough pain medications,
12 inconsiderate with the patient being awake and talking about the
13 patient in front of her, about her injuries, inadequate pain
14 medication, not getting out of the way so blood could be hung in
15 a hemodynamically unstable patient.

16 It was very, very disturbing what I heard that night
17 from the three nurses. But they were -- okay. They were all in
18 agreement, and therefore that is included on his trauma -- on
19 the encounter, and our decision to speed up the remediation
20 process. The faculty was acutely aware of -- acutely concerned
21 for our patient's safety and had no choice but to recommend
22 suspension while we further investigated the trauma female
23 incident.

24 Let me reiterate, the trauma female incident was not
25 a significant determining factor in his Level 3 remediation. It

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

30

1 was just the one that sped it up. We had basically made a
2 decision to do it. And based on his care of that patient, we
3 decided to recommend suspension.

4 DR. WALSH: Let me just add something here. You
5 know, Dave's been here since 2002. I've been here since 1999.
6 We've had residents who rotate through the ED and on other
7 services the entire time. Periodically, people have different
8 personalities, perhaps there's a dispute or that sort of thing
9 with how a patient was taken care of and so forth.

10 And we try and interpret these things in context.
11 And not every one of them was -- when we look into it do we
12 necessarily concur with, and so we're not really -- we're not
13 taking every single account at face value and not trying to look
14 at the greater context.

15 But in both of these cases you have something where
16 there is internally consistent accounts from the people who are
17 present. You have something that disputes that and doesn't
18 entirely hold water from Dr. Irani. And you have something that
19 involves the quality of a patient's care.

20 And, really, the thing that showed up a number of
21 times on his evaluations is this lack of empathy. And so in
22 both cases here you have somebody who's been badly injured and
23 the descriptions that we have of the behavior is that it was
24 very casual and it didn't really seem to be compassionate for
25 somebody who was badly injured.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

31

1 MS. HILL: Okay, Dr. Koon, Dr. Walsh. Just a
2 time check in. You have 20 minutes remaining.

3 DR. KOON: Okay. Page 47, that is a request for a
4 psychological evaluation of Dr. Irani. We weren't sure as a
5 faculty what was going on, and I asked the residents, you know,
6 "Is there a drug problem? Is there an alcohol problem? Is
7 there something going on at home that we need to know about?"
8 And I asked them to check with Dr. Irani to see. Having heard
9 the answer was no, the GMEC executive committee recommended a
10 psychological evaluation for Dr. Irani to help assist the --
11 assist us in formulating his remediation measures.

12 Page 48 is Dr. Irani cancelled the appointment less
13 than an hour before it was scheduled, having known about it for
14 a week, because he was not feeling so great today and did not
15 get sleep. So despite our efforts to get help for --

16 (File 2015 1 30 10 14 18(A) cut off)

17 (Beginning of File 2015 4 30 10 174 18(B))

18 DR. KOON: Dr. Irani states that he discontinued
19 the grievance not to further jeopardize my relationship with my
20 attendings. Again, I would note there was no attending pressure
21 for him to discontinue any grievance. In fact, it's the exact
22 opposite. We made him aware of it every time we turned around,
23 that the appeals process is there for him.

24 And, again, one of the things that has been brought
25 up numerous times is that this process was not punitive in

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

32

1 nature. These remediation measures were to get him back on
2 track to finish his residency. And those -- that has been
3 alluded to several different times in his -- in this
4 documentation.

5 Dr. Irani, in those notes on Pages 51 and 52, notes
6 that -- his familiarity with the grievance and due process
7 policy. And, again, there's no mention of unfair or lack of due
8 process.

9 Page 53 is Irani meeting with Dr. Walsh, and that's
10 a Dr. Walsh memo where there's an extensive review of Irani's
11 version of trauma female 375 -- her care. This was 12 days
12 after the event, and he had the opportunity to give his side of
13 the story to Dr. Walsh, the chair of the department. We again
14 emphasized that remediation is to restore to your residency
15 position, not as punitive, and that the GMEC functioned as our
16 external review.

17 DR. WALSH: Let me just add one thing about the tail
18 end of that discussion with Afraaz. You know, we've had any
19 number of times where we have discussed things with him, where
20 it's been formally, informally, one-on-one, a couple of people,
21 in the hospital, outside the hospital, and so forth.

22 This particular time that he and I spoke, after -- I
23 gave him the opportunity to go back through the entire -- his
24 version of the issues with trauma female 375 and talked to him
25 about accepting responsibility, having some insight, getting

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

33

1 used to the fact that he had to pay attention to what others
2 said, and one of the phrases that Afraaz would commonly use is
3 he would say, "I realize it doesn't really matter what I think.
4 It matters what you guys think."

5 And the time I -- the first time I heard that I
6 thought, well, okay, you know, he's beginning to understand that
7 he needs to pay attention to the perceptions of others.

8 And then, as time passed, what I realized is, what
9 he was basically saying was, it doesn't matter if I think you're
10 right or wrong, I just have to respond to what you're saying.
11 And the follow-up implication from that is, I think you're
12 wrong, but all I have to do is kind of live with that.

13 And at the very end of this meeting that we had --
14 which I thought was very collegial; there wasn't anything
15 combative about it whatsoever -- I said, "By the way, why did
16 you cancel your psychological evaluation right before it was
17 supposed to be done?" And he said, "Well, I was tired and I was
18 a little concerned, wasn't sure how it was going to be used."
19 And I said, "Well, did you call anybody?" And he said, "Well, I
20 sent an e-mail to Kathy Stevens."

21 Well, I just -- I wasn't hunting for it. I just was
22 aware that he had sent that actually after the fact. So I said,
23 "So you sent an e-mail to her when?" And he said, "Well,
24 Wednesday," or whenever it was, which was after he had cancelled
25 the meeting. So in my conversation with him he is responding in

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

34

1 such a way as basically to try and trick me, and to say, yes, I
2 sent an e-mail to Dr. Stevens explaining why I wasn't going to
3 do it, when, in fact, he had sent it afterwards.

4 So I said, "Afraaz, you just did it. We sat here
5 for an hour. We talked about things and -- about how you need
6 to accept responsibility and so forth, and you just tried to
7 trick me by telling me you had contacted Kathy Stevens prior to
8 cancelling this appointment as opposed to saying, well, I didn't
9 contact anybody, but I notified Dr. Stevens later."

10 So, again, it's an evasive way of responding to
11 someone immediately in the context of a conversation about
12 accepting responsibility and so forth. It was like he couldn't
13 let it go to try and get out of something that he had done that
14 was incorrect.

15 DR. KOON: Pages 54 and 55 are documentation that
16 Dr. Irani made a misstatement to Dr. Stevens. He told her that
17 he had scheduled an appointment with the -- for the
18 psychological evaluation when, in fact, he had not.

19 Pages 56 and 57 are e-mail -- is an e-mail thread
20 from -- to and from Dr. Irani and Dr. Stevens where Afraaz met
21 with Dr. Stevens on the 3rd of January. He makes misstatements
22 such as, "No one ever solicited my side of the story," which is
23 patently false. Dr. Walsh did it less than two weeks after the
24 fact. He said "never made aware of accusations against me,"
25 which, again, was patently false. Dr. Walsh provided those to

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

35
1 him. He said, "I was never involved," again, which is patently
2 false. He was involved from the very beginning.

3 He also says that the same individual both times
4 wrote complaints against him. Well, it was not the same
5 individual both times. It was three different nurses -- or two
6 different nurses and Diane Savage.

7 He then attaches his version of the encounter and
8 forwards that to Dr. Stevens. Again, there's no mention of lack
9 of or unfair grievance process.

10 Page 58 is an e-mail notification to Dr. -- to
11 Afraaz with regards to the decision to uphold the
12 recommendations. And, again, she states at the bottom of that,
13 "This is to aid you in completing your training." So again this
14 is not a punitive thing; this is our attempt to get him back on
15 track.

16 Pages 59 through 68 are his psychological
17 evaluations which were later included in his remediation
18 measures.

19 On the 24th of January, Dr. Irani e-mails
20 Dr. Walsh about the meeting that they had on the 24th, and
21 there were some -- there's some disagreements about what exactly
22 that meeting involved. And Dr. Irani takes Dr. Walsh out of
23 context about the -- the recommendations that we sent to the
24 GMEC are modifiable, and he notes that and that he is
25 appreciative -- he looks forward to incorporating the feedback

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

36

1 of the department and becoming a better resident.

2 Page 70 is an e-mail from myself that we were going
3 to meet with him on the 31st to go to the next step.

4 Pages 71 through 76 are a reinstatement of Level 2,
5 so he's on -- he's been suspended over the holidays. He's back
6 with us. And we met with him to review the new remediation
7 plan. So he's going from a Level 3 to a Level 2. I reviewed
8 his academic remediations there at the beginning. He handwrites
9 in there on Page 71 that he attempted to appeal to the grievance
10 council. He attempted to appeal after the time that was
11 allotted for that, so he basically wasn't following the policy,
12 so they did not grant him a grievance committee hearing at that
13 time.

14 Again, these were faculty recommendations, not just
15 one or two people. They were all approved by the GMEC executive
16 committee. And the remediation plan was a very detailed plan
17 that was a combination of faculty and resident input. And if
18 you read that remediation plan, they're basic things that our
19 interns and residents should know to do and should do them.

20 There wasn't -- there was no attempt to make these
21 remediation measures so hard that he would never be able to
22 complete them. These were very reasonable things like making
23 the lists, reading and preparing appropriately for clinic cases,
24 making the morning list ready. I mean, these are very, very
25 black-and-white things that he should do.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

37

1 We placed him on Dr. Voss' service because he was on
2 Dr. Voss' service to begin with. He was on Dr. Voss' service to
3 begin with, so we placed him back on the -- Dr. Voss' service.
4 We had had problems getting our VA attending to complete timely
5 evaluations, and we've had difficulty with him completing his
6 requirements as set forth by the ACGME, so we thought it best to
7 keep Afraaz on-site and under Dr. Voss' tutelage.

8 He signed Page 76 which called for immediate and
9 sustained improvement.

10 On the 6th of February, Dr. Irani came back to work
11 as a PGY 2. It was a very light week because most of us were
12 gone to the academy.

13 On the 24th of February, Dr. Irani was involved in
14 the care of a spine patient. And briefly, the patient was
15 post-op day two or three from a very large decompression and
16 fusion. That morning Dr. Irani did not document any type of
17 neurologic testing or strength testing. Dr. Grabowski went and
18 did it.

19 Later that morning Dr. Irani got notified that the
20 patient had a foot drop, by the nurse. And the physical
21 therapist had noticed that. So instead of being concerned, Dr.
22 Irani asked the nurse to verify that foot drop in an immediately
23 post-op patient. So -- right.

24 Dr. Irani then went up to see the patient,
25 basically, appeared to lack concern for the gravity of the

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

38

1 situation. Still did not document his assessment. Called Dr.
2 Grabowski, who went and evaluated the patient that way, ordered
3 the MRI, and the patient was in the operating room that night to
4 -- for a mass that was causing paralysis.

5 That Monday, Dr. Irani was with me in the staff
6 clinic. He did a history and physical on a patient that had --
7 that was to have a total joint. He not only -- it was a very
8 inadequate H&P. He didn't note that the patient had hepatitis
9 C, which is very important from a surgical standpoint. He
10 didn't note that the patient had an MRSA-positive history. He
11 didn't note that the patient had chronic thrombocytopenia. He
12 didn't note that the patient had psychiatric disorders. He
13 noted no abnormal labs and no EKG.

14 Dr. Grabowski let me know about this in an e-mail,
15 which is on Page 80. Dr. Grabowski and Voss met with Dr. Irani
16 that Tuesday. And the very next day Dr. Irani was on call. He
17 was asked to admit a patient with hemophilia who had a large
18 swollen and tender calf. There was a concern that the patient
19 had compartment syndrome.

20 Dr. Irani provided compartment measurements about
21 midnight. Dr. Wood said -- told -- the chief resident said, "I
22 want you to check the patient at four o'clock. If there's any
23 difference I want you to call me, and then this patient may need
24 surgery for a limb-threatening condition."

25 That -- the next day, Dr. Irani overslept, had to

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

39

1 actually be called by our chief resident to come to rounds.

2 When asked what the evaluation was like at four o'clock,

3 Dr. Irani looked at Dr. Walsh and said, "I forgot. I'm sorry."

4

5 DR. WALSH: Dr. Wood.

6 DR. KOON: Dr. Wood. He said, "I forgot. I'm

7 sorry." He didn't do exactly what the chief resident told him

8 to do, and had no excuse. He didn't say, "I checked the patient

9 at 2:30." He didn't say that, "I checked the patient at 4:30."

10 He said, "I forgot. I didn't do it." There's no documentation

11 in the record that he ever checked the patient.

12 With these last two events, the department had no
13 recourse but to recommend dismissal from the program.

14 Dr. Irani was informed of this. And there are e-mail notes
15 starting in 83, 84, and 86, documenting -- that mention

16 Dr. Grabowski's e-mail, solidifying the fact that not only
17 after he forgot to document all that, Dr. Grabowski told him,
18 "Well, the drain got pulled out early. You really need to
19 monitor the dressings." And Dr. Irani couldn't even do that,
20 and had no excuse for that.

21 We notified Dr. Irani of these findings. We
22 forwarded the departmental recommendations to the GMEC executive
23 committee, who forwarded it. And these got approved on the 10th
24 of April.

25 In the midst of his suspension without pay, there

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

40
1 was a very unusual request for Dr. -- from Dr. Irani for \$800 of
2 book money, in the middle of being suspended without pay. So
3 our conclusions were that there had been repeated and documented
4 substandard resident performances by many observers. There's
5 been graduated levels of remediation measures used in
6 accordance with the GMEC policy. There were both verbal and
7 written, senior resident and attending interventions. And the
8 -- it progressed from Level 2 to Level 3 twice.

9 There are documented attempts to get all the facts
10 on each encounter. There are no allegations of a lack of unfair
11 due process appeals procedures. In fact, we followed the GMEC
12 policies to the tee. There's no allegations of Dr. Irani ever
13 being singled out in any of his calls, letters, conversations,
14 or e-mails. There's no allegations of unsatisfactory academic
15 progress by -- from us to Dr. Irani.

16 Dr. Irani has never alleged inappropriate duty hour
17 violations; the department using residents to fulfill service
18 obligations. There's no allegations of us ever treating him
19 differently from any other residents. There's no allegations of
20 inadequate resident supervision. There's no evidence that he
21 attempted to have his concerns by other committees -- and
22 there's no evidence of anyone withholding information from Dr.
23 Irani.

24 DR. WALSH: So, I guess, in conclusion, you know,
25 Dave began this talking about when we interviewed Afraaz. You

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

41
1 know, here's somebody who's a smart guy, he's likeable, he has a
2 record of success when he was in medical school. I interviewed
3 Afraaz. I can remember the day that we were making the rank
4 list that I was supportive of ranking him highly.

5 He starts here as an intern. We kind of hear some
6 rumblings from other services and people that we trust, and
7 there -- we don't necessarily trust everybody when we hear about
8 it from other services. In fact, there's one particular
9 attending that our residents used to rotate with years ago that
10 we stopped that rotation because his evaluations were actually
11 often incorrect, and it kind of was a waste of time.

12 But anyway, we're hearing the rumblings all the way
13 along, and eventually he comes around to do his full-time
14 orthopedic residency and, you know, there's this stack of paper.

15 And keep in mind that nine-tenths of that is from July of last
16 year through January. And so, you've got a very short period of
17 time where he's making repeated, major mistakes.

18 The same theme is coming up over and over again
19 about lack of empathy, lack of insight, lack of attention to
20 detail, despite verbal and written counseling, informal talks,
21 formal talks. Dr. Guy took him out to dinner one night at
22 Harper's and tried to have sort of the "big brother, throw my
23 arms around your shoulders" type of talk. And nothing seems to
24 change at all.

25 So, you know, in the context of a situation where we

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

42

1 have feedback from nurses, from very experienced nurse managers
2 who have seen many of our residents go by over the years,
3 attendings from other services, orthopedic attendings, our
4 residents, residents from other services, nursing staff that are
5 in different parts of the hospital who -- one of whom knows
6 Afraaz sort of on a slightly more social level, at least in
7 context of professional interaction, but then also was party to
8 one of these things that happened down in the emergency room,
9 you know, we've got that backdrop.

10 Then we've got a situation where now we're talking
11 about big patient care issues, the gentleman with the complex
12 forearm injury, the female patient who had the ankle and the --
13 I forget what --

14 DR. KOON: Multiple --

15 DR. WALSH: -- multiple fractures. You've got Dr.
16 Grabowski's patient who has a -- who basically has an acutely
17 developing paralysis. It's happening right in front of
18 everybody. And the initial response that the nurse told us when
19 she called and said, "The patient has a foot drop" is that he
20 said, "Aww, she has a foot drop?" in a setting where somebody --
21 I mean, this lady could've been paralyzed for the rest of her
22 life.

23 That happens on a Friday. He's counseled on Tuesday
24 morning, going over the details with Dr. Grabowski, who is the
25 attending, and Dr. Voss. And the following day there's a

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

43

1 patient who has a limb-threatening condition and he doesn't show
2 up, doesn't take care of the patient; that morning says, "Aww,
3 shucks, I forgot."

4 When I talked to him about it the following morning,
5 he says, "Well, actually, I did go by at 2:30, but I didn't
6 document it." I have no way of proving whether that's right or
7 wrong, but, once again, it smacks of evasive, defensive
8 behavior. And I really can't tell if it's -- if it's the truth
9 or not.

10 And at this point, there's just been a tremendous
11 erosion of trust of all of the faculty in his ability to provide
12 any type of reasonable care in that he's provided substandard
13 or, frankly, horrible care for a patient of mine, Dr. Koon's,
14 Dr. Voss', Dr. Grabowski's that are something considerably worse
15 than a resident who was told to check the potassium and forgot
16 and then made something up -- I mean, way, way worse situation.

17
18 Here's somebody who's only eight months into his
19 residency. This isn't something where we feel like there's a
20 salvageable problem. We've done every single thing we could
21 because we wanted to make the most and restore him to the
22 residency.

23 And, I mean, there's been other residents along the
24 way who have had to, you know, kind of have the talk or -- with
25 one attending, or perhaps in front of everybody. They've made

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

44

1 measures to correct things, and graduated as very highly
2 successful residents. And here we just feel like we're getting
3 absolutely nowhere. So that's what led us to the point of
4 reluctantly but without apology terminating him.

5 MS. HILL: That concludes. Committee members, did
6 you have questions now for Dr. Walsh or Dr. Koon?

7 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Has he ever received a failing
8 grade? I mean, (unintelligible) end of each rotation there's a
9 different (unintelligible) pass or fail. (unintelligible)?

10 DR. KOON: Our evaluations are 1 through 5 --

11 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Okay.

12 DR. KOON: -- and he really wasn't on our teams long
13 enough without being on probation for us to ever really do that.
14 So, no.

15 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Is there an evaluation from
16 Dr. Voss' recent three months with Dr. Irani?

17 DR. KOON: Yes, ma'am.

18 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Oh, is it in here? I'm sorry.
19 I saw the letter that he wrote. I didn't know if there was an
20 actual evaluation from the three months that he did with him.

21 DR. KOON: If you look -- okay. So you're asking
22 when he came back on the 6th --

23 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yes.

24 DR. KOON: -- was there an evaluation before he went
25 back on Level 3?

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

45

1 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Right.

2 DR. KOON: No, because Dr. Voss was gone the first
3 week. And so he was basically only on service for those two
4 weeks.

5 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Okay.

6 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: It's a little hard to process all
7 this at once, but could you --

8 DR. KOON: A little hard to get it in an hour, too,
9 huh?

10 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah.

11 DR. KOON: I'm sorry.

12 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Can you just give us an assessment
13 of whether that psychological evaluation made a difference and what
14 conclusions you drew from that, if any? How did that contribute
15 to the process?

16 DR. KOON: There was --

17 DR. WALSH: I didn't think that it showed anything
18 that was new that we haven't presented to you right now. I
19 didn't see anything that there -- that I would consider a
20 mitigating factor or something that would explain things at all.
21 It just was basically more of the same.

22 DR. KOON: It did note that he was somewhat hesitant
23 on his answers and that the final conclusion should be taken in
24 that context, that he was a little bit defensive, which is kind
25 of a normal thing. But he did say on Page 67 that they

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

46

1 recommended individual counseling. And this is worked into the
2 remediation measures that we formulated after that.

3 And what we would have him do is go to E-Care,
4 because you get four as an employee free. And so that was what
5 we took from that. We didn't -- there was no DSM-R IV or V,
6 whatever it's up to now -- there are no diagnoses that had to be
7 acted upon.

8 MS. HILL: Do you need additional time to review
9 or ask questions? All right.

10 Dr. Irani, do you have questions for Dr. Koon or Dr.
11 Walsh at this time?

12 DR. IRANI: No, not right now. No, ma'am.

13 MS. HILL: Okay. If you're ready to proceed --

14 DR. IRANI: Sure.

15 MS. HILL: -- you have up to an hour to present.

16 DR. IRANI: I think we have some packets to
17 distribute. I'll go -- can I get started, Lynn? Is that fine?

18 LYNN: Yes.

19 DR. IRANI: Okay. All right. Good afternoon.
20 First, I want to thank everyone for being here on my behalf.
21 Drs. Koon and Dr. Walsh, I've had the privilege of working with
22 both of you personally. I know how busy both of your schedules
23 are, so I do appreciate you being here. I know the rest of you
24 are all very busy, as well. I know several of you had to make
25 sacrifices to be here on my behalf, and I do appreciate that.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

47

1 I would like to start off by saying that I am
2 encouraged by the panel here today, that I am encouraged my
3 grievance will be heard by a neutral third party.

4 I sit before you extremely concerned by the
5 unethical behavior and the harassment I've been subject to at
6 the hands of my program director and the chairman of my
7 department.

8 I'd like to take a step back and start at the
9 beginning. I arrived from the West Coast at Palmetto
10 Health-Richland in 2010, excited to start my orthopedic surgery
11 residency. What attracted me to this program was it was a small
12 program and the plethora of opportunities to operate one-on-one
13 with an attending physician. I felt this was an opportunity at
14 hands-on training that you do not get in many other places.

15 However, my excitement was quickly suppressed. Six
16 weeks into my residency, Dr. Koon called me into his office and
17 told me that he was placing me on Level 2 remediation. He said
18 he was placing me on Level 2 remediation. And in that same
19 meeting he went on to boast about firing Dr. Chad Lamoreaux, a
20 previous resident a few years ago, a few months before he was
21 about to graduate as a PGY 5 resident. I was confused why he
22 brought up this incident only six weeks into my residency.

23 Dr. Koon then handed me a letter with several
24 deficiencies. And rather than going over them, he asked me to
25 respond to them. Many of these were completely new to me and I

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

48

1 was admittedly confused. I went through them. I tried to
2 reconcile what my interpretation of these events were with what
3 was written. I asked Dr. Koon to elaborate on many of these, as
4 I admittedly did not understand the majority of these
5 complaints.

6 These were troubling allegations to me. I asked Dr.
7 Koon for help. His response, "This just shows you lack
8 insight," period. I was puzzled. How could I improve if I
9 could not understand my own deficiencies? I was left to
10 conclude that the true motive at this early stage was to set the
11 groundwork for termination.

12 Attempts at further clarification were simply met
13 with the response, "Look, we get the best residents. The
14 surgery program would be happy to trade three of theirs for one
15 of mine. The medicine program here is happy to get somebody
16 that speaks English. We get the best residents."

17 It was clear I could not get any more clarification
18 at this meeting, but I took these allegations seriously. I did
19 everything I could to understand how I could improve. I wanted
20 to do whatever I could to correct these alleged deficiencies.
21 Having no guidance from my program director, I reached out to my
22 fellow residents.

23 One statement in the remediation letter said I
24 created more work for my resident peers. I spoke to each of
25 them individually and privately. They all individually and

1 privately denied this, and went so far as to say that I went
2 above and beyond what was required of me.

3 In fact, there was no secret we often violated duty
4 hours, myself regularly going over the 80 hours a week mandate.
5 From talking to my program director, my fellow residents, the
6 response was always, "Make it work." Indeed, the program is
7 currently under investigation by the ACGME for, amongst other
8 things, work hour violations and lack of resident supervision.

9 The letter also alleged I did not appropriately
10 treat pain in a trauma patient. I pointed out that on this
11 particular patient I was not the primary team, nor did I do a
12 reduction. This was all done by my attending. So I did not
13 cause the patient the excruciating pain alleged.

14 In fact, I saw the patient a couple of days later on
15 the floor. He shook my hand. I asked him if he remembered me,
16 and he volunteered that he remembered me from the emergency
17 department. He thanked me personally and said how happy he was
18 with my care. I think the ultimate judge of compassion and care
19 should come from the patient. This patient remembered me and
20 was pleased with the care, albeit he was very disappointed with
21 his injury.

22 I did, however, take away that I should work on
23 improving how I present myself in front of my peers. However, I
24 think these events as presented to the GMEC were grossly
25 overstated at best, and at worst frankly false.

1 Lastly, Dr. Koon at this meeting gave me his
2 personal word that these events would be kept private between
3 Drs. Koon, Dr. Walsh, and myself. Needless to say, this was not
4 true. I was very disappointed when my chief resident began
5 asking me if my decisions were okay given that I was on
6 probation. The faculty and my fellow residents somehow all came
7 to know about my inadequacies without me saying a single word.
8 Clearly, Dr. Koon's personal promise was empty. It seems the
9 goal here was to publicly humiliate me rather than support me.

10 Despite these allegations not being explained or
11 substantiated, that did not stop them from presenting these
12 statements to the GMEC, for them to base their decision on
13 voting if I was to be placed on Level 2 remediation. This
14 experience was disenchanting, confusing, and disappointing. It
15 was especially disappointing to be placed on probation six weeks
16 into my residency. What made it more frustrating was I could
17 not get any guidance, feedback, or direction from my program
18 director.

19 It became clear that I had to become extremely
20 defensive if I had a shot at surviving. Despite all this, I
21 reevaluated where I was in my training and my ultimate goal of
22 becoming an orthopedic surgeon. I recognize I am not perfect,
23 and, like all residents, I have had my share of mistakes. But I
24 felt that I was not given much guidance. And I went out of my
25 way to figure out how I could improve. I racked my brain to

1 figure out why I was being treated like this.

2 In retrospect, there was a troubling pattern of
3 behavior from my residency director that I tried to laugh
4 off that would become more and more of a problem. Dr. Koon
5 continued to escalate in trying to derogatory -- making
6 comments, saying I was a terrorist, going so far as to label me
7 Achmed the Terrorist.

8 While I found his comments terribly insulting,
9 terribly unprofessional, and terribly insensitive, I quickly
10 realized as I had been instructed by my senior residents
11 regarding conflict with an attending, that responding (sic) --
12 that responding only makes things worse; in this program, grin
13 and bear it.

14 I decided to try and extract as many learning points
15 as possible from this experience. I decided I needed to improve
16 on my communication. I decided to accept the probation and move
17 on. I was excited to come to work every day, and realized the
18 best thing I could do towards reaching my goal of becoming an
19 orthopedic surgeon was continuing to work hard and improve in
20 the eyes of my attending.

21 On October 26th Dr. Koon told me there was some
22 issues with my performance. I asked him what the issue was.
23 He simply said, "Speak with Drs. Wood and Dr. Mazoue." I spoke
24 with them individually, and they said they had no complaints.
25 Indeed, this was in line with my usual feedback from Dr. Koon,

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

52

1 consisting of vague, negative comments, lacking direct
2 directions for improvement, and ultimately unsubstantiated.
3 These feedback sessions were becoming frustrating and taking a
4 toll, as I began to wonder what I was doing wrong and right, at
5 the same time afraid of being punished for doing anything right
6 or wrong, and often frozen in indecision.

7 In early November there was a VA patient that was
8 transferred to Richland. The patient was lacking a dictation.
9 This got routed to Dr. Koon. Dr. Koon routed it to me. A few
10 days later, he asked if the dictation was done. I informed him
11 that it had not shown up yet, but as soon as it shows up in my
12 inbox I would take care of it.

13 That evening a dictation showed up in my inbox for a
14 VA patient for an H&P. I took care of it. Dr. Koon texted me a
15 few days later asking about this. I told him I took care of it.

16 After a few rather confusing text messages, we got on the phone
17 to figure out there was actually a second VA patient. I took
18 down the name and investigated the patient.

19 On examination, I actually -- I'd actually never
20 been involved in this patient's care. I dictated the discharge
21 summary, as asked.

22 Worried that this miscommunication might create more
23 issues and knowing that Dr. Koon had repeatedly emphasized my
24 need to over-communicate, coupled with prior allegations that I
25 was creating more work for others, I sent him an e-mail telling

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

53
1 him everything I knew about the patient -- who was involved, the
2 time of the patient's admission, and that I had completed the
3 task as assigned so there was no miscommunication this time.

4 I believe I was doing my best to improve and correct
5 the deficiencies my attendings had perceived. However, this
6 attempt at trying to follow my remediation plan and ensure
7 proper communication was not taken well by Dr. Koon. Dr. Koon
8 responded to my attempts at improving communication, as can be
9 seen in Exhibit F of your binder, by writing, "Absolutely
10 incredible. I can assure you I would never in a million years
11 send a response like this to my program director, especially
12 when I am in the midst of active remediation." He expressed
13 surprise and indignation, and called my e-mail "drivel."

14 Dr. Koon became so enraged he was "unable to speak
15 to his wife." He further boasted to me that the e-mail he sent
16 me was actually "significantly toned down" and the original had
17 much stronger language. He then openly threatened, "You were
18 lucky you were on vacation because I would have fired you on the
19 spot." Indeed, he finally admitted his true intentions to me.

20 In the weeks that followed, there was a much more
21 sinister turn of events. At our meeting on November 21st, he
22 now recommended that I be placed on Level 1 active remediation,
23 when my probation was up on the first week of December. I asked
24 for clarification. He could not cite any deficiencies regarding
25 the remediation plan. I was encouraged to hear that I corrected

1 the deficiencies outlined in my remediation.

2 He therefore began to cite events that had happened
3 before I was placed on remediation, from back in June and July,
4 issues that had long been resolved. Interestingly, if these
5 were true issues, I was curious why they were now being brought
6 up now, and not in my initial feedback, back in August. It
7 seems things had turned into a fishing expedition rather than
8 truly identifying faults and ways for me to improve as a
9 resident.

10 His about-face showed re-doubled efforts to vilify
11 rather than educate me. Indeed, the most surprising factor was
12 a mere one and a half weeks later after that meeting, he somehow
13 changed his recommendation from Level 1 to Level 3 remediation,
14 with suspension of clinical duties.

15 Dr. Koon invited me to attend the faculty meeting
16 when I was scheduled to be done with my remediation. At this
17 meeting, I was shocked by the confrontational tone of this
18 meeting. Dr. Koon questioned me in front of the entire faculty,
19 challenging me, "Do you think it was a wise move to take
20 vacation during your remediation?"

21 I had carefully scheduled my only two vacation days
22 to coincide with the vacation days of my attending, so as not to
23 create more work for the rest of my team. Since I had started
24 my PGY 2 year, I only took two days off to see my family. I
25 have no family in South Carolina. And I went to visit my family

1 and my newborn niece.

2 Dr. Koon insinuated that I did not take the
3 probation seriously. I found this insinuation terribly
4 insulting. In fact, I missed my very own brother's wedding so I
5 could be on call over Labor Day. I knew that if I requested
6 those days off it would cause further work for my fellow
7 residents, and I was striving to improve on the allegations that
8 I was perhaps creating more work for other residents. That was
9 how seriously I took my probation. I missed my brother's
10 wedding rather than risk upsetting Dr. Koon by taking Labor Day
11 off.

12 The insinuation that I did not take my remediation
13 plan seriously and frivolously took vacation days off was
14 hurtful, uncouth, and uncaring.

15 I had personally spoken with Dr. Stevens and Dr.
16 Koon about my two vacation days. He had personally signed off
17 on it. I had done my best to clear it with everyone. Again, I
18 was in a situation where I am so afraid of being punished for
19 doing anything, right or wrong, that I often don't know what to
20 do.

21 Dr. Koon went on to reference a patient that had
22 been in clinic and seen by me. My attending, Dr. Grabowski had
23 asked for an MRI to evaluate the patient for possible infection.
24 He was status post several months an ex-fix removal of his right
25 upper extremity.

1 I was told by ancillary staff that one could not be
2 scheduled that day, and the next available spot was the next
3 day. I preliminarily asked them to schedule the MRI for that
4 day, and went back to the room and talked to my chief resident.

5
6 My chief resident instructed me to call radiology
7 personally, which I did. I got the MRI scheduled that day. At
8 that point, I returned to the patient's room and I sent him
9 across the street to get his MRI taken. To my understanding the
10 care plan was carried out exactly as my attending Dr. Grabowski
11 had requested.

12 Dr. Koon was not present during the care of that
13 patient, and relied on secondhand information about this
14 patient. I had no complaints about the patient's care, and
15 indeed it was carried out exactly as my attending wanted.

16 Rather than asking me for details about the
17 incident, Dr. Koon invited me to the faculty meeting and incited
18 me in front of the entire faculty. He declared that I came up
19 with the plan in direct conflict with that of my attending. He
20 stated I planned to get an MRI in two to three days, and stated
21 that was a decision I made as a PGY 2 when my attending had told
22 me differently. He went on to provoke me by saying, "I am
23 wondering why you thought it was in your purview to contradict
24 your attending's recommendation."

25 I was taken aback by the statement, frankly

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

57

1 confused, obviously flustered, when to the best of my
2 understanding my care plan had not deviated from that of my
3 attending.

4 Moreover, Dr. Koon was not present. He relied on
5 secondhand information, and never asked for my side of the
6 story, and authoritatively declared that I had contradicted my
7 attending's recommendation. Moreover, this was the first I was
8 hearing about it. If there was a problem, I should've been
9 asked beforehand.

10 The allegation here was that if there wasn't an MRI
11 scheduled until the next day, I should not even have bothered to
12 schedule that. Again, the line between what is right or wrong
13 seemed to be a moving target, and I became more confused and
14 increasingly worried about the discipline for minor infractions.

15 The patient had received the appropriate care that my attending
16 had outlined.

17 If the goal is to educate and support residents, I
18 believe I should've been afforded the common courtesy to explain
19 what happened, since Dr. Koon was relying on secondhand
20 information and did not have firsthand knowledge of the events.
21 Instead, he asked me to respond to an inflammatory, incorrect
22 accusation in an obviously confrontational manner.

23 It was clear I had no ground to stand on, as Dr.
24 Koon had verbalized. His goal was to fire me, and fair hearing
25 and proper representation of the facts would not get in his way.

1 Indeed, as one of my co-residents wrote in an unsolicited,
2 confidential e-mail, "I feel this is more of a witch-hunt than
3 anything."

4 It was clear that my superiors were not interested
5 in my education. They were, rather, working towards Dr. Koon's
6 openly declared goal of firing me.

7 Dr. Koon made two more points in front of the rest
8 of the faculty, attempting to degrade me. He alleged improper
9 dosing of narcotics. This was a non-narcotic naïve patient who
10 was post-op day zero, status post shoulder surgery. She had no
11 weakness, paresthesias, or mental status changes. I okayed 5
12 milligrams of oxycodone, more than Dr. Mazoue gives his
13 narcotic-naïve post-op shoulder patients. Dr. Koon repeatedly
14 cited this as substandard care, again, bringing it up in front
15 of myself and the faculty in February.

16 I asked what I should've done differently. Dr. Koon
17 asked Dr. Hoover, our chief resident, what he would've done.
18 Dr. Hoover replied that he would ask the patient if he had any
19 weakness, paresthesias, or mental status changes, and if the
20 patient didn't, he would have okayed more narcotics. I was
21 stunned. The same treatment plan said by my colleague became
22 inappropriate management when spoken by me. Again, I felt
23 constantly intimidated by my attending, calling me a terrorist
24 and threatened with discipline for minor infractions but for
25 which he gave a pass to other residents who had done the same

1 thing.

2 Again, I found myself in a situation in which I'm
3 being afraid of being punished for doing anything right or wrong,
4 and I'm unclear what to do.

5 Dr. Koon additionally asked why I failed to evaluate
6 a post-op total knee patient. This was a patient who had called
7 the previous Saturday. She told me a scab had fallen off her
8 knee and there was some drainage. I told her with these exact
9 words, "Ma'am, I cannot tell you anything about your wound
10 without taking a look at it." And I encouraged her to come to
11 the ED.

12 She called twice again the next day with a different
13 resident. That resident told her the same thing. I conferred
14 with that resident. We both told her to come in. She was told
15 once by me, twice by the resident the next day. She did not
16 show up at the emergency department.

17 Despite two residents who both told her to come in,
18 the patient did not follow these instructions. Dr. Koon
19 lambasted me in front of the other residents and faculty simply
20 saying a patient called three times and I had told her not to
21 come in, which is frankly untrue.

22 At the conclusion of this, I insisted that there be
23 a way to document our phone calls, since no such system was in
24 place and since it was clear Dr. Koon placed no value on the
25 veracity of any statements, and it was increasingly clear I

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

60

1 needed additional safeguards to protect myself.

2 Lastly, Dr. Koon, in front of the orthopedic
3 department staff, made the allegation that my poor behavior was
4 a pattern. He stated he heard similar complaints about
5 unprofessionalism and poor patient skills about me from the
6 trauma case managers. I was puzzled because I had received
7 positive feedback from them. However, I wanted to understand
8 how I could become a better resident.

9 I approached them again. I spoke to them
10 individually and privately and asked what they thought. They
11 frankly denied such claims. They said they were pleased with my
12 performance, and emphatically stated they enjoyed working with
13 me. Again, I was confused, in a situation in which I was so
14 afraid of being punished for doing anything, right or wrong.

15 Indeed, it was clear that Dr. Koon was more intent
16 on slandering my name in front of my peers and my attendings,
17 irreparably harming my name and my reputation. The faculty
18 meeting concluded.

19 Later that week a multi-trauma came in at 11:00 a.m.
20 She was seen and evaluated by our orthopedic intern. The
21 intern called the chief resident, Dr. Wood, saying that it was a
22 particularly sticky situation and she needed help.

23 Dr. Wood directed her to call me, a second-year
24 resident on probation, to supervise the orthopedic intern in a
25 sticky situation in the emergency department. I received a page

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

61

1 at about 2:00, 2:30 p.m. I immediately informed my attending,
2 then went to the ED to help out.

3 I arrived to a situation of frank disarray. The
4 patient was now three and a half hours her initial -- after her
5 initial trauma. She had been moved out of the trauma bay and
6 still had open, displaced, and non-treated fractures. The
7 patient and nursing staff were understandably upset.

8 Before I had even seen the patient, the nurse
9 clearly and, again, understandably upset, said, "We need to talk
10 about how all this was handled." I asked her what happened,
11 what I could do, and what needed to be addressed. She simply
12 said, "We will talk about it at the end."

13 Having gone through this experience with these
14 nurses before, I toed the line. I did my best, went out of my
15 way to please all parties involved. I introduced myself to the
16 patient. I described all injuries to the patient. I assessed
17 her pain. I talked to neurosurgery who told me they could not
18 do conscious sedation. I then went and gave local and systemic
19 anesthesia before performing any reductions.

20 I talked to the family personally. I brought the
21 family back personally to the emergency department, where I
22 showed them all the injury films on the PACS station. And then
23 I helped the nursing and ancillary staff, including cleaning up
24 and helping them change all the wet sheets on the bed.

25 That Friday I received a phone call from my

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

62

1 chairman, Dr. Walsh, who said there was an incident involving a
2 trauma female that I took care of and I am being suspended so
3 that an investigation can be performed. Dr. Walsh assured me
4 the purpose of the suspension was to get all sides of the story
5 "including yours." This turned out to be false. I was shocked,
6 saddened, stunned at the events that transpired next. No one
7 talked to me. No one attempted to contact me. No one was even
8 interested in hearing my recollection of the events.

9 To add insult to injury, I received a phone from our
10 program director, Michelle Wehunt, saying that there was a
11 letter for me. The letter was a copy of the GMEC recommendation
12 for Level 3 remediation. It had already been submitted and
13 already been approved by GMEC. I was floored.

14 No one contacted me about what happened with trauma
15 female, as I had personally been promised by my chairman. And
16 my program director who performed the investigation didn't even
17 have the decency to call me and inform me of his decision or
18 thought process, but rather had his secretary give me a call to
19 pick up a memo that he had already turned over to the GMEC.

20 This was the ultimate slap in the face and lacked
21 common human decency and courtesy. It was now abundantly clear
22 that Dr. Koon and those entrusted with my education had made no
23 attempt to and were not interested in ascertaining the veracity
24 of statements that were presented to the GMEC. Most glaring
25 were the frank falsehoods presented to GMEC, statements that

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

63

1 constituted frank libel, notably neglect of informed consent.

2 This allegation is false on many different levels.

3 First, no resident, no resident -- none of our
4 residents in our program get consents for emergent procedures.
5 Furthermore, this discussion with nursing staff was broached to
6 the orthopedic intern before my arrival, three and a half hours
7 after -- three and a half hours after the initial trauma. Simple
8 fact-checking, following standard procedure, or having the
9 professional courtesy to call and talk would have avoided such
10 deceitful and libelous comments presented to the GMEC.

11 Similarly (sic), other statements about improper
12 pain management are untrue as I gave both local and systemic
13 anesthesia prior to manipulation. I assessed the patient's
14 level. I went to the additional step of talking to Dr. Toussant
15 from neurosurgery, who told me conscious sedation was not an
16 option.

17 Moreover, as presented above, allegations of
18 inappropriate narcotic dosage and failure to evaluate a post-op
19 knee were gross overstatements of the truth, and actions that
20 were either substantiated or performed in the same manner by my
21 colleagues. Similarly, as described above the statements that
22 I failed to abide by direct attending instruction is a perversion
23 of the facts.

24 What was surprising was that my superiors had
25 violated Palmetto Health's own written and stated guidelines.

1 In the resident handbook, Page 61, which can be seen at Exhibit
2 R, it cites disruptive behavior as inappropriate conduct that
3 reflects in a negative way on a hospital or university. It then
4 clearly states under "procedure," also under Exhibit R, the
5 program director or designee interviews the complainant and any
6 witnesses within one business day of receiving the complaint. A
7 resident is given the opportunity to respond in writing (audio
8 cuts off; end of File CD 2)

9 DR. IRANI: Most stunning, and what I find very
10 unusual, were all three of Palmetto Health's own guidelines were
11 violated. I was never interviewed. All witnesses were not
12 interviewed, despite my providing names. I was never given the
13 chance to respond, period.

14 The fact that no one bothered to ask for my side of
15 the story was not only horribly unethical, hurtful, but lacked
16 common courtesy and respect that I would think everyone, let
17 alone physicians, should practice.

18 By this point Dr. Koon had successfully turned all
19 popular opinion against me. I was still honestly confused about
20 the situation and wanted to understand how I could improve.
21 Just as I in the past made progress on my remediation goals by
22 doing investigation myself, I attempted to do the same thing
23 here. I asked what the complaints were, who made the complaint
24 so I could speak to them, and for a copy of all records
25 associated with the patient's care so I could understand what

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

65

1 exactly was alleged and how I may improve.

2 Despite repeated verbal and written requests as can
3 be seen in Exhibit K, to understand and get a copy of the
4 complaints against me so I can improve, my request was denied.
5 I initiated a request with HR to initiate a grievance council
6 meeting regarding my suspension within ten business days of the
7 DIO's decision as outlined under grievance and due process in
8 the resident handbook, which can be seen in Exhibit Q under 1.5.

9
10 Since Martin Luther King Day was a national holiday,
11 the banks, offices, post office, and most importantly the
12 orthopedic surgery clinic closed, it was logical not to count
13 MLK as a business day.

14 I was shocked when they refused to grant me a
15 grievance council, saying that 11 business days had elapsed and
16 that MLK Day is not a holiday. I pointed out that to my
17 understanding MLK is a national holiday; furthermore, there's a
18 discrepancy -- a business day is not, to my knowledge, defined
19 in the resident handbook, a fact that Kathy Stevens herself
20 later conceded.

21 Moreover, should there be any confusion about the
22 deadline, the resident handbook makes explicit provisions to
23 extend any deadlines due to extenuating circumstances. I was
24 denied due process despite the fact that I made a good-faith
25 effort to follow the guidelines laid out in the resident

1 handbook and filed my request within ten business days as
2 outlined in the resident handbook.

3 It appeared the primary motive here was not to act
4 in the resident's best interest, but rather play "gotcha" with
5 our careers, a career I've worked my entire life for, and
6 something I would hope would garner more respect and
7 understanding from those charged with graduate medical
8 education.

9 To add insult to injury, I received an e-mail
10 shortly thereafter requesting me to come in and write a check
11 for a paycheck that was accidentally paid to me during my
12 suspension. At this time, I expressed serious reservations
13 about my treatment and the fairness I was receiving from my
14 program director, and I sought counsel elsewhere.

15 I spoke with Dr. Guy. I appreciated his feedback,
16 found I made much more progress speaking with him. I asked him
17 if he could oversee my remediation plan so I could get more
18 guidance, since I felt I was not making much progress with Dr.
19 Koon. He stated he would be willing.

20 As seen in Exhibit N, I proposed Dr. Guy oversee my
21 remediation and progress, as I had reservations about how I was
22 being treated and felt I could get much more constructive
23 feedback to help me become a better physician with Dr. Guy
24 overseeing my remediation plan. This request was summarily
25 denied by Dr. Koon.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

67

1 Despite the failure of due process, violation of
2 Palmetto Health guidelines, and the presentation of false
3 statements to GMEC, Dr. Koon successfully had me suspended from
4 early December to the end of January. This was embarrassing,
5 humiliating, demeaning, and was done in violation of
6 professional and Palmetto Health guidelines.

7 I was reinstated in the beginning of February. At
8 this time Dr. Koon handed me a letter placing me on Level 2
9 remediation. What was interesting was a now greatly expanded
10 list of deficiencies. I was taken aback by now the laundry list
11 of competencies not being met under Exhibit O. I had not been
12 on service since my previous evaluation placing me on Level 3
13 remediation, yet somehow my list of uncompetencies had somehow
14 exploded.

15 Notably, things that I had been told were never
16 issues were now listed as competencies not being met, including
17 complaints about my knowledge base. I had never been told my
18 knowledge base was lacking. In fact, Drs. Walsh, Mazoue, and
19 Guy had all explicitly told me my knowledge base was fine,
20 better than average. Excuse me. My in-training results
21 substantiated this and easily outpaced that of my PGY 2
22 colleague. This was alarming to me, and it was apparent

23 Dr. Koon's goal was to list as many competencies as deficient
24 so should I make any misstep he can more easily fire me.

25 The goal here, it seemed, was not to provide a

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

68

1 framework for remediation, but rather, again, continuing to play
2 "gotcha" with my career. Once again, here was something I had
3 been told I was doing well in, and again I was in a situation in
4 which I was being punished for doing anything, right or wrong.

5 Lastly, I noticed that Dr. Koon and Walsh had
6 changed my schedule. I was scheduled to be rotating at the VA
7 and Baptist Hospital. However, these rotations that all the
8 other residents partake in were removed and I was assigned to
9 the Richland service, again on service with the same attendings
10 I had just rotated with. My education was further compromised
11 as I did not have the opportunity to have someone else supervise
12 me or serve in a mentorship role.

13 However, I redoubled my efforts and was genuinely
14 happy to be back. In February, after I finished the two-month
15 suspension, I was willing to work to correct any legitimate
16 deficiencies, and again earnestly strived to show that I was
17 serious about the comments that I had received and my education.

18
19 I started back on Dr. Voss' service. I wished to
20 show I was indeed a team player, and took the initiative and
21 decided to adapt and create a resident step-by-step guide with
22 step-by-step directions, pictures and figures about how Dr.
23 Voss performs his total knee arthroplasty. I thought this would
24 be an invaluable tool to residents coming after me. I worked
25 hard to correct these perceived deficiencies in my performance.

1
2 On the evening of March 1st, Dr. Koon called and
3 told me that I was again suspended, and he was recommending me
4 for termination regarding my care of two patients. A
5 hemophiliac patient was admitted at approximately midnight for
6 observation for possible compartment syndrome.

7 I did an interval examination at about 2:30 for
8 compartment syndrome. The examination was unchanged. And as I
9 was seeing another patient, my exam was unchanged from before, I
10 decided to treat the current patient in an expeditious and
11 caring manner. I put in a note on the patient within 48 hours
12 of seeing the patient.

13 Dr. Koon also mentioned the issue with a spine
14 patient with neurologic changes. I saw her as soon as the nurse
15 told me that she saw neurologic changes. I examined the patient
16 as soon as she was available, and called my attending as soon as
17 my exam was done.

18 My attending, over the phone, told me my physical
19 exams and findings were inaccurate and incorrect. Accordingly,
20 I could not document my findings as I had been directed by my
21 attending that my exam was inaccurate. I had been directed
22 previously by my attendings to not document inaccurate findings
23 in the patient's chart.

24 It is also noteworthy that this was my very first
25 spine patient as a resident, and there was no senior on the

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

70

1 resident service with me.

2 When confronted about these patients, I followed the
3 remediation plan which directed me to "admit and apologize for
4 mistakes and be willing to endorse personal flaws." Therefore,
5 when confronted about these patients, I immediately apologized.
6 I said that I would do better next time. I did not make any
7 excuses and listened to what was said.

8 While I admit that I have made mistakes, both
9 patients were evaluated. It is also noteworthy that I had just
10 returned from a two-month hiatus and was unsupervised on
11 service. I learned from these experiences that I still need to
12 work on improving my efficiency.

13 Again, I believe these are all examples of resident
14 education. While I believe there is always room for
15 improvement, mistakes, feedback, and resident supervision are
16 all integral parts of resident development. It has been hard
17 for me to focus on learning and my education with the stress of
18 this unmerited treatment.

19 Through the entire process, I've been illegally
20 targeted. I have been vilified for activities that my
21 colleagues have not been penalized for. Standard hospital
22 policy has been ignored. And my name and reputation have been
23 subject to libel and slander by Drs. Koon and Walsh in front of
24 the GMEC committee and the hospital staff.

25 They misrepresented me to the Graduate Medical

1 Education Council. I believe that GMEC's decisions were based
2 on false information and malicious misrepresentations.

3 Lastly, and perhaps most importantly, I have had
4 more stress placed upon me when dealing with patient care by
5 having to undergo derogatory, inappropriate, and insensitive
6 racial taunting by those entrusted with my education.

7 While on remediation, Dr. Koon regularly taunted me,
8 calling me Achmed the Terrorist. While I tried to laugh it off,
9 these comments are deeply harmful and insensitive, given the
10 past history of religious persecution of those of my people and
11 the recent terrorist attacks in Mumbai, India, where my family
12 resides, and the impact these cowardly attacks have on my
13 immediate family.

14 The pattern of singling me out and open slander and
15 libel in presenting my case and racist behavior is incongruous
16 with someone entrusted in the role of an educator. Moreover, at
17 least five of these deficiencies cited here were either
18 performed or verified by my resident colleagues without
19 retribution, including treatment of trauma female 375, dosing of
20 narcotics, medical knowledge, evaluation of post-op knee, and
21 wound closure.

22 I felt constantly intimidated by Dr. Koon, either
23 calling me a terrorist or threatening me with discipline for
24 some minor infraction, but for which he gave a pass to other
25 residents who had done similar things.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

72

1 I was frankly in a situation where often I was
2 afraid of being punished for doing anything, right or wrong,
3 that it was not clear what I could do to avoid punishment.

4 I believe I'm a friendly person, but cultural
5 differences and insensitive behavior have made it hard to focus
6 on becoming a better physician.

7 I admit, I may appear differently. I might act
8 differently. I'm new to the south. I was born and raised in
9 California. I completed my undergraduate and medical school
10 education at Stanford University on the West Coast, in an
11 environment quite different from my current setting. I don't
12 think it's the responsibility of others to understand my
13 background, but I think they should at least be accepting.

14 I readily admit that I have made mistakes, like all
15 young physicians, and want to change in a way that will make me
16 a better doctor. Indeed, each time I was placed on remediation,
17 subsequent evaluations largely validated that I addressed or
18 improved upon my remediation goals set forth.

19 I want to do better, and indeed I've strived hard to
20 do so, talking to others and soliciting feedback where this was
21 missing from my program director. But in order to improve, I
22 need a clear definition of mistakes and how I may improve.

23 I'm shocked by the callous nature and actions of my
24 department. Decisions like this have derailed my entire career,
25 and should at least be subject to due process. My name has been

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

73

1 slandered, and it's extremely difficult, if not irreparable, to
2 fix. My name is my profession as a physician, and it has been
3 unjustly tarnished. What job prospects do I now have in this
4 area?

5 In summary, I have attempted to bring my concerns
6 before the appropriate local committees, but I've been
7 disappointed by their unwillingness to listen to my grievances,
8 and believe I have been denied due process.

9 Additionally, I have been subject to racially based
10 harassment by my program director, and I've been singled out for
11 disciplinary actions for minor infractions. This pattern of
12 behavior has been evident throughout my PGY 2 year and my
13 program director who repeatedly calls me Achmed the Terrorist,
14 and makes constant insinuations about my cultural background,
15 repeatedly submitted documents to GMEC that are patently false
16 in order to attempt to demonstrate a pattern of unsatisfactory
17 behavior on my part.

18 He placed me on probation only six weeks into my PGY
19 2 residency based on several unsubstantiated allegations.
20 Requests for clarification of those allegations were denied, and
21 I have been unable to get any independent verification of these
22 allegations.

23 My program director has gone out of his way to
24 attempt to discredit me in front of other faculty members,
25 alleging improper care despite clear evidence to the contrary,

1 including from other faculty and residents. He has further
2 alleged deficiencies in my knowledge base, despite evidence to
3 the contrary. My training scores outpace that of my fellow
4 resident. Needless to say, such constant harassment makes it
5 nearly impossible for me to focus on my education and my patient
6 care.

7 My program director is continuing to present false
8 statements to GMEC. For example, in one case, he alleged
9 improper care of a trauma patient. I was not involved in that
10 patient's initial resuscitation, but was called to assist after
11 the patient had been in the ED for over three hours.

12 Many of these allegations did not involve me at all.
13 My program director refused to ask for my side of the story, in
14 complete violation of and in complete disregard for the
15 hospital's policy. He turned over factually incorrect
16 complaints to the GMEC for my suspension. I was denied fair
17 hearing and due process. Most egregious were the multiple times
18 I asked for documentation of the allegations of poor care, and
19 they and Kathy Stevens refused to turn over these documents.

20 I have, each time, protested to Kathy Stevens, but
21 to no avail. In fact, my previous request for a grievance
22 council was denied.

23 Additionally, I was denied the chance to engage in
24 regularly assigned rotations at the VA beginning in January, and
25 this prevented me from being educated on a rotation that all

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

75

1 other residents are assigned to. It also denied me the
2 opportunity to get an unbiased evaluation of my performance by
3 the orthopedic staff at the VA.

4 It is noteworthy that this program has an attrition
5 rate well above the national average, taking only two residents
6 a year, the smallest in the nation, and now potentially losing a
7 third resident in the past four to five years, a fact they seem
8 proud of, and my program director emphasized only six weeks into
9 his residency -- my residency.

10 The actions of my department recently culminated
11 with them moving for my termination. I am very disappointed and
12 concerned, since their behavior has been unethical, deceitful,
13 and illegal. I am not confident in the checks and balances of
14 the hospital when the department chairman and program director
15 can regularly violate hospital policy and when my chairman
16 assures me of the outcome of a GMEC meeting before any
17 proceedings have ever occurred.

18 Importantly, it is noteworthy that this program is
19 currently being investigated by the ACGME for work hour
20 violations and lack of resident supervision. I implore you to
21 help me in this situation. Please help me get due process and
22 investigate this pattern of targeted unfair behavior. I have
23 worked hard and sacrificed much to become an orthopedic surgeon,
24 and I feel that those entrusted with my education have reneged
25 on their commitment.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

76

1 Thank you.

2 MS. HILL: Committee members, do you have
3 questions for Dr. Irani?

4 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Dr. Irani, how would you
5 address the contention that you've been repeatedly counseled and
6 you've failed to make any change in your behavior?

7 DR. IRANI: Well, I think the one point that came up
8 with the evaluation of my intern year -- and you saw the
9 selection of them -- those were all in the first half. And Dr.
10 Jones and Dr. Bynoe, I think, were correct. I was new to the
11 area. And I met with them. They gave me very good feedback.
12 They said, "This is, you know, how you present yourself. This
13 is how you come across."

14 And their subsequent evaluations showed marked
15 improvement, and I was able to make progress. I think that
16 conversation was one of the best I've had in terms of feedback.
17 And I've never gotten that -- once I started orthopedic surgery,
18 all I got was it shows you lack insight, and I wasn't given any
19 guidance about how to do that. And so I did have some issues
20 initially, but the -- and the reviews all showed improvement
21 towards the end of my intern year.

22 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Do you have any doubt about
23 your choice of orthopedics (indiscernible) profession?

24 DR. IRANI: No.

25 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 2: I have a question.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

77

1 DR. IRANI: Sure.

2 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 2: This memorandum that was
3 dated August 15th --

4 DR. IRANI: Is that in --

5 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 2: It's in -- you both actually
6 have a copy of it.

7 DR. IRANI: Okay. Okay.

8 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 2: But you said a couple of
9 times that you felt like you weren't given any specific mentions
10 of where your deficiencies were or what you could do to improve
11 them, but this outlines pretty well, in my opinion, you know,
12 what they felt were your deficiencies and the measures that you
13 should go to try and improve those things. Did you not feel
14 like that that was adequate, or how would --

15 DR. IRANI: So are you talking about the initial
16 letter -- August 15, '11?

17 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 2: Yeah.

18 DR. IRANI: So --

19 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 2: What would you have added to
20 that to make it more clear? What did you feel like needed to be
21 added to it?

22 DR. IRANI: Sure. So, you know, first of all, if
23 you look at stuff like, "He has repeatedly demonstrated poor
24 time management, frequent tardiness, required conference,
25 clinics," I was not aware of that. I asked for specific

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

78

1 examples. I was not provided any, but I decided I would work on
2 it.

3 Poor communication skills with patients, family,
4 peers, and attending physicians, again, this was the first time
5 I'd heard about it, so I said, "Where is this coming from? I
6 haven't had anybody tell me this before. Could you please tell
7 me what I'm doing wrong? How am I going to improve?" Again,
8 "It just shows you lack insight."

9 Effective prioritization of clinical duties, these
10 are all very broad statements. Actually, some of this, what I'm
11 hearing today, I'm hearing for the first time. I was not
12 provided any clarification. I asked them -- I went to each of
13 them and I asked. I was not provided any -- how I'm not
14 performing well in my clinical duties.

15 Additional duties for other residents, I took this
16 one most seriously, and I asked what he was -- what I was doing,
17 how was I creating -- what had I done wrong. I got no examples
18 from Dr. Koon. And that's when I spoke to each resident
19 individually and privately, and a lot of them said I go above
20 and beyond.

21 So, you know, those are the examples. You know,
22 substandard evaluation, we talked about that. I think I showed
23 improvement throughout the way.

24 And lack of attention to detail, so that was never
25 laid out, where that came from. I got no feedback. I went and

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

79

1 talked to the OR staff to try and get some feedback, and that's
2 how I was able to determine anything at that time.

3 So I think the broad statements, it's the first time
4 I'm hearing about them. They're not explained to me where they
5 came from. There are no examples given. And maybe -- you know,
6 maybe I do lack insight, but if that's the case, I think I need
7 to be shown how I can improve, and that effort was not there.

8 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: Can I clarify something?

9 DR. IRANI: Sure.

10 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: One of the patient anecdotes
11 -- and we've gotten into some pretty detailed discussions here
12 -- I think it's the hemophiliac where there was a question about
13 compartment syndrome.

14 DR. IRANI: Yeah.

15 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: You wrote that you went back
16 and wrote a note within 48 hours.

17 DR. IRANI: Right.

18 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: Do you think that was a
19 reasonable time period?

20 DR. IRANI: I think -- I evaluated the patient, but,
21 as I said, I think I -- I should've put it in right there. I
22 should've stopped with the patient and moved on to it.

23 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: Have you admitted that to
24 anybody?

25 DR. IRANI: Yeah. The very first time I met I think

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

80

1 I said, "Here's where I went wrong." In my initial meeting, I
2 think, you know, Dr. Koon said I admitted I made mistakes. And
3 this time I just said, "Yeah, I should've just written --
4 stopped what I was doing right there, but I thought I'd bounce
5 back and do it again." But that was probably not the best move.

6 But I think the -- I did evaluate the patient and I put the
7 note in afterwards.

8 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: You do understand the
9 importance of that note?

10 DR. IRANI: Right. Yeah.

11 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: So they would argue that
12 they've tried to point this sort of thing out to you and nothing
13 really changes. How would you respond to that line of -- or
14 that sort of accusation?

15 DR. IRANI: The accusation with response to the
16 hemophiliac patient?

17 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: Well, in general that notes
18 not completed on time or your H&Ps -- Dr. Walsh alluded to the
19 fact that repeatedly where he explained (unintelligible) --

20 DR. IRANI: So -- so -- yeah.

21 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE 3: -- missing.

22 DR. IRANI: So those are specific examples. And Dr.
23 Walsh himself admitted this. This was the last week of my
24 rotations was when he finally sat down and went over the H&Ps.
25 The H&Ps have specific things about -- there's a preoperative

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

81

1 slip, and for a given surgery you've got to put length of
2 surgery, you've got to put what pre-op labs, what equipment.

3 And I can do stuff -- like a carpal tunnel, I know
4 that. We've done a bunch of them. I know all the equipment; I
5 know all the time; I fill it in. But when it's something like a
6 tendon transfer, I fill out the name of the procedure. I don't
7 know how long it's -- because I've never done this before, so
8 I'll leave that blank. So there's skips.

9 And I asked the -- his secretary what to do, and she
10 just said, "Oh, Dr. Walsh fills in what you don't know at the
11 end." So what I would do is I'd fill in as much as I would
12 know. And that's why some of them would be complete -- carpal
13 tunnels, I can do that -- some of them are not complete. I
14 don't know what tray sets you do when you do a tendon transfer
15 and you do something else.

16 And, again, this conversation happened the last week
17 of my rotation with Dr. Walsh, and he actually -- I didn't know
18 -- there's one form that goes to the scheduler, one form goes to
19 Richland, one form goes here. Nobody explained that to me. And
20 he admitted himself that he had never broken it down for me.

21 But once I think he explained it, I got some insight
22 into that. But I think that would explain the perception that I
23 was jumping around, was the fact that I would just fill in what
24 I knew in some cases and others I'd leave blank. And I was told
25 he'd fill them in at the end of the day.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

82

1 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: So in issues of this magnitude
2 spanning this kind of time frame in a complicated business like
3 the one that we operate in, it's going to be impossible to get
4 complete agreement --

5 DR. IRANI: Sure.

6 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: -- on what happened. There's
7 pretty good documentation here of some issues. I would just
8 like to hear from you why you think we're here. What ultimately
9 led us to this day?

10 DR. IRANI: I -- you know, I think it snow-balled.
11 You know, I think initially there was something and -- I had to
12 make corrections at some point Dr. Koon (indiscernible). The
13 spotlight is on you and things snowball.

14 You know, when I first came here, it was a rocky
15 start, and I was new to the area. I think that the evaluation
16 that Dr. Koon laid out where I started the year rather rough,
17 and then at the end of that evaluation it will say "He showed
18 great improvement by the end of it and was a great resident."

19 I think that pattern went through initially with my
20 intern year. And unfortunately when I got to orthopedics, I
21 wasn't -- it's -- I wasn't given the feedback or direction that
22 I came to expect. It was a different environment. I think Dr.
23 Koon became frustrated because I kept asking questions. I
24 wanted more, and perhaps maybe I do lack insight, but I was
25 never given the opportunity to gain that.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

83

1 And I think at that point -- and, you know, I mean,
2 to be honest, Dr. Koon declared it was his personal vendetta
3 when I sent that e-mail. He was upset and he kept on
4 referencing that he would fire me on the spot. I think at that
5 point there was a very marked change in the tone, and it became
6 very personal, unfortunately. I think we got off on the wrong
7 foot, and oftentimes in surgery that's all it takes,
8 unfortunately.

9 I think I've made my mistakes. I'm not perfect.
10 But I think if you look at the remediation -- each of the
11 letters, if you notice, things aren't often repeated. The
12 showing up late, stuff like that, all that stuff --
13 more work for other residents -- doesn't carry over to
14 follow-up letters, which shows I was striving to do better.

15 But I think at that point it just sort of
16 snow-balled and they had made up their mind that it wasn't --
17 like Dr. Koon and Walsh, it was a personal decision that they
18 weren't happy with my care and weren't able to work with me.

19 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Did you worry about the
20 patients? I mean, like the one who called and said her knee was
21 (indiscernible). Was there any -- I mean, do you worry about
22 your patients?

23 DR. IRANI: Yeah.

24 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Do you worry about how they're
25 doing?

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

84

1 DR. IRANI: And, I mean, that -- and that spine
2 patient, like I -- I mean, I texted Grabowski after I was off of
3 the service. I said, "How is she doing?" And that patient,
4 like -- you can talk to her -- she loves me. She -- I think I
5 had great interaction with her. You know, I've come back at
6 9:00 p.m. at night to post-op check my patients -- sometimes
7 gone home and come back.

8 Yeah, I definitely worry about my patients. We all
9 do. As physicians, we can't unless we don't. So, absolutely.
10 I think that's part of being a physician. It's part of
11 working hard.

12 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I mean, I agree you wonder
13 how we get there. So a lot of what's in here (unintelligible)
14 lack of empathy or caring, that's not something I can say
15 "go buy a textbook and read it." That's something that
16 you've got to have innately within you.

17 DR. IRANI: Uh-huh.

18 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Do you feel that you have that
19 as a quality? Because it doesn't always appear that you've
20 demonstrated it.

21 DR. IRANI: I think where that came from were two
22 nursing complaints, is where it came from. In that first
23 complaint, I learned that I need to demonstrate better. I think
24 Dr. Bynoe and Dr. Jones also said this. They said they had no
25 problems with my care, but you need to work on demonstrating it.

1
2 And I think that's a little bit of my personality.
3 I think I'm a little bit laid back. But if you -- again, you
4 are welcome to poll the ER nurses, and I'll stand by whatever
5 they say; you're welcome to poll the floor nurses, and I'll
6 stand by what they say.

7 But I think -- the ancillary staff gets along with
8 me. I think -- you can pick patients I have seen. You know,
9 I'll come back and see patients when they're off service. I
10 really think that I have had positive patient interactions. A
11 lot of them remember me. This spine patient, you can call her
12 up. I haven't talked to her in months. You can call her up
13 right now and ask her what she thinks of me, and I'll stand by
14 whatever she says.

15 UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Prior to this period in your life,
16 DR. Irani, have you ever had any other issues with professionalism,
17 empathy, accountability? Have those ever come up in your
18 professional life?

19 DR. IRANI: No, sir.

20 MS. HILL: Any questions from the committee? Dr.
21 Koon and Dr. Walsh, do you have questions for Dr. Irani?

22 DR. WALSH: Afraaz, some of what I'm asking you
23 about is in response to what you were just saying a moment ago.
24 You mentioned that with the first patient with the arm injury,
25 you said you did not perform a fracture reduction. Did you

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

86

1 touch the patient's arm?

2 DR. IRANI: I touched the patient's arm as I did my

3 --

4 DR. WALSH: What did you do?

5 DR. IRANI: I did a sensory exam.

6 DR. WALSH: Did you lift the patient's arm?

7 DR. IRANI: I don't recall. I did not do a
8 reduction. I don't know if I lifted the arm or not.

9 DR. WALSH: Okay. One of the statements the nurses
10 made was that you had lifted the arm in a callous fashion, and
11 it was the same way that the former attending (unintelligible)
12 moved the patient's arm in a similar fashion.

13 You know, moving on the next (unintelligible) trauma
14 female 375. Why do you think there's such an enormous
15 disconnect between your perception of events and the nurses'
16 perception? You've shot holes in what they've had to say, but
17 why do you think that there's this, you know, 180-degree
18 diametrically opposed perception of what happened down there?

19 DR. IRANI: I'm not disagreeing the patient's care
20 was not substandard. I don't think the patient should've been
21 in the ER for three and a half hours without fractures being
22 reduced.

23 DR. WALSH: I'm talking about during your management
24 of the patient, not prior, because the three and a half hours
25 was before you got there, right?

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

87

1 DR. IRANI: Right.

2 DR. WALSH: So I'm talking about the period of your
3 management, which is what they came to us about. Why do you
4 think there's such a huge gap?

5 DR. IRANI: Could you reference some specific
6 examples of their complaints?

7 DR. WALSH: Well, their whole description of how you
8 manage the patients -- I don't want to sit them
9 side-by-side.

10 DR. IRANI: Sure.

11 DR. WALSH: Basically, you've challenged what
12 they've said about what took place.

13 DR. IRANI: Right. I mean, you can look in the
14 chart. There is documentation of local and there's
15 documentation of systemic anesthesia, and there's -- I believe
16 there's documentation from Dr. Toussant about the pain. So if
17 there's an allegation of pain management, that's in the chart.
18 That's one thing. What else is there?

19 DR. WALSH: I guess what I'm getting at is from a
20 more philosophical standpoint. Why is a picture painted there
21 that is totally opposite of what you're describing? You're
22 describing something that's totally opposite. And let me ask a
23 follow-up question. Was the trauma attending Dr. Jones called
24 to the trauma bay?

25 DR. IRANI: I wasn't there when he was there. I

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

88

1 don't know.

2 DR. WALSH: Was he called to the trauma bay?

3 DR. IRANI: I don't know.

4 DR. WALSH: You and I have talked about that,
5 Afraaz.

6 DR. IRANI: I don't know. You said he was, but I
7 don't know. I wasn't there. I never saw him down there.

8 DR. WALSH: All right. Are you aware that he was
9 called to the trauma bay?

10 DR. IRANI: You told me that. That's all I know.

11 DR. WALSH: Are you aware of any other instances
12 where the orthopedic traumatologist was called to the trauma
13 bay because of concerns by the nurses about the resident's
14 care?

15 DR. IRANI: No.

16 DR. WALSH: I'm not either. We've referenced a
17 number of patient scenarios here, two of Dr. Grabowski's
18 patients, the one who was in the staff clinic that there was
19 a discrepancy between when he asked you to get the MRI and
20 when you were actually going to get it; the second one, the
21 patient with the threatened paralysis. There was the man with
22 the arm injury that I just referenced. There was trauma female
23 375. There was my patient with the pain medicine. And there
24 was the hemophiliac with a possible compartment syndrome.

25 Is it your contention that in every single one of

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

89

1 those cases that you rendered appropriate care and that the
2 things that you're being challenged about your management by the
3 variety of people involved here today are -- they're all wrong?

4 DR. IRANI: I don't think it's a black-and-white,
5 wrong-or-right. I don't think -- the question can be asked that
6 way, I think there's always improvement in patient situations.

7 DR. WALSH: Well, let's talk about mine in
8 particular that we haven't spent much time with. This patient
9 had a shoulder reconstruction. She phoned you -- or her husband
10 phoned the night of her surgery. And can you just recount what
11 you told her regarding pain medicine?

12 DR. IRANI: I asked her if there was any weakness,
13 pain, paresthesias, and assessed her if there were any worrisome
14 signs, and I was worried about a surgical complication. And he
15 said -- she said no, so I okayed five more of oxycodone.

16 DR. WALSH: Five more pills or five more milligrams?

17
18 DR. IRANI: Five milligrams more.

19 DR. WALSH: And I talked to you about what the
20 patient explained to me. Do you recall that?

21 DR. IRANI: I do -- not completely. I mean, if you
22 want to refresh my memory. I guess.

23 DR. WALSH: Well, when she -- the nurses told me
24 that she had pain problems the night before. I called her, and
25 she said that yes, she had called the night before, that she was

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

90

1 having pain, and that she said you told her to take five
2 5-milligram pills of oxycodone every three hours.

3 And I said, "No. Probably what happened there was
4 that -- that's 25 milligrams. He probably said two 5-milligram
5 pills," giving you the benefit of the doubt. She said, "No. I
6 specifically asked, 25 milligrams, five pills?" and he said yes.

7 So is it your contention that she wasn't telling the truth?

8 DR. IRANI: No. I think you asked what happened on
9 the phone call, so the phone call happened and I okayed five
10 milligrams. There was a second phone call, right -- there was a
11 second phone call that happened about an hour and a half, two
12 hours later. The patient was now at 20 milligrams Q4, which is
13 Dr. Mazoue's standard naïve narcotic post-op shoulder pain dose.

14 So now she was at the naïve dose.

15 And she called again, and I again assessed her, just
16 as Dr. Hoover said -- any changes? Said no. And I okayed five
17 more. And he said, "Where do I go from here?" I said, "Just as
18 we were doing, you continue to dose as we were doing -- as we
19 had done. We'll spread it out over four hours."

20 Now, this was like a three o'clock in the morning
21 conversation. I can understand there was miscommunication. And
22 from this -- after this, when patients call me, I have them
23 repeat it back to me, because I want to make sure this won't
24 happen again.

25 I don't know if the miscommunication happened on my

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

91

1 part or her part, but that's also why I told Dr. Justin Walker
2 the following morning on rounds -- I said, "Look, you're on the
3 service. This patient called. Here's what happened. If you
4 can just follow-up and make sure everything went according to
5 plan. Here's what I thought I told her." And that's why the
6 call was made the following morning.

7 DR. WALSH: Another question is, have I interacted
8 with you at all regarding possibilities for your future after
9 orthopedics?

10 DR. IRANI: Sure. Yes.

11 DR. WALSH: Can you explain that to the committee?

12 DR. IRANI: You just said if I don't want to do
13 orthopedics that -- and you want to do industry that here are
14 some options, if you want to do something else.

15 DR. WALSH: Okay. Who's actually the first
16 attending that brought it up to you?

17 DR. IRANI: Dr. Guy.

18 DR. WALSH: Dr. Guy. So in terms of your statements
19 about the fact that your future has been irreparably harmed, et
20 cetera, there's actually been steps by the orthopedic faculty to
21 possibly help you in that area; is that true?

22 DR. IRANI: I think it would be a smooth exit if I
23 quit and went to something else. Yes.

24 DR. WALSH: Out of curiosity, who is the third
25 resident you're referring to that is possibly being fired or

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

92

1 investigated? Who is that?

2 DR. IRANI: What are you talking about? What do you
3 mean?

4 DR. WALSH: You said the attrition rate in the
5 program, if there was three residents --

6 DR. IRANI: Right.

7 DR. WALSH: -- there was one two years ago that was
8 terminated for lying, your situation. Who is the third person?

9 DR. IRANI: Oh, there was a person who went to
10 family medicine, right?

11 DR. WALSH: There's a person who withdrew. There
12 was never --

13 DR. IRANI: Right.

14 DR. WALSH: -- any academic issues.

15 DR. IRANI: I understand, but that's still an
16 attrition rate. When we talk about attrition rate, we talk
17 about people leaving a program, whether it be for personal
18 reasons, conflicts, or being forced out. And my point was when
19 we talk about attrition in programs, they always say how many
20 people leave a given program? And our rate is significantly
21 higher than the national average.

22 DR. WALSH: And after your suspension, prior to your
23 termination, Dr. Hydorn (ph) and Dr. Hoover saw you in the
24 hospital at approximately 11:00 p.m. or 11:30.

25 DR. IRANI: Uh-huh.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

93

1 DR. WALSH: Can you explain what you were doing
2 there?

3 DR. IRANI: I was cleaning out my locker.

4 DR. WALSH: At 11:00 p.m.?

5 DR. IRANI: Yeah. I was on the way back -- I forget
6 from where, but -- I think I was riding back from Ohio.

7 DR. WALSH: And you said the program was under
8 investigation by the ACGME regarding duty hours.

9 DR. IRANI: Uh-huh.

10 DR. WALSH: Why would you say that?

11 DR. IRANI: Just stating the facts.

12 DR. WALSH: Okay. Can you elaborate on that?

13 DR. IRANI: ACGME is investigating duty hour
14 violations with our program.

15 DR. WALSH: How are they aware of possible duty hour
16 violations in our program?

17 DR. IRANI: You can ask them that. I don't know.

18 DR. WALSH: Okay. Is it true that you sent them a
19 list of potential duty hour violations --

20 DR. IRANI: I don't -- I don't --

21 DR. WALSH: -- used our department's duty hour
22 violations?

23 DR. IRANI: I don't see the purpose of this. I
24 contacted ACGME to express my issues with the program.

25 DR. WALSH: So a moment ago you said you didn't know

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

94

1 how they'd be aware of duty hour problems, and now you're
2 not wanting to talk about it?

3 DR. IRANI: Well, I don't -- they did not disclose
4 to me what exactly they went to, if there was other stuff. I
5 don't know all that's entailed. I don't know.

6 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: (unintelligible).

7 DR. IRANI: Pardon?

8 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: (unintelligible).

9 DR. WALSH: He's the one that brought it up, and
10 that's the reason I wanted to ask.

11 DR. IRANI: I just wanted to state the facts.

12 DR. WALSH: I'm asking questions for the facts, too.

13
14 DR. IRANI: Okay.

15 DR. WALSH: And last questions. Have you accessed
16 the hospital computer system after your suspension and prior to
17 your termination?

18 DR. IRANI: Yeah. I had notes that needed to be
19 signed.

20 DR. WALSH: No other reasons?

21 DR. IRANI: I don't recall all the reasons I
22 accessed the hospital system.

23 DR. KOON: I've got a couple questions.

24 DR. IRANI: Sure.

25 DR. KOON: One is regarding that hemophiliac patient

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

95

1 that was admitted on the 1st of March.

2 DR. IRANI: Yeah.

3 DR. KOON: And that admission occurred one day after
4 you had a very long discussion with Dr. Grabowski and Dr. Voss
5 on Tuesday regarding your treatment and encounter with the spine
6 patient, who loves you; is that correct?

7 DR. IRANI: It was a morning I was on call, so that
8 evening.

9 DR. KOON: So you met with Drs. Grabowski and Voss
10 on Tuesday the 28th; is that correct?

11 DR. IRANI: To be honest, I don't recall the exact
12 date. That sounds about right, but I don't recall the exact
13 day.

14 DR. KOON: There are e-mail documentations from Dr.
15 Grabowski and Dr. Voss stating that you met with them on Tuesday
16 the 28th. Would you agree to that?

17 DR. IRANI: It could be. It's probably true. I
18 just don't remember off the top of my head, if you're asking me.

19 I'm sorry, I don't. I don't recall that day, but --

20 DR. KOON: Are you aware that Dr. Voss wrote a
21 memorandum of record regarding that meeting that you had with
22 Dr. Grabowski and (unintelligible)?

23 DR. IRANI: Probably. I don't recall specifically.
24 Is it in the packet?

25 DR. KOON: It's in 81.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

96

1 DR. IRANI: Okay.

2 DR. KOON: About halfway down Dr. Voss says,
3 "Ultimately, Dr. Irani did admit shortcomings in terms of his
4 assessment and compulsiveness about thorough patient
5 examination, but I think he failed to have any true insight into
6 the level of concern that we would expect that he would
7 demonstrate in the care of a patient who was at risk for being
8 paralyzed." Do you see that statement?

9 DR. IRANI: Uh-huh.

10 DR. KOON: Do you agree with that statement?

11 DR. IRANI: I think I understood there was a risk
12 for long-term paralysis, and that's why I called my attending.
13 If the question is did I understand the gravity of the situation,
14 I think I would say yes.

15 DR. KOON: Would you agree that Dr. Voss and Dr.
16 Grabowski did not think you demonstrated that gravity --

17 DR. IRANI: I don't know -- I don't know what their
18 thoughts were. I mean, that might be their interpretation.

19 DR. KOON: I'll read it again.

20 DR. IRANI: Okay.

21 DR. KOON: "Ultimately, Dr. Irani did admit
22 shortcomings in terms of his assessment and compulsiveness about
23 thorough patient examination, but I think that he failed to have
24 any insight -- any true insight into the level of concern that
25 we would expect that he would demonstrate in the care of a

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

97

1 patient who was at risk for becoming paralyzed." Do you see
2 that sentence?

3 DR. IRANI: Yeah.

4 DR. KOON: And it continues, "It seemed
5 Dr. Irani's description of the events were consistent, but there
6 failed to be a recognition or a demonstration of true care for
7 the patient's condition in this situation." Do you see that
8 sentence?

9 DR. IRANI: Uh-huh.

10 DR. KOON: Do you agree that that was
11 Dr. Grabowski's and Dr. Voss' concern, and that's why he put
12 that in this statement?

13 DR. IRANI: I don't know how you want me to
14 interpret Dr. Voss' letter any different than you can, sir. But
15 if that's what -- I believe that was his contention if that's
16 what he's writing.

17 DR. KOON: How about the next-to-the-last sentence,
18 "My sense and that of Dr. Grabowski was that there is a failure
19 of recognition of the amount of care required for orthopedic
20 spine patients"? Do you see that sentence?

21 DR. IRANI: I do. Yes, sir.

22 DR. KOON: Do you now recognize that Dr. Grabowski
23 and Dr. Voss had very grave concerns that you failed to
24 recognize the amount of care required for an orthopedic spine
25 patient?

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

98

1 DR. IRANI: That's their statement.

2 DR. KOON: Did you subsequently enter a delayed
3 clinical note in the computer about your evaluation of that
4 patient?

5 DR. IRANI: Uh-huh.

6 DR. KOON: How long after that did it occur?

7 DR. IRANI: I think within 72 hours -- or 48 or 72
8 hours.

9 DR. KOON: So they met with you on the 28th of
10 February and you went into the computer and put that note in
11 there on the 1st of March; is that correct?

12 DR. IRANI: I don't recall the exact dates, but if
13 that's what the computer shows, it's probably correct.

14 DR. KOON: Can you give me a little -- can you tell
15 me why you went into the computer 72 hours later and put a
16 delayed clinical note in the computer?

17 DR. IRANI: They had requested documentation.
18 Initially, I was told my documentation was inaccurate, so I
19 could not put a note in. But they still wanted documentation,
20 so I decided I should put it in. I don't think it would cause
21 any harm.

22 DR. KOON: You say that -- you said that your
23 documentation was inaccurate?

24 DR. IRANI: No, I didn't say that. They wanted more
25 documentation afterwards. I was told that my physical exam was

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

99

1 incorrect; however, after looking back, I know my physical exam
2 was the exact same one Dr. Grabowski had actually written down
3 at a six o'clock note, therefore accordingly I could write down
4 the same thing.

5 DR. KOON: Actually, your note did not include any
6 measure of neurosensory testing or strength testing; is that
7 correct?

8 DR. IRANI: Which note?

9 DR. KOON: Your note of the morning of the -- the
10 morning the patient went to surgery.

11 DR. IRANI: Do you have it?

12 DR. KOON: I do not have it in front of me. No.

13 DR. IRANI: I'd have to see it. I don't know. I
14 thought I did. That's per Dr. Grabowski's note. My --

15 DR. KOON: So when you called Dr. Grabowski and --
16 you told him your findings he said, "That's inaccurate. Don't
17 write it in the chart"; is that correct?

18 DR. IRANI: He said, "That doesn't make any sense."
19

20 DR. KOON: Okay. What else did he say?

21 DR. IRANI: I don't recall the entire conversation.
22 It's been a couple months ago.

23 DR. KOON: Did he say, "Are you sure?"

24 DR. IRANI: I don't recall.

25 DR. KOON: Did he ask you that three times?

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

100

1 DR. IRANI: I'm not sure.

2 DR. KOON: Well, he said, "Are you sure? Because
3 that's a profound change from her pre-op -- from her
4 postoperative status." Does that ring a bell?

5 DR. IRANI: I don't recall the exact conversation,
6 but I know I told him my physical exam findings. He was
7 concerned and came by and examined the patient. I don't know
8 what exactly he did or did not say, but I do know I conveyed to
9 him that there was a grave finding, so --

10 DR. KOON: So you're not sure exactly what he said
11 on the telephone?

12 DR. IRANI: I know that he told me my physical exam
13 doesn't make sense.

14 DR. KOON: But there have been other telephone
15 conversations that you remember in detail and that you
16 documented for us today; is that correct?

17 DR. IRANI: I don't know which -- what you're
18 referring to. Could you please explain?

19 DR. KOON: I have a couple questions about the
20 hemophiliac patient.

21 DR. IRANI: Okay.

22 (Audio cuts out briefly)

23 DR. KOON: Dr. Voss and Grabowski had a long
24 discussion with you about documentation and thoroughness and so
25 forth, and then the following day at 11 -- the next day at 11:00

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

101

1 p.m. there was a patient who was admitted to the hospital for
2 hemophilia and an enlarging and painful calf.

3 You had a written note dated 29 February at 11:00
4 p.m., and you dictated a note at midnight on the 1st of March.
5 Dr. Wood wrote a note at one o'clock in the morning -- 1:06 and
6 directed you to see the patient at four o'clock the next
7 morning. And that e-mail is Page 82. "I finished writing my
8 consult note" -- one, two, three -- four paragraphs up.

9 "I spoke with Dr. Irani at 1:15 a.m. and informed
10 him that the patient needed to be admitted, and I would like the
11 patient checked in a few hours. I then went to further clarify
12 to give a more specific time frame of 4:00 p.m. I left the ER
13 where the patient was at approximately 1:15. I informed Dr.
14 Irani of my physical findings and told him that if the patient
15 had worsening of symptoms that I wanted to be contacted
16 immediately." Is that your -- is that consistent with your
17 recollection of those events that night?

18 DR. IRANI: Sounds about right.

19 DR. KOON: Okay. Subsequently in the chart there's
20 a note from SCOA at 2:29 a.m. and another note at 3:39 a.m. And
21 then the next note in the chart is a chief resident note at 6:05
22 on the 1st of March. Did you have any notes that were missing
23 in the computer from your dictated note at midnight through the
24 Dr. Wood's note at 6:05?

25 DR. IRANI: So the question is do I have any missing

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

102

1 notes in the chart?

2 DR. KOON: Right. Is there -- if that's -- if
3 that's my --

4 DR. IRANI: No. I think --

5 DR. KOON: -- findings in the record, are there any
6 notes in there that I'm missing that you wrote?

7 DR. IRANI: Dr. Koon, I think we already addressed
8 this, that ideally I would've written the note at that time. I
9 examined the patient at midnight. The morning exam was at 6:00
10 a.m. An interval check, Dr. Wood told me 4:00, but I did it at
11 2:30, which was close to the halfway mark.

12 I had to apologize to Dr. Wood because I did not do
13 it at 4:00 a.m. like you had asked me to, and I left it at that.

14 And I think we already talked about that I think we all make
15 mistakes, and I've made my share of mistakes. I did not deny
16 that to you when I met with you. I did not deny that to Dr.
17 Walsh when I met with him. I think that's part of learning.

18 DR. KOON: So you did not follow your chief
19 resident's instructions that night; is that correct?

20 DR. IRANI: I did an interval exam.

21 DR. KOON: Okay. And you subsequently put a delayed
22 clinical note in the computer and that note was put in on the 3rd
23 of March at 12:20 that night; is that correct??

24 DR. IRANI: I don't know exactly what time it was,
25 but if that's what the computer shows, I'm sure it's accurate,

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

103

1 sir.

2 DR. KOON: And you documented a physical exam that
3 you performed at 2:30 in the morning on the 1st of March; is
4 that correct?

5 DR. IRANI: If that's what the record shows, sir.

6 DR. KOON: Did you oversleep that morning?

7 DR. IRANI: I was late to rounds. I think that's
8 it. I apologized.

9 DR. KOON: Was that one of the remediation measures
10 that we had put in place?

11 DR. IRANI: In December you told me that I was doing
12 fine in terms of my being on time. You said you would let me
13 know if I'm being tardy. That was at our November 21st meeting.

14
15 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Dr. Koon, are these questions
16 for clarification based on his testimony?

17 DR. KOON: Yes, ma'am.

18 DR. IRANI: I would also add that I'd been late to
19 rounds three times my PGY 2 year. All patients have always been
20 seen.

21 DR. KOON: You were very specific very early in your
22 presentation that I boasted about firing Dr. Lamoreaux. Do you
23 remember that conversation?

24 DR. IRANI: I remember you boasting about firing Dr.
25 Lamoreaux.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

104

1 DR. KOON: And I used that word, "firing Dr.
2 Lamoreaux"?

3 DR. IRANI: I don't know which exact words you used.
4 I did not quote you in my testimony. I simply said you boasted
5 about firing him. Whether it's firing or termination or trying
6 to get rid of -- that's why I didn't quotes when I addressed
7 you.

8 DR. KOON: If I did fire him, would that be an
9 accurate statement? If I said -- if I was bragging about firing
10 Dr. Lamoreaux, would that be an accurate statement?

11 DR. IRANI: I don't get -- I don't see what you're
12 getting at.

13 DR. KOON: Dr. Lamoreaux, in fact, was not fired.
14 He finished his residency in a delayed fashion.

15 DR. IRANI: Right. Right. Because he --

16 DR. KOON: So if I said that he was fired, then
17 that's an inaccurate statement on my part.

18 DR. IRANI: Could've been. I don't know. Could've
19 been. I know Dr. Lamoreaux had to file a lawsuit in order to
20 get reinstated and you refused to educate him when he came back.

21
22 DR. KOON: So you know that I refused to educate
23 him. How would you know about that?

24 DR. IRANI: Word gets around.

25 DR. WALSH: I would add this: "incorrect

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

105

1 word -- "gets around" apparently." That's not true.

2 MS. HILL: I'm not sure this is pertinent to
3 today's decision.

4 DR. WALSH: Okay.

5 DR. IRANI: Okay.

6 (Unintelligible simultaneous speaking)

7 DR. WALSH: That's fine.

8 DR. KOON: But Dr. Irani stated that I boasted about
9 firing a former resident, and so I'm trying to clarify the fact
10 that if I boasted about that, it would've been inaccurate on my
11 part because he wasn't fired. So for that -- for that comment to
12 have veracity, there would have to be some type of documentation.

13 You also admitted that -- earlier in your statement
14 you admitted to duty hour violations; is that correct?

15 DR. IRANI: I'm sorry. Come again.

16 DR. KOON: You admitted to duty hour violations?

17 DR. IRANI: Yeah. And I wrote that in my initial
18 complaint addressed to Kathy Stevens, so, Dr. Koon, I imagine
19 (unintelligible).

20 DR. KOON: I've got a log of the New Innovations
21 documentation report regarding duty hour violations. Were those
22 reported in the New Innovations?

23 DR. IRANI: (No verbal response).

24 DR. KOON: They are? So every duty violation that
25 you've ever had is included in that chart?

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

106

1 DR. IRANI: I would say when all residents are
2 violating duty hours and all residents in New Innovations show
3 they are within duty hours, I think it's a system-wide problem.
4 It's not just me. If it was just me, it would be a problem.
5 But all residents across the board are doing this, and it's a
6 system-based problem. I brought it up to you earlier with that
7 e-mail.

8 DR. KOON: So when you violated a duty hour, that is
9 not going to show up -- if you violate duty hour regulations, is
10 that going to show up on your documentation or your duty hour on
11 New Innovations?

12 DR. IRANI: I'd have to review it. I know there are
13 some in there. I'll have to go through --

14 DR. WALSH: Well, are you telling the truth, what
15 you're putting in New Innovations or not?

16 DR. IRANI: Let me just say that all the residents
17 are allegedly following according to New Innovations, but the
18 violation rate is the same across all the junior residents. So
19 if you can say -- if we're forced to be doing something, I don't
20 know if you can say we're reporting things inaccurate when we
21 don't really have a choice as residents.

22 DR. WALSH: So are you saying that not only you are
23 not telling the truth in New Innovations but all the other
24 residents are?

25 DR. IRANI: I'm not saying we're not telling the

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

107

1 truth. I'm saying that violations are occurring across all
2 residents.

3 DR. KOON: Isn't it true that you wrote the ACGME in
4 Chicago and documented a 33 to 50 percent rate of duty hour
5 violations in post-call residents?

6 DR. IRANI: I don't see how that's relevant.

7 DR. WALSH: Did you do it or not?

8 DR. IRANI: We have ACGME violations. I think
9 that's ACGME's decision.

10 DR. KOON: He's stating that he's violated duty
11 hour violations, but they're not recorded. Now, he's saying
12 that all the residents do it. And so he says everybody does it,
13 so I'm trying to establish how many of my residents are doing
14 that that I don't know --

15 DR. IRANI: So if I give you --

16 DR. KOON: -- that. He wrote a letter to the ACGME
17 and said 50 percent of my post-call residents are violating duty
18 hours. So I --

19 DR. WALSH: (unintelligible). He's the one who
20 stated the entire program was under investigation.

21 DR. KOON: I wasn't going to bring up the ACGME.

22 DR. IRANI: Well, I think it's important to know
23 that a third party thinks that there's significant violations
24 of this program.

25 DR. KOON: And why does a third party think there's

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

108

1 significant violations of this program?

2 DR. IRANI: That's going to be their investigation.

3
4 DR. KOON: Is their investigation going to be based
5 on the letter that you wrote to Chicago?

6 DR. IRANI: I don't know what their investigation is
7 based on. They might have other things. I don't see how this is
8 relevant, ma'am.

9 DR. KOON: Okay.

10 MS. HILL: I don't think we're going to agree on an
11 answer to this and (unintelligible).

12 DR. KOON: All right. You also said that there was
13 false documentation in statements presented at the GMEC. Were
14 you there at the GMEC meeting?

15 DR. IRANI: No, but I saw a letter presented to the
16 GMEC.

17 DR. KOON: Okay. So you're -- you having knowledge
18 of false statements presented -- being presented at the GMEC is
19 not correct; is that a fair statement?

20 DR. IRANI: If the letter that I received was not a
21 representation of what was presented at the GMEC, then I have
22 been misled. But if that was the letter presented, then I stand
23 by what I said earlier.

24 DR. KOON: You also stated in your presentation that
25 I said that I would have fired you on the spot. Is that true?

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

109

1 Is that a true comment of what you said?

2 DR. IRANI: Yes. I said it in my statement, yes.

3 DR. KOON: And you appear to be very knowledgeable
4 of the ACGME requirements for programs. Is that something that
5 I would be able to do as a program director?

6 DR. IRANI: I don't know all the ACGME guidelines
7 about how to fire to a resident.

8 DR. KOON: Okay. You also stated that he, meaning
9 me -- "he changed the level of remediation." Is that a correct
10 statement?

11 DR. IRANI: If it's what I said, yes, sir.

12 DR. KOON: All right. But in reality, that's not a
13 decision for the program director to do. As stated in our
14 memorandum of record, these are faculty decisions that are
15 forwarded to the GMEC for approval. These aren't individual
16 decisions. Is that a fair statement?

17 DR. IRANI: I don't know what happened at a faculty
18 meeting, Dr. Koon.

19 DR. KOON: Okay. You brought up a patient of Dr.
20 Grabowski's in a staff clinic where he wanted to get an MRI and
21 instructed you to do that, and you stated that you spoke
22 with the staff, couldn't get that done, spoke to the chief
23 resident Dr. Wood, and then you got the MRI that day. Is that
24 true? Is that your recollection of those events?

25 DR. IRANI: Radiology confirmed that we would get

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

110
1 the MRI today if I sent them across the street, and I sent them
2 across the street that day. To be honest, I don't -- you know,
3 if something happened along the way and it didn't happen, I
4 don't know. But to my recollection I got him an appointment, I
5 sent him across the street. My understanding is he did get it
6 done that day. His appointment was made.

7 DR. KOON: Okay. And when confronted -- when you
8 had that version of your story, what were Dr. Grabowski's and
9 Dr. Wood's response to you during that faculty meeting when you
10 presented your side of the story?

11 DR. IRANI: I don't know if you have it written
12 down, but I don't recall exactly all the details. I mean, I
13 think I would be just guessing.

14 DR. KOON: You also stated that in February when you
15 came back on -- came back on Level 2 remediation, you said that
16 you were unsupervised on the service. Could you explain that
17 comment?

18 DR. IRANI: I just meant there was no senior
19 resident. Oftentimes when I've worked, the programs have a
20 senior and a junior resident on the service. I was the sole
21 resident, and that was my first spine patient I'd ever done as a
22 resident.

23 DR. KOON: But you did have senior-level and
24 attending coverage for your care of that patient, correct?

25 DR. IRANI: Well, there's always senior-level

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

111

1 residents and always attendings in the hospital. The only
2 attending -- the only other person on that service was my
3 attending, Dr. Grabowski.

4 DR. KOON: You also stated in your presentation that
5 you were illegally targeted. Can you explain what you mean by
6 illegally targeted?

7 DR. IRANI: I think I laid out some discrepancies
8 about my treatment as opposed to my colleague's and some of the
9 behaviors exhibited. And I think, you know, any sort of
10 unfair treatment lends itself to that.

11 DR. KOON: Okay. You also stated multiple times
12 that you were being punished for doing right or punished for
13 doing wrong. Can you give me an example of when you did
14 something right and you were punished?

15 DR. IRANI: Well, to my understanding, you said the
16 trauma case managers complained about my behavior. I've talked
17 to them. And if you guys want to talk to them as well and get a
18 neutral third opinion -- they thought I did a great job and they
19 keep asking me to come back. I thought I did -- I thought from
20 feedback that they personally gave me that I did a good job in
21 their rotation, but it was used as another incidence of poor,
22 substandard care.

23 DR. KOON: You also stated several times in your
24 presentation that due process for the last 18 months has been
25 lacking. Before your letter to the ACGME, was there any e-mail,

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

112

1 letter, any type of communication with anybody relating to your
2 lack of or unfair due process?

3 DR. IRANI: I don't think I said over the past 18
4 months. I think one of the examples I gave in my statement was
5 in regard to my filing a grievance within ten business days and
6 that being denied. I think that happened in January -- fairly
7 recently.

8 DR. KOON: So other than that one episode, is there
9 any other area where you've been lacking due process?

10 DR. IRANI: I haven't done a thorough examination.
11 I just presented some -- what I thought were the easiest and
12 quickest-to-grab examples today.

13 DR. KOON: You also mentioned that you brought your
14 concerns to appropriate local committees. Can you tell me which
15 committees you brought that to, when you did it, how many, and
16 if there's any documentation of any of that?

17 DR. IRANI: Sure. I think the appropriate
18 committees is outlined in the grievance council. There's Step
19 1.1, 1.2. You go to yourself, Dr. Walsh, Stevens. Then you go
20 to the grievance council. I think I've outlined. I don't
21 think those addressed the issues.

22 DR. KOON: Okay. You also mentioned that all the
23 other residents are assigned to operate at the VA. Are you
24 aware that starting in July none of the residents are going to
25 the VA?

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

113

1 DR. IRANI: Last I heard it was still up in the air.
2 I don't know the details. That could be the case.

3 DR. KOON: It is the case.

4 DR. IRANI: Okay.

5 DR. KOON: So -- that's it.

6 MS. HILL: Dr. Walsh?

7 DR. WALSH: Just one other question. Afraaz, Have
8 you tape-recorded anybody's conversations other than the one you
9 did with Dr. Abel?

10 DR. IRANI: With Dr. Abel? No.

11 DR. WALSH: So no other conversations with
12 residents, attendings, or anybody else --

13 DR. IRANI: No.

14 DR. WALSH: -- you've tape-recorded?

15 DR. IRANI: No.

16 DR. WALSH: You've never left your phone on so
17 somebody else could listen or --

18 DR. IRANI: No.

19 DR. WALSH: -- anything like that?

20 DR. IRANI: No.

21 MS. HILL: Dr. Koon, you now have up to 5 minutes
22 give a concluding statement.

23 DR. WALSH: I guess what I would say in conclusion
24 is -- I summarized things before at the end of our statement, and
25 I guess what I would say is that I think that Afraaz's responses

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

114

1 here today speak for themselves regarding defensive, evasive
2 story-telling, avoidance of responsibility, patently false
3 statements that there's paperwork evidence to -- I'm really
4 shocked that you would make, quite frankly -- to the contrary.

5 And I guess I would end it like we began it. This
6 is not somebody we wanted to fail. This is somebody who I
7 wanted to succeed. We worked hard to make him succeed. You
8 know, we don't go through this kind of process in order to just
9 get rid of somebody, so to speak.

10 There was a point when Afraaz was on my service when
11 my wife stopped by the office and I was in examining a patient
12 or something like that and he said something to the effect of
13 being nervous about how things were going or something. My wife
14 said, "No, no. You've got to understand. Dr. Walsh likes you.
15 I mean, you know, he enjoys having you on the service." And I
16 did. I mean, he's making mistakes and so forth, but these are
17 the things residents make, and those are things that I was
18 addressing.

19 The things that this is all about here has to do
20 with bigger issues that surfaced elsewhere and then began to
21 surface in one example we've already talked about was with one of
22 my patients. And so, you know, the notion that there was -- in
23 some way there was a witch-hunt or personal issue or, you know,
24 some reason that we were -- Dave or I or anybody else on the
25 faculty was trying to drum somebody out of the program is just

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

115

1 -- it's bogus and I think that the documentation here speaks for
2 itself, that we were trying to do the right thing, trying to do
3 it in a fashion that was restorative. There's a number of memos
4 in here from Dr. Stevens, another one from me. It specifically
5 states that the whole process is not punitive, that it's
6 something that is -- the goal is remediation and return to the
7 program. And, in fact, when it seemed like things weren't going
8 to work that way -- you know, he alluded to the one resident who
9 withdrew from the program a number of years ago. He withdrew
10 as a PGY 2. He basically came to us and told us that his
11 -- he had gone into orthopedics because his father and his older
12 brother were orthopedic surgeons. He was doing it to please
13 them, and he concluded he didn't really want to do it, and he
14 entered family practice and completed a residency here, so --

15 DR. KOON: Sports medicine.

16 DR. WALSH: -- in sports medicine, ironically enough.

17
18 The -- so from the standpoint of there being sort of
19 a -- somehow a negative culture within the department that's
20 trying to get rid of residents, there isn't anything that
21 supports that whatsoever. So --

22 MS. HILL: (indiscernible) concluded? Okay. Dr.
23 Irani, you have up to five minutes to give your concluding statement.

24 DR. IRANI: I think I already laid out my case in my
25 opening statement. This has been treatment that's been

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

116

1 substantiated by my co-residents. It's been treatment that has
2 been different than compared to my co-residents. It's been
3 derogatory and racially-based insensitive comments directed at
4 me. I think I lay out all my stuff in the opening statement,
5 and -- again, I -- I'm encouraged I'm speaking in front of a
6 neutral third party. Anything here you have questions about,
7 I'm more than happy to substantiate everything I told to you.
8 You're more than welcome to poll the trauma case managers, poll
9 any of the nurses and get their opinions of what they think
10 about me. I'll stand by that. I care about my patients. I
11 care about my patients a lot. I'd come back at night, checked
12 up on them; calling up on them. And, you know, my goal
13 (indiscernible) orthopedic surgeon. That was my goal when I
14 came here.

15 Dr. Walsh mentioned he was excited. I was excited
16 to come here to operate, to get some hands-on experience. I
17 loved it. When I came back in February, I loved it. You know,
18 I jumped in. I created a handbook and I was excited to be back.

19 I was really happy. And I just feel like the people charged
20 with my education haven't made that possible, so -- thank you
21 for your time. I know you guys have places to be.
22 (indiscernible) probably later than you expected, so thank you.

23 MS. HILL: Committee members do you have enough
24 information? All right. Just for the record, I just (indiscernible).

25 DR. IRANI: Sure.

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

1 MS. HILL: All right. Thank you for your time this¹¹⁷
2 afternoon. This (indiscernible).
3 (WHEREIN, the files were concluded.)
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1 CERTIFICATE OF NOTARY PUBLIC

2 STATE OF MISSOURI

3 I, Sherri L. Jolley, within and for
4 the State of Missouri, do hereby certify that the tape
5 transcription in the witness whose testimony appears in the
6 foregoing transcript in the caption hereof and thereafter
7 transcribed by me; that said transcript is a record of the
8 testimony given by said witness; that I am neither counsel for,
9 related to, nor employed by any parties to the action; and
10 further that I am not a relative or employee of any counsel or
11 attorney employee of any counsel or attorney employed by the
12 parties hereto, nor financially or otherwise interested in the
13 outcome of the action.

14
15
16 *Sherri Jolley*
17

18 Sherri L. Jolley
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

\$	180-degree 86:17	24 17:24	36 27:1	55 34:15
\$800 40:1	19 11:17 12:11 13:3	24th 35:19,20 37:13	375 28:12 32:11,24 71:19 86:14 88:23	56 34:19
1	1992 4:19	25 90:4,6	38 29:4	57 34:19
1 5:7 6:21 25:18 31:16 44:10 53:22 54:13	1999 30:5	25th 26:2	3:39 101:20	58 35:10
1.1 112:19	1:06 101:5	26 10:14 18:1	3rd 34:21 102:22	59 35:16
1.2 112:19	1:15 101:9,13	26th 51:21	4	5th 26:24 28:11
1.5 65:8	1st 22:16 69:2 95:1 98:11 101:4,22 103:3	27 18:25	4 19:7 31:17	6 7:24 16:6 19:17
10 12:9 31:16,17	2 9:10,12 10:8,9,11 14:19 16:9 18:24 25:18 36:4,7 37:11 40:8 47:17,18 50:13 54:24 56:21 64:8 67:8,21 73:12,19 76:25 77:2,5,8,17,19 103:19 110:15 115:10	27th 26:2	40 29:4	61 64:1
10th 39:23	2002 4:18,20 6:9 30:5	28 18:1	41 29:5	67 45:25
11 10:11 65:15 77:16 100:25	2006 4:17	28th 26:9 95:10,16 98:9	44 29:5	68 35:16
11:00 60:19 92:24 93:4 100:25 101:3	2010 5:12 9:4 47:10	29 21:12 101:3	45 29:6	6:00 102:9
11:30 92:24	2011 9:10 10:6 22:12,16	2:00 61:1	46 29:6	6:05 101:21,24
12 5:10 7:11,12 8:10 32:11	2015 31:16,17	2:29 101:20	47 31:3	6th 37:10 44:22
12:20 102:23	20th 11:17	2:30 39:9 43:5 61:1 69:7 102:11 103:3	48 31:12 69:11 79:16 98:7	7 16:8 19:21
13 8:14	21st 53:21 103:13	3 19:4 27:25 28:1,4 29:25 36:7 40:8 44:25 54:13 62:12 67:12 79:8,10,15, 18,23 80:8,11,17, 21	4:00 101:12 102:10,13	70 36:2
14 31:16	22 14:10	30 21:25 31:16,17	4:30 39:9	71 36:4,9
15 14:10 77:16	223 5:7	31 22:7	5 7:4 15:10 17:8 19:14 44:10 47:21 58:11 113:21	72 98:7,15
15th 16:20 17:25 77:3	22nd 18:3	31st 36:3	5-milligram 90:2,4	76 36:4 37:8
17 6:21 9:11	23 8:5 16:20 17:22	32 22:7	50 107:4,17	7th 28:11,16
174 31:17		33 23:20 107:4	51 32:5	8
18 11:17 12:12 111:24 112:3		34 24:10	52 32:5	80 38:15 49:4
18(A) 31:16		35 24:10,22	53 32:9	80-year-old 12:24
180 10:23			54 34:15	81 95:25

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

82 101:7	account 30:13	additional 3:24 7:4 46:8 60:1 63:14 78:15	96:10,15 97:10 108:10	amputation 14:2,14
83 39:15	accountability 85:17	additionally 59:5 73:9 74:23	agreed 17:7 28:8	ancillary 56:1 61:23 85:7
84 39:15	accountable 7:25	address 22:25 76:5	agreement 27:20 28:21 29:18 82:4	anecdotes 79:10
86 39:15	accounts 28:21 29:4,5,6,9 30:16	addressed 24:21 61:11 72:17 102:7 104:6 105:18 112:21	agrees 19:18	anesthesia 23:11 61:19 63:13 87:15
8th 28:17	accurate 102:25 104:9,10	addressing 114:18	ahead 2:4 9:13	ankle 42:12
9	accusation 18:12 22:5 57:22 80:14,15	adequate 14:15 77:14	aid 35:13	answers 45:23
9:00 84:6	accusations 34:24	administrator 21:18	air 113:1	antibiotics 11:3
A	accused 13:19 17:9 18:20	admission 53:2 95:3	alarming 67:22	anybody's 113:8
a.m. 60:19 101:9,20 102:10,13	ACGME 37:6 49:7 75:19 93:8,13,24 107:3, 8,16,21 109:4,6 111:25	admit 16:3 27:20 38:17 70:3,8 72:7,14 96:3,21	albeit 49:20	apologize 70:3 102:12
aback 56:25 67:10	ACGME'S 107:9	admits 19:15	alcohol 31:6	apologized 70:5 103:8
Abel 15:12,14 27:16 113:9,10	Achmed 51:7 71:8 73:13	admitted 27:15 53:19 69:5 79:23 80:2,23 81:20 95:1 101:1, 10 105:13,14,16	Alice 12:7	apology 44:4
abide 19:12 26:9 63:22	acknowledge 3:1 26:21	admittedly 48:1,4	allegation 57:10 60:3 63:2 87:17	apparent 67:22
ability 43:11	act 66:3 72:7	affect 28:5	allegations 26:1 40:10,12,14, 18,19 48:6,18 50:10 52:24 55:7 63:17 73:19,20,22 74:12,18	apparently 105:1
abnormal 38:13	acted 46:7	afforded 57:18	alleged 40:16 48:20 49:9, 13 58:8 65:1 74:2, 8	appeal 24:8 36:9,10
about-face 54:10	actions 26:22 63:19 72:23 73:11 75:10	Afraaz 6:7,11,24 9:8 20:4, 12 21:1 22:9 23:5, 21 24:12 25:23 29:1 32:18 33:2 34:4,20 35:11 37:7 40:25 41:3 42:6 85:22 88:5 113:7 114:10	allegedly 106:17	appealed 24:7
absolutely 44:3 53:9 84:9	active 53:12,22	Afraaz's 4:14 113:25	alleging 73:25	appeals 22:1,2,5 31:23 40:11
abundantly 62:21	activities 70:20	afraid 52:5 55:18 59:3 60:14 72:2	Allie 2:20	appeared 17:3 24:1 37:25 66:3
academic 17:14 25:8 36:8 40:14 92:14	actual 44:20	afternoon 2:3 28:18 46:19 117:2	allotted 36:11	applicant 5:2,10
academy 37:12	acutely 29:20 42:16	agree 17:1 84:12 95:16	allowed 5:14 17:15	appointment 31:12 34:8,17 110:4,6
accept 22:21,22 34:6 51:16	adapt 68:21		alluded 32:3 80:18 115:8	appreciated 66:15
accepting 32:25 34:12 72:13	add 30:4 32:17 62:9 66:9 103:18 104:25		alludes 22:1	appreciates 19:1
accessed 94:15,22	added 77:19,21		amnesic 23:12	appreciative 35:25
accidentally 66:11	addition 10:1		amount 13:20 97:19,24	approached 60:9
accordance 40:6				appropriately 36:23 49:9
				approval

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

16:17 17:24 109:15	assure 53:10	75:4 92:4,16,19	badly 30:22,25	bell 100:4
approve 17:13	assured 62:3	audio 64:7 100:22	balances 75:13	benefit 90:5
approved 16:23 17:23 36:15 39:23 62:13	assures 75:16	August 4:10 12:10 14:10 16:20 17:25 18:3 54:6 77:3,16	banks 65:11	big 25:20 41:22 42:11
approving 12:23	astounding 25:7	authoritatively 57:6	Baptist 68:7	bigger 114:20
approximately 69:5 92:24 101:13	attaches 35:7	avail 74:21	base 8:24 50:12 67:17, 18,19 74:2	binder 53:9
April 39:24	attacks 71:11,12	average 67:20 75:5 92:21	based 18:8 19:19 30:2 71:1 73:9,19 103:16 108:4,7	bit 6:12 9:13 12:2 19:21 45:24 85:2,3
area 73:4 76:11 82:15 91:21 112:9	attempt 35:14 36:20 53:6 62:23 73:16,24	avoid 72:3	basic 36:18	black-and-white 36:25 89:4
areas 8:7 28:21	attempted 36:9,10 40:21 62:7 64:22 73:5	avoidance 114:2	basically 11:7,21 15:16 18:8 21:10 23:21 24:19 26:12 27:14 28:4 30:1 33:9 34:1 36:11 37:25 42:16 45:3,21 87:11 115:10	blank 81:8,24
argue 80:11	attempting 22:13 58:8	avoided 63:9	basis 26:16	blood 29:14
argued 17:5	attempts 40:9 48:12 53:8	awake 29:12	bay 61:5 87:24 88:2,9, 13	board 106:5
argumentative 26:11,18	attend 5:23 54:15	awards 5:5	bear 51:13	boast 47:19
Arlene 28:18	attended 5:4	aware 7:8 23:3 29:20 31:22 33:22 34:24 77:25 88:8,11 93:15 94:1 95:20 112:24	bed 61:24	boasted 53:15 103:22 104:4 105:8,10
arm 85:24 86:1,2,6,8, 10,12 88:22	attending 5:18 7:10 14:21 25:8 26:10 31:20 37:4 40:7 41:9 42:25 43:25 47:13 49:12 51:11,20 54:22 55:22 56:10, 15,19,21 57:3,15 58:23 61:1 63:22 69:16,18,21 78:4 86:11 87:23 91:16 96:12 110:24 111:2,3	Aww 42:20 43:2	began 5:17 22:11 40:25 50:4 52:4 54:2 114:5,20	boasting 103:24
arms 41:23	attending's 56:24 57:7	B	begin 37:2,3	bogus 115:1
Army 4:20	attendings 6:2,17 7:1 9:23 18:22 19:8 31:20 42:3 53:5 60:16 68:9 69:22 111:1 113:12	B's 17:10 18:18	beginning 31:17 33:6 35:2 36:8 47:9 67:7 74:24	book 15:14 40:2
arrival 63:6	attendings' 18:8	back 3:7 9:14 11:17 12:2 25:5,19 27:25 28:10 32:1,23 35:14 36:5 37:3,10 44:22,25 47:8 54:3,6 56:4 61:21 68:14,19 79:15 80:5 84:5,7 85:3,9 90:23 93:5,6 99:1 104:20 110:15 111:19 116:11,17, 18	behalf 46:20,25	born 5:3 72:8
arrived 47:9 61:3	attention 16:9 19:22 20:9,14 33:1,7 41:19 78:24	backdrop 42:9	behavior 22:19,20,24 30:23 43:8 47:5 51:3 60:3 64:2 71:15 72:5 73:12,17 75:12,22 76:6 111:16	both-bone 10:23
arthroplasty 15:25 68:23	attracted 47:11	background 72:13 73:14	behaviors 111:9	bothered 57:11 64:14
ascertaining 62:23	attrition	backwards 11:16		bottom 4:24 18:6,12 23:2 24:22 35:12
assessed 61:16 63:13 89:13 90:15				bounce 80:4
assessment 38:1 45:12 96:4,22				bragging 104:9
assigned 5:23 24:13 53:3 68:8 74:24 75:1 112:23				brain 50:25
assist 31:10,11 74:10				brand-new 6:16 10:8,9
assisting 2:15,18				briefed 2:3
				briefly 14:11 20:2 37:14

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

100:22 bring 73:5 107:21 bringing 58:14 broached 63:5 broad 78:10 79:3 Brock 2:20 broken 81:20 brother 41:22 115:12 brother's 55:4,9 brought 20:9,13 26:18 31:24 47:22 54:5 61:20 91:16 94:9 106:6 109:19 112:13,15 Brown 2:18,21 bunch 81:4 burden 19:10 business 2:16,17 16:19 21:18 64:6 65:6, 13,15,18 66:1 82:2 112:5 busy 9:19 46:22,24 buy 84:15 Bynoe 7:11 76:10 84:24	95:7 called 15:15 26:4 37:8 38:1 39:1 42:19 47:16 53:13 59:6, 12,20 60:21 69:2, 16 74:10 83:20 87:23 88:2,9,12 89:24,25 90:15 91:3 96:12 99:15 calling 27:13 58:23 71:8, 23 116:12 callous 72:23 86:10 calls 27:10,15 40:13 59:23 73:13 cancel 33:16 cancelled 31:12 33:24 cancelling 34:8 care 5:24 6:8 8:2,13,18 9:7,20 10:6 11:12 14:8,13 15:10 17:10 18:7,13,18 19:14 20:18 21:5, 6,8,11 23:4,16 24:25 25:12 27:22 28:15 29:10 30:2, 9,19 32:11 37:14 42:11 43:2,12,13 49:18,20 52:12,14, 15,20 56:10,12,14 57:2,15 58:14 62:2 64:25 69:4 71:4 73:25 74:6,9,18 83:18 84:25 86:19 88:14 89:1 96:7,25 97:6,19,24 110:24 111:22 116:10,11	Carolina 4:19 54:25 carpal 81:3,12 carried 56:10,15 carry 83:13 case 3:10,16 4:12 5:19 60:6 71:15 74:8 79:6 111:16 113:2, 3 115:24 116:8 cases 30:15,22 36:23 81:24 89:1 casual 21:6 30:24 causing 38:4 CD 64:8 cellulitis 16:1 cetera 91:20 Chad 47:19 chair 4:6 32:13 chairman 47:6 62:1,15 75:14,15 challenged 87:11 89:2 challenging 54:19 chance 6:16,18 64:13 74:23 change 21:21,24 41:24 61:24 72:15 76:6 83:5 100:3 changed 21:23 54:13 68:6 109:9 changing 21:10 charged 66:7 116:19 chart 69:23 87:14,17 99:17 101:19,21	102:1 105:25 check 13:9 31:2,8 38:22 43:15 66:10 84:6 102:10 checked 39:8,9,11 101:11 116:11 checkered 22:19 checks 75:13 Chicago 107:4 108:5 chief 6:5 8:15 9:4,6 21:18 24:11 26:11, 17 27:4 38:21 39:1,7 50:4 56:4,6 58:17 60:21 101:21 102:18 109:22 choice 29:21 76:23 106:21 chronic 38:11 chronological 11:15 circle 3:7 circumstances 65:23 cite 53:24 54:2 cited 58:14 71:17 cites 64:2 claims 60:11 clarification 48:12,17 53:24 73:20 78:12 103:16 clarify 79:8 101:11 105:9 cleaning 61:23 93:3 clear 48:17 50:19 55:17 57:23 58:4 59:24, 25 60:15 62:21 72:3,22 73:25 77:20	clinic 19:24 24:12 25:25 26:10,13 28:17 36:23 38:6 55:22 65:12 88:18 109:20 clinical 15:4 54:14 78:9,14 98:3,16 102:22 clinics 14:25 19:6 77:25 close 102:11 closed 15:11,18 17:8 65:12 closure 71:21 co-residents 58:1 116:1,2 Coast 47:9 72:10 coincide 54:22 colleague 58:21 67:22 colleague's 111:8 colleagues 9:25 63:21 70:21 71:18 collegial 33:14 combative 33:15 combination 36:17 comment 7:5,19 105:11 109:1 110:17 comments 5:18 7:5,10,22 9:12,16 15:2 51:6, 8 52:1 63:10 68:17 71:9 116:3 commitment 75:25 committee 2:3,10,11,18,23 3:11,17,23 16:14 17:13,25 31:9 36:12,16 39:23 44:5 70:24 76:2 85:20 91:11 116:23
C				
Cadalano 12:8 calf 38:18 101:2 California 5:3 28:9 72:9 call 15:7,12,23 33:19 38:16,23 55:5 56:6 60:23 61:25 62:17, 18 63:9 85:11,12 90:9,10,11,22 91:6	cared 28:14 career 66:5 68:2 72:24 careers 66:5 carefully 54:21 cares 15:11 caring 7:6,21 69:11 84:14			

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

committees 40:21 73:6 112:14, 15,18	37:5	conferred 59:13	contacted 34:7 62:14 93:24 101:15	correcting 20:12
common 57:18 62:21 64:16	complex 23:3 42:11	confident 7:6 75:13	contention 76:5 88:25 90:7 97:15	corrections 82:12
commonly 33:2	complicated 82:2	confidential 2:24 3:2 58:2	context 30:10,14 34:11 35:23 41:25 42:7 45:24	could've 7:11 42:21 104:18
communicates 21:10	complication 89:14	confirmed 27:14 109:25	continually 19:5	council 36:10 65:5,15 71:1 74:22 112:18,20
communicating 24:4	compromised 68:10	conflict 51:11 56:19	continue 7:24 21:3 90:18	counsel 66:14
communication 14:20 18:25 19:3 51:16 53:7,8 78:3 112:1	compulsiveness 96:4,22	conflicts 92:18	continued 6:9 17:19 24:12 27:21,22 51:5	counseled 25:11 42:23 76:5
communicator 24:5	computer 94:16 98:3,10,13, 15,16 101:23 102:22,25	confrontational 54:17 57:22	continues 97:4	counseling 16:11,12 41:20 46:1
compared 116:2	conceded 65:20	confronted 26:11,17,19 70:2,5 110:7	continuing 51:19 68:1 74:7	count 65:12
compartment 38:19,20 69:6,8 79:13 88:24	concern 9:18,19 14:21 37:25 38:18 96:6, 24 97:11	confused 47:21 48:1 57:1,13 60:13 64:19	contradict 56:23	Countless 20:13
compassion 11:19 14:12 18:7 49:18	concerned 29:20 33:18 37:21 47:4 75:12 100:7	confusing 50:14 52:16	contradicted 57:6	couple 4:23 32:20 49:14 77:8 94:23 99:22 100:19
compassionate 30:24	concerns 5:17 6:9 9:11 10:4 11:18 14:8 27:11 40:21 73:5 88:13 97:23 112:14	conscious 61:18 63:15	contrary 73:25 74:3 114:4	coupled 52:24
competencies 67:11,16,23	conclude 48:10	consent 63:1	contribute 45:14	courtesy 57:18 62:21 63:9 64:16
complain 27:21	concluded 60:18 115:13,22 117:3	consents 63:4	conversation 33:25 34:11 76:16 81:16 90:21 99:21 100:5 103:23	coverage 110:24
complainant 64:5	concludes 44:5	considerably 43:14	conversations 40:13 100:15 113:8,11	covered 23:1
complained 17:2 111:16	concluding 3:21,22 113:22 115:23	considered 3:2	conveyed 100:8	cowardly 71:12
complaint 64:6,23 84:23 105:18	conclusion 8:19 40:24 45:23 59:22 113:23	consistency 8:17	copies 4:14	create 52:22 54:23 68:21
complaints 6:4 35:4 48:5 51:24 56:14 60:4 64:23 65:4 67:17 74:16 84:22 87:6	conclusions 40:3 45:14	consistent 12:14 30:16 97:5 101:16	copy 17:20 62:11 64:24 65:3 77:6	created 48:24 116:18
complete 19:9 21:15 36:22 37:4 74:14 81:12, 13 82:4	concur 30:12	consisting 52:1	core 8:22,24	creating 52:25 55:8 78:17
completed 53:2 72:9 80:18 115:14	condition 38:24 43:1 97:7	constant 73:14 74:4	correct 44:1 48:20 53:4 68:15,25 76:10 95:6,10 98:11,13 99:7,17 100:16 102:19,23 103:4 105:14 108:19 109:9 110:24	culminated 75:10
completely 7:6 21:6 47:25 89:21	conduct 64:2	constantly 21:9 58:23 71:22	corrected 20:14 53:25	cultural 72:4 73:14
completing 5:23 24:13 35:13	conference 77:24	constituted 63:1		culture 115:19
	conferences 14:25 19:5	constructive 66:22		curiosity 91:24
		consult 101:8		curious 54:5
		contact 34:9 62:7		current 24:18 69:10 72:11

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

cut 31:16	deceitful 63:10 75:12	demonstrate 15:3 18:6 73:16 84:23 96:7,25	110:12 113:2	21 70:3 101:6 116:3
cuts 64:8 100:22	December 6:9 53:23 67:4 103:11	demonstrated 14:12,19,24 77:23 84:20 96:16	determine 79:2	direction 50:17 82:21
D	decency 62:17,21	demonstrates 18:24	determining 29:25	directions 26:10 52:2 68:22
dangerous 29:2	decided 22:3 26:15 30:3 51:14,15,16 68:21 69:10 78:1 98:20	demonstrating 84:25	develop 4:13 9:1 14:9	director 4:7,17 12:8 21:17 47:6 48:21 49:5 50:18 51:3 53:11 62:10,16 64:5 66:14 72:21 73:10, 13,23 74:7,13 75:8,14 109:5,13
date 28:5 95:12	decision 2:10 13:13 16:2 21:25 29:19 30:2 35:11 50:12 56:21 62:17 65:7 83:17 105:3 107:9 109:13	demonstration 97:6	developed 15:25	disagree 19:17
dated 14:10 77:3 101:3	decisions 50:5 71:1 72:24 109:14,16	denied 24:8 49:1 60:11 65:4,24 66:25 73:8,20 74:16,22, 23 75:1 112:6	developing 42:17	disagreeing 86:19
Dave 4:11,16 23:1 40:25 114:24	declared 56:18 57:6 58:6 83:2	deny 102:15,16	development 70:16	disagreements 35:21
Dave's 30:5	decompression 37:15	department 4:17 10:15 17:12 27:24 32:13 36:1 39:12 40:17 47:7 49:17 59:16 60:3, 25 61:21 72:24 75:10,14 115:19	deviated 57:2	disappointed 49:20 50:4 73:7 75:11
David 4:7	deeply 71:9	department's 93:21	diagnoses 46:6	disappointing 50:14,15
Davinder 2:21	defensive 26:18 43:7 45:24 50:20 114:1	departmental 39:22	diametrically 86:18	disarray 61:3
day 5:20 10:16 11:5,10 13:9 14:6,8 20:7, 10 24:17 37:15 38:16,25 41:3 42:25 51:17 55:5, 10 56:2,3,4,7 57:11 58:10 59:12, 15 64:6 65:10,13, 16,18 81:25 82:9 95:3,13,19 100:25 109:23 110:2,6	deficiencies 17:5 24:2 47:24 48:9,20 53:5,24 54:1 67:10 68:16, 25 71:17 74:2 77:10,12	derailed 72:24	dictated 24:24 52:20 101:4, 23	discharge 25:3 52:20
days 10:11 13:6 16:5 23:19 32:11 49:14 52:10,15 54:21,22, 24 55:6,13,16 56:20 65:6,15 66:1 112:5	deficient 67:23	derogatory 51:5 71:5 116:3	dictating 20:16	disciplinary 73:11
deadline 65:22	defined 65:18	describe 4:23 25:24 29:3	dictation 52:8,10,13	discipline 57:14 58:24 71:23
deadlines 65:23	definition 72:22	describing 87:21,22	dictations 20:7	disclose 94:3
deal 6:7 15:16	degrade 58:8	description 87:7 97:5	difference 22:23 38:23 45:13	disconnect 86:15
dealing 71:4	degree 16:12	descriptions 30:23	differences 72:5	discontinue 31:21
dean's 5:6	degrees 10:24	designee 64:5	differently 40:19 56:22 58:16 72:7,8	discontinued 31:18
debridement 11:2	delayed 98:2,16 102:21 104:14	desire 7:21 8:23	difficult 27:5 73:1	discredit 73:24
	demeaning 67:5	detail 16:9 19:22,23 41:20 78:24 100:15	difficulty 37:5	discrepancies 111:7
		detailed 22:10 28:20 36:16 79:11	dinner 41:21	discrepancy 65:18 88:19
		details 4:12 42:24 56:16	DIO'S 65:7	discuss 9:4 26:24
			direct 3:13,19 23:15 52:1 56:19 63:22	discussed 16:14,18,22 17:22 25:16 26:14 32:19
			directed 14:7 60:23 69:20,	discussion 5:1 11:23 16:1

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

28:1 32:18 63:5 95:4 100:24	documenting 14:7 25:24 39:15	16,21,24 106:2,3, 8,9,10 107:4,10,17	efficiency 70:12	end 4:1 20:6 32:18 33:13 44:8 61:12 64:8 67:4 76:21 81:11,25 82:17,18 113:24 114:5
discussions 28:3 79:11	documents 73:15 74:19	<hr/> E <hr/>	efficient 15:7	endorse 70:4
disenchanted 50:14	Donna 2:18	E-care 46:3	effort 65:25 79:7	engage 74:23
dismissal 39:13	dosage 63:18	e-mail 18:2 21:13,25 22:7 24:22 33:20,23 34:2,19 35:10 36:2 38:14 39:14,16 52:25 53:13,15 58:2 66:9 83:3 95:14 101:7 106:7 111:25	efforts 19:2 31:15 54:10 68:13	English 48:16
disorders 38:12	dose 25:14 90:13,14,18	e-mails 4:14 10:14 35:19 40:14	egregious 74:17	enjoyed 60:12
displaced 61:6	dosing 58:9 71:19	earlier 105:13 106:6 108:23	EKG 38:13	enjoying 24:3
display 27:22	double 5:4	early 15:24 16:13 39:18 48:10 52:7 67:4 103:21	elaborate 48:3 93:12	enjoys 114:15
displayed 16:8	doubt 76:22 90:5	earnestly 68:16	Elaine 28:19	enlarging 101:2
disprove 26:1	downstairs 6:11	easiest 112:11	elapsed 65:15	enormous 86:14
dispute 30:8	drain 39:18	easily 67:21,24	elective 26:16	enraged 53:14
disputes 30:17	drainage 26:4 59:8	ED 10:17 30:6 59:11 61:2 74:11	else's 18:14	ensure 53:6
disregard 74:14	dressings 39:19	educate 54:11 57:17 104:20,22	embarrassing 67:4	entailed 94:5
disruptive 64:2	drew 45:14	educated 74:25	emergency 2:22 10:12,14 15:7,23 18:21 42:8 49:16 59:16 60:25 61:21	enter 98:2
distribute 46:17	drivel 53:13	education 58:5 62:22 66:8 68:10,17 70:14,17 71:1,6 72:10 74:5 75:24 116:20	emergent 63:4	entered 115:14
disturbing 29:16	driven 9:18	educator 71:16	empathy 10:3 14:12 18:7 30:21 41:19 84:14 85:17	entire 30:7 32:23 54:18 56:18 66:5 70:19 72:24 99:21 107:20
doctor 7:25 72:16	drop 37:20,22 42:19,20	effect 114:12	emphasized 32:14 52:23 75:8	entirety 4:9
doctors 15:15	Drs 46:21 50:3 51:23 67:18 70:23 95:9	effective 15:3 27:22 78:9	emphatically 60:12	entitlement 25:7
document 13:22 16:18 37:16 38:1 39:17 43:6 59:23 69:20,22	drug 31:6	effectively 24:4	employee 3:25 46:4	entrusted 62:22 71:6,16 75:24
documentation 4:14 5:6 11:1,8 13:9 20:24 27:1 32:4 34:15 39:10 74:18 82:7 87:14, 15,16 98:17,18,19, 23,25 100:24 105:12,21 106:10 108:13 112:16 115:1	drum 114:25	efficiencies 10:1	empty 50:8	environment 72:11 82:22
documentations 95:14	DSM-R 46:5		encounter 10:15 13:11,21 14:16 28:20 29:6, 7,19 35:7 40:10 95:5	episode 112:8
documented 10:16 11:13 13:6, 8,11 20:20 40:3,9 100:16 103:2 107:4	due 22:5 32:6,7 40:11 65:7,23,24 67:1 72:25 73:8 74:17 75:21 111:24 112:2,9		encounters 18:21	equipment 81:2,4
	duties 15:4,8 54:14 78:9, 14,15		encouraged 17:14 47:2 53:25 59:10 116:5	ER 11:7,15,24 28:18 85:4 86:21 101:12

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

Eric 2:21	evidence 27:21 40:20,22 73:25 74:2 114:3	exhibited 111:9	external 32:16	14:14 26:9 59:5 63:22 76:6 96:5,23 97:6,23
erosion 43:11	evident 73:12	exit 91:22	Externally 15:19,20	failing 44:7
error 18:11 20:18	ex-fix 55:24	expanded 67:9	extra 15:6	failure 17:17 63:18 67:1 97:18
errors 19:16	exact 20:15 31:21 59:8 95:11,12 98:12 99:2 100:5 104:3	expect 82:22 96:6,25	extract 51:14	fair 57:24 74:16 108:19 109:16
escalate 51:5	exam 13:25 20:24 69:9, 17,21 86:5 98:25 99:1 100:6,12 102:9,20 103:2	expected 116:22	extremely 47:4 50:19 73:1	fairly 5:15 10:25 112:6
essentially 7:13	examination 10:20 52:19 69:7,8 96:5,23 112:10	expedition 54:7	extremity 11:20 12:5 20:24 55:25	fairness 66:13
establish 107:13	examinations 19:24	expeditious 69:10	eyes 25:20 51:20	fallen 59:7
eval 10:10	examined 69:15 100:7 102:9	experience 10:15,16 11:14 21:19 50:14 51:15 61:13 116:16	F	false 34:23,25 35:2 49:25 62:5 63:2 67:2 71:2 73:15 74:7 108:13,18 114:2
evaluate 55:23 59:5 63:18 80:6	examining 114:11	experienced 42:1	face 30:13 62:20	falsehoods 62:25
evaluated 10:18 26:6 38:2 60:20 70:9 79:20	examples 70:13 78:1,17,21 79:5 80:22 87:6 112:4,12	experiences 70:11	fact 12:16 16:11 19:1 23:13,14 31:21 33:1,22 34:3,18,24 39:16 40:11 41:8 49:3,14 55:4 64:14 65:19,24 67:18 74:21 75:7 80:19 81:23 91:19 104:13 105:9 115:7	familiarity 32:6
evaluating 7:2 10:21	exams 69:19	explain 18:23 45:20 57:18 81:22 91:11 93:1 100:18 110:16 111:5	fact-checking 63:8	family 7:22 11:19 14:20 54:24,25 61:20,21 71:11,13 78:3 92:10 115:14
evaluation 7:3 12:18 14:16 18:19 23:22 31:4, 10 33:16 34:18 39:2 44:15,20,24 45:13 67:12 71:20 75:2 76:8 78:22 82:15,17 98:3	excellent 5:6 8:22,25	explained 23:9 50:10 79:4 80:19 81:19,21 89:20	factor 29:25 45:20 54:11	fashion 86:10,12 104:14 115:3
evaluations 6:21,25 8:17 9:15 16:6 18:8 19:18 30:21 35:17 37:5 41:10 44:10 72:17 76:14	exception 4:10	explaining 34:2	facts 17:1 40:9 57:25 63:23 93:11 94:11, 12	father 115:11
evaluator 8:10 9:21	excited 47:10 51:17 116:15,18	explicit 65:22	factually 74:15	faults 54:8
evasive 34:10 43:7 114:1	excitement 47:15	explicitly 67:19	faculty 2:20,21,22 4:8 14:9,21 16:12,14 19:12 26:19,24 27:3,17,24 29:20 31:5 36:14,17 43:11 50:6 54:15, 18 56:17,18 58:8, 15 59:19 60:17 73:24 74:1 91:20 109:14,17 110:9 114:25	February 37:10,13 58:15 67:7 68:14 98:10 101:3 110:14 116:17
evening 52:13 69:2 95:8	excruciating 49:13	exploded 67:14	failed 8:12 44:9 114:6	feedback 23:23,24 35:25 42:1 50:17 51:25 52:3 54:6 60:7 66:15,23 70:15 72:20 76:11,16 78:25 79:1 82:21 111:20
event 32:12	excuse 19:5 39:8,20 67:20	exposure 5:16	failed 8:12 44:9 114:6	feel 43:19 44:2 58:2 75:24 77:13,20 84:18 116:19
event 32:12	excused 3:25	express 93:24	failed	
events 4:23 12:7,13,15 14:6 17:10 39:12 48:2 49:24 50:2 53:21 54:2 57:20 62:6,8 86:15 97:5 101:17 109:24	excuses 17:4 70:7	expressed 53:12 66:12		
eventually 41:13	executive 16:14 17:13,24 31:9 36:15 39:22	extend 65:23		
	Exhibit 53:9 64:1,4 65:3,8 66:20 67:11	extensive 32:10		
		extenuating 65:23		

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

feeling 7:7 27:8 31:14 fellow 48:22 49:5 50:6 55:6 74:3 fellowships 28:7 felt 15:8 47:13 50:24 58:22 66:18,22 71:22 77:9,12 female 28:12 29:22,24 32:11,24 42:12 44:7,11,15,18,23 45:1,5 62:2,15 71:19 76:4,22,25 77:2,5,8,17,19 79:8,10,15,18,23 80:8,11,17,21 83:19,24 84:12,18 86:14 88:22 94:6,8 103:15 figure 50:25 51:1 52:17 figures 68:22 file 31:16,17 64:8 104:19 filed 66:1 files 117:3 filing 112:5 fill 20:4 81:5,6,11,23, 25 fills 81:10 films 61:22 final 45:23 finally 53:19 80:24 find 64:9 finding 100:9 findings 39:21 69:19,20,22 99:16 100:6 101:14 102:5	fine 5:24 46:17 67:19 103:12 105:7 fingers 10:24 14:4 finish 3:10,15,16 32:2 finished 3:12 4:19 68:14 101:7 104:14 fire 57:24 67:24 83:4 104:8 109:7 fired 53:18 91:25 104:13,16 105:11 108:25 firing 47:19 58:6 103:22, 24 104:1,5,9 105:9 firsthand 57:20 fishing 54:7 five-minute 3:21 fix 20:17 21:2,8 73:2 flaws 70:4 flesh 4:13 floor 6:10 7:9 13:5 49:15 85:5 floored 62:13 flustered 57:1 focus 70:17 72:5 74:5 follow 4:3 53:6 59:18 65:25 102:18 follow-through 22:21 follow-up 33:11 83:14 87:23 91:4 foot 26:12 37:20,22 42:19,20 83:7 forced 92:18 106:19	forearm 10:23 14:14 23:3 42:12 forget 42:13 93:5 forgetting 21:5 forgiveness 11:15 forgot 39:3,6,10,17 43:3, 15 form 2:25 81:18,19 formal 41:21 formally 32:20 forms 23:10 formulated 46:2 formulating 31:11 forward 3:8 35:25 forwarded 12:9,10,13 39:22, 23 109:15 forwards 35:8 found 51:8 55:3 59:2 66:16 four-week 28:8 fourth 18:5 fracture 10:23 11:3 85:25 fractures 42:15 61:6 86:21 frame 26:2 82:2 101:12 framework 27:23 68:1 frank 61:3 62:25 63:1 frankly 43:13 49:25 56:25 59:21 60:11 72:1 114:4 free 3:6 46:4	frequent 14:25 18:20 19:6 77:24 fresh 28:10 Friday 42:23 61:25 friend 10:12 friendly 72:4 frivolously 55:13 front 29:13 42:17 43:25 49:23 54:18 56:18 58:7,14 59:19 60:2,16 70:23 73:24 99:12 116:5 frozen 52:6 frustrated 82:23 frustrating 50:16 52:3 fulfill 40:17 full 16:24 17:13 full-time 22:12 41:13 functioned 32:15 fusion 37:16 future 22:24 28:6 91:8,19 <hr/> G <hr/> gain 24:1 82:25 gap 87:4 garner 66:6 gave 17:20 32:23 50:1 58:25 61:18 63:12 71:24 76:11 111:20 112:4 general 2:19 5:18 23:11 80:17	generally 20:6 gentleman 26:12 42:11 genuinely 68:13 get all 40:9 62:4 Giddings 2:20 give 3:20 7:7,15 21:13 32:12 45:12 62:18 98:14 101:12 107:15 111:13 113:22 115:23 giving 90:5 glaring 62:24 GME 22:2 GMEC 16:15,24 17:24 31:9 32:15 35:24 36:15 39:22 40:6, 11 49:24 50:12 62:11,13,19,24,25 63:10 67:3 70:24 73:15 74:8,16 75:16 108:13,14, 16,18,21 109:15 GMEC'S 71:1 goal 50:9,21 51:18 57:17,24 58:6 67:23,25 115:6 116:12,13 goals 64:21 72:18 good 14:3 23:13 46:19 76:11 82:7 111:20 good-faith 65:24 goofy 29:1 gotcha 66:4 68:2 Grabowski 4:10 22:9 26:13,20 37:17 38:2,14,15 39:17 42:24 55:22 56:10 84:2 95:4,9, 15,22 96:16 97:18,
---	---	---	--	---

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

22 99:2,15 100:23 111:3 Grabowski's 39:16 42:16 43:14 88:17 97:11 99:14 109:20 110:8 grade 11:3 44:8 graduate 4:18 47:21 66:7 70:25 graduated 40:5 44:1 graduation 28:5 grant 36:12 65:14 grave 97:23 100:9 gravity 37:25 96:13,16 great 13:5 23:7 31:14 82:18 84:5 111:18 greater 8:11,23 30:14 greatly 67:9 grievance 2:23 22:3 24:7 31:19,21 32:6 35:9 36:9,12 47:3 65:5, 7,15 74:21 112:5, 18,20 grievances 73:7 grin 51:12 gross 63:19 grossly 20:24 49:24 ground 57:23 groundwork 48:11 guess 40:24 87:19 89:22 113:23,25 114:5 guessing 110:13 guidance 48:21 50:17,24 66:18 76:19	guide 68:21 guidelines 63:25 64:10 65:25 67:2,6 109:6 guy 24:3,4 29:1 41:1, 21 66:15,20,23 67:19 91:17,18 Guy's 24:2 guys 6:7 33:4 111:17 116:21 Gwen 2:8 <hr/> H <hr/> H&p 20:25 21:4 25:1 38:8 52:14 H&ps 20:9,21 22:19 80:18,24,25 half 10:5 16:18 54:12 61:4 63:6,7 76:9 86:21,24 90:11 halfway 96:2 102:11 hallway 5:18 6:10 7:10 hand 2:6 10:23 49:15 handbook 64:1 65:8,19,22 66:1,2 116:18 handed 47:23 67:8 handle 6:6 handled 61:10 hands 47:6 hands-on 47:14 116:16 handwrites 36:8 handwritten 7:13 happen 90:24 110:3	happened 10:17 12:15 29:3,8 42:8 54:2 57:19 61:10 62:14 81:16 82:6 86:18 90:3,8, 9,11,25 91:3 109:17 110:3 112:6 happening 42:17 happy 5:9 21:23 27:8 48:14,15 49:17 68:14 83:18 116:7, 19 harassment 47:5 73:10 74:4 hard 7:15 36:21 45:6,8 51:19 68:25 70:16 72:5,19 75:23 84:11 114:7 harm 98:21 harmed 91:19 harmful 71:9 harming 60:17 Harper's 41:22 head 26:14 95:18 health 2:9 3:3 25:6 67:2,6 Health's 63:25 64:10 Health-richland 47:10 hear 3:1,9 4:8 41:5,7 53:25 82:8 heard 6:8 10:11 28:17 29:16 31:8 33:5 47:3 60:4 78:5 113:1 hearing 5:17 22:3 36:12 41:12 57:8,24 62:8 74:17 78:11 79:4 Hearn 2:16 helped	61:23 helpful 7:17 helping 61:24 hemodynamically 29:15 hemophilia 38:17 101:2 hemophiliac 69:5 79:12 80:16 88:24 94:25 100:20 hepatitis 38:8 hesitant 45:22 hiatus 70:10 higher 92:21 highest 18:6 highly 5:10,25 8:22 9:2,5 13:23 41:4 44:1 Hill 2:2,8 31:1 44:5 46:8,13,15 76:2 85:20 105:2 108:10 113:6,21 115:22 116:23 117:1 history 10:19 19:23 20:4 38:6,10 71:10 hold 30:18 holes 86:16 holiday 65:10,16,17 holidays 36:5 home 26:15 28:9 31:7 84:7 honest 83:2 95:11 110:2 honestly 64:19 Hoover 24:25 27:4 58:17, 18 90:16 92:23	hope 66:6 horrible 43:13 horribly 64:15 horrified 13:14,16 hospital 23:18 32:21 42:5 64:3 68:7 70:21,24 75:14,15 92:24 94:16,22 101:1 111:1 hospital's 74:15 hour 3:10,16 27:2 31:13 34:5 40:16 45:8 46:15 49:8 75:19 90:11 93:13,15,19, 21 94:1 105:14,16, 21 106:8,9,10 107:4,11 hours 19:10,11,13 49:4 61:4 63:6,7 69:11 74:11 79:16 86:21, 24 90:2,12,19 93:8 98:7,8,15 101:11 106:2,3 107:18 HR 2:17 21:19 65:5 huge 87:4 human 2:9,16 62:21 humiliate 50:9 humiliating 67:5 hung 29:14 hunting 33:21 hurtful 55:14 64:15 husband 89:9 Hydorn 92:23 <hr/> I <hr/> Iaquinto
---	--	--	--	--

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

10:16 12:5	55:7 64:20 65:1,4	incorrect	infraction	insinuations
idea	72:21,22 77:10,13	34:14 41:11 57:21	71:24	73:14
25:22	78:7 79:7	69:19 74:15 99:1	infractions	insisted
ideally	improved	104:25	57:14 58:24 73:11	59:22
102:8	72:18	incorrectly	initial	inspect
identified	improvement	20:20	10:4,10 11:24	12:22
21:2	8:6,18 9:5 37:9	increase	14:13,16,17,22	inspecting
identify	52:2 70:15 76:15,	25:21	16:9 27:20 28:2,15	13:1
20:19 21:7	20 78:23 82:18	increasingly	42:18 54:6 61:4,5	instance
identifying	89:6	57:14 59:25	63:7 74:10 77:15	26:12
54:8	improvements	incredible	80:1 105:17	instances
illegal	19:16,19	8:25 53:10	initially	24:18 26:25 88:11
75:13	improving	indecision	16:25 17:2 18:19	instructed
illegally	49:23 53:8 70:12	52:6	22:22 76:20 82:11,	25:14 51:10 56:6
70:19 111:5,6	in-training	independent	19 98:18	109:21
illegible	67:20	73:21	initiate	instruction
7:13	inaccurate	India	65:5	63:22
illustrates	69:19,21,22 98:18,	71:11	initiated	instructions
22:1	23 99:16 104:17	indicating	65:5	59:18 102:19
images	105:10 106:20	3:1	initiative	insult
11:6	inadequacies	indications	68:20	62:9 66:9
imagine	50:7	14:1	injured	insulting
105:18	inadequate	indignation	30:22,25	51:8 55:4
immediately	10:25 11:4 20:24	53:13	injuries	intact
12:10 34:11 37:22	29:13 38:8 40:20	indiscernible	28:13,14 29:13	10:21 14:3
61:1 70:5 101:16	inappropriate	76:23 82:12 83:21	61:16	integral
impact	25:12 40:16 58:22	115:22 116:13,22,	injury	70:16
71:12	63:18 64:2 71:5	24 117:2	11:11 23:3 42:12	intelligent
implemented	inbox	individual	49:21 61:22 62:9	8:22
16:15,24	52:12,13	35:3,5 46:1 109:15	66:9 85:24 88:22	intent
implication	incidence	individually	innately	60:15
33:11	111:21	48:25 51:24 60:10	84:16	intentions
implore	incident	78:19	Innovations	53:19
75:20	29:23,24 47:22	industry	6:20 9:15 15:2	interacted
importance	56:17 62:1	91:13	105:20,22 106:2,	91:7
80:9	incited	infection	11,15,17,23	interaction
important	56:17	55:23	inordinate	42:7 84:5
38:9 107:22	include	inflammatory	25:14	interactions
importantly	99:5	57:21	inpatient	13:5,8 85:10
65:11 71:3 75:18	included	inform	23:7	interactive
impossible	13:7 15:9 21:18,20	62:17	input	7:12
74:5 82:3	25:10 27:3,4 29:18	informal	36:17	interest
impression	35:17 105:25	41:20	insensitive	66:4
12:3	including	informally	51:9 71:5,9 72:5	interested
impressive	20:23 27:5 61:23	32:20	116:3	58:4 62:8,23
5:2,8 13:17	62:5 67:16 71:19	information	insight	interesting
improper	74:1	3:1,2,6 23:16	24:1 32:25 41:19	67:9
58:8 63:11 73:25	incongruous	40:22 56:13 57:5,	48:8 76:18 78:8	Interestingly
74:9	71:15	20 71:2 116:24	79:6 81:21 82:24	54:4
improve	inconsiderate	informed	96:5,24	interim
8:23 10:3 19:3	29:12	17:11,17,20 39:14	insinuated	2:8
48:8,19 50:25	inconsistent	52:10 61:1 63:1	55:2	intern
51:15,19 53:4 54:8	9:20	101:9,13	insinuation	6:2 7:23 9:22
	incorporating		55:3,12	
	35:25			

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

22:14,15 41:5 60:20,21,24 63:6 76:8,21 82:20 internal 2:21 internally 12:8 30:16 interns 5:13 6:1,5 7:3 9:3 36:19 internship 5:12 6:14 8:6 14:22 16:7,13 interpersonal 8:21 interpret 30:10 97:14 interpretation 48:2 96:18 interval 69:7 102:10,20 interventions 40:7 interview 5:8 interviewed 40:25 41:2 64:11, 12 interviews 64:5 intimidated 58:23 71:22 introduce 2:4,7,15 4:5 introduced 61:15 invaluable 68:24 invested 7:6,25 investigate 75:22 investigated 29:22 52:18 75:19 92:1 investigating 93:13 investigation 49:7 62:3,16 64:22 93:8 107:20 108:2, 4,6 invited 54:15 56:17	involve 74:12 involved 10:6 11:12 15:22 21:16,18 28:12,15 35:1,2,22 37:13 52:20 53:1 61:15 74:9 89:3 involves 30:19 involving 62:1 Irani 2:13,15,23 3:12 5:2,9,16 7:6 8:5,8, 15 9:4 10:6,16,18 11:9,21,25 12:3, 10,11,25 13:3,12, 19 14:2,11,14 16:2,19,25 17:23 21:20 22:2 24:12, 19 25:19 26:4,5,9, 14 27:2,12,25 29:1 30:18 31:4,8,10, 12,18 32:5,9 34:16,20 35:19,22 37:10,13,16,19,22, 24 38:5,15,16,20, 25 39:3,14,19,21 40:1,12,15,16,23 44:16 46:10,12,14, 16,19 64:9 76:3,4, 7,24 77:1,4,7,15, 18,22 79:9,14,17, 20,25 80:10,15,20, 22 82:5,10 83:23 84:1,17,21 85:16, 19,21 86:2,5,7,19 87:1,5,10,13,25 88:3,6,10,15 89:4, 12,18,21 90:8 91:10,12,17,22 92:2,6,9,13,15,25 93:3,5,9,11,13,17, 20,23 94:3,7,11, 14,18,21,24 95:2, 7,11,17,23 96:1,3, 9,11,17,20,21 97:3,9,13,21 98:1, 5,7,12,17,24 99:8, 11,13,18,21,24 100:1,5,12,17,21 101:9,14,18,25 102:4,7,20,24 103:5,7,11,18,24 104:3,11,15,18,24 105:5,8,15,17,23 106:1,12,16,25 107:6,8,15,22 108:2,6,15,20	109:2,6,11,17,25 110:11,18,25 111:7,15 112:3,10, 17 113:1,4,10,13, 15,18,20 115:23, 24 116:25 Irani's 2:13 4:9 10:5,10 11:18 12:15,18 18:1,5 29:7,9 32:10 97:5 ironically 115:16 irreparable 73:1 irreparably 60:17 91:19 irrigation 11:23 13:20 irrigation/ debridement 14:18 irritate 25:19 issue 20:21 21:17 27:10 51:22 69:13 114:23 issues 5:21,22 8:7 9:5 32:24 42:11 51:22 52:23 54:4,5 67:16 76:19 82:1,7 85:16 92:14 93:24 112:21 114:20 item 17:7,8,15 19:7 IV 46:5 <hr/> J <hr/> January 34:21 35:19 41:16 67:4 74:24 112:6 Jennifer 24:11 jeopardize 31:19 job 73:3 111:18,20 John 4:6 join 5:9	joint 16:5 38:7 Jones 7:5,20 8:1 76:10 84:24 87:23 judge 49:18 July 5:12 9:10 10:6,11 22:12,16 41:15 54:3 112:24 jumped 116:18 jumping 9:13 81:23 June 54:3 junior 9:7 15:5 25:6 106:18 110:20 justifiably 13:14,16 Justin 91:1 <hr/> K <hr/> Kathy 18:3 33:20 34:7 65:19 74:19,20 105:18 keeping 25:24 kind 4:12,22 6:13 9:13 20:24 21:9 25:19 29:1 33:12 41:5,11 43:24 45:24 82:2 114:8 King 65:10 knee 15:25 59:6,8 63:19 68:23 71:20 83:20 knew 23:6 53:1 55:5 81:24 knowing 27:13 52:23 knowledge 8:22,24 13:23 22:1 57:20 65:18 67:17, 18,19 71:20 74:2 108:17 knowledgeable	109:3 Koon 2:17 4:7,16 5:20 10:9 15:20 21:12 23:20 28:23,25 31:1,3,18 34:15 39:6 42:14 44:6, 10,12,17,21,24 45:2,8,11,16,22 46:10,21 47:16,23 48:3,7 50:1,3 51:4, 21,25 52:9,14,23 53:7,14 54:15,18 55:2,10,16,21 56:12,17 57:4,19, 24 58:7,13,16 59:5,18,24 60:2,15 62:22 64:18 66:19, 25 67:3,8 68:5 69:2,13 70:23 71:7,22 78:18 80:2 82:12,16,23 83:2, 17 85:21 94:23,25 95:3,9,14,20,25 96:2,10,15,19,21 97:4,10,17,22 98:2,6,9,14,22 99:5,9,12,15,20, 23,25 100:2,10,14, 19,23 101:19 102:2,5,7,18,21 103:2,6,9,15,17,21 104:1,8,13,16,22 105:8,16,18,20,24 106:8 107:3,10,16, 21,25 108:4,9,12, 17,24 109:3,8,12, 18,19 110:7,14,23 111:4,11,23 112:8, 13,22 113:3,5,21 115:15 Koon's 43:13 50:8 58:5 67:23 <hr/> L <hr/> label 51:6 Labor 55:5,10 labs 24:18 38:13 81:2 lack 8:17 14:12 16:8 22:5 27:22 30:21 32:7 35:8 37:25 40:10 41:19 48:7 49:8 75:20 76:18
--	--	---	---	--

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

78:8,24 79:6 82:24 84:14 112:2	led 14:9 44:3 82:9	limb-threatening 38:24 43:1	lying 13:19 17:9 18:12 92:8	24 5:22 10:1 11:7, 24 14:24 25:12 58:22 63:12 77:24 86:23 87:3,17 89:2
lacked 62:20 64:15	left 2:14 48:9 101:12 102:13 113:16	limited 5:15	Lynn 2:16 46:17,18	manager 16:19
lacking 52:1,8 67:18 111:25 112:9	leg 16:1	list 24:17 36:24 41:4 67:10,13,23 93:19	M	managers 5:19 42:1 60:6 111:16 116:8
lady 42:21	legitimate 68:15	listed 10:13 67:16	made 7:16 8:9 12:18 16:2 19:18 22:23 30:1 31:22 34:16, 24 43:16,25 45:13 50:16 56:21 58:7 60:3 62:22 64:21, 23 65:24 66:16 70:8 72:5,14 80:2 83:9,16 86:10 91:6 102:15 110:6 116:20	managing 7:9
laid 65:25 78:25 82:16 85:3 111:7 115:24	lends 111:10	listen 73:7 113:17	magnitude 82:1	mandate 49:4
Lally 2:21	length 8:5 81:1	listened 70:7	major 23:10 41:17	manipulates 12:5
lambasted 59:19	letter 5:6 44:19 47:23 48:23 49:9 62:11 67:8 77:16 97:14 107:16 108:5,15, 20,22 111:25 112:1	lists 36:23	majored 5:4	manipulating 11:20
Lamoreaux 47:19 103:22,25 104:2,10,13,19	letters 40:13 83:11,14	liters 12:4	majority 27:3 48:4	manipulation 11:19 26:3,4 63:13
language 53:17	level 12:23 13:1 18:6 25:18 27:25 28:1,4 29:25 36:4,7 40:8 42:6 44:25 47:17, 18 50:13 53:22 54:13 62:12 63:14 67:8,12 96:6,24 109:9 110:15	live 33:12	make 3:18 13:20,22 19:2,16 20:23 21:3 36:20 43:21 46:24 49:6 67:24 70:6 72:15 76:6,15 77:20 82:12 90:23 91:4 99:18 100:13 102:14 114:4,7,17	manner 57:22 63:20 69:11
large 37:15 38:17	levels 40:5 63:2	local 61:18 63:12 73:6 87:14 112:14	maker 2:10	manual 24:8
largely 72:17	libel 63:1 70:23 71:15	locker 93:3	makes 34:21 51:12 65:22 73:14 74:4	March 69:2 95:1 98:11 101:4,22 102:23 103:3
Lastly 50:1 60:2 68:5 71:3	libelous 63:10	locum 15:15	making 36:22,24 41:3,17 51:5 66:18 114:16	mark 102:11
late 9:19 19:5 83:12 103:7,18	lie 14:17	locums 27:17	male 12:24 45:6,10,12 82:1,6 85:15	marked 8:18 76:14 83:5
lathe 11:12	life 42:22 66:5 85:15, 18	log 25:24 105:20	malicious 71:2	Martin 65:10
Lathey 16:19 21:18 27:4	lift 86:6	logical 65:12	man 88:21	mass 38:4
laugh 51:3 71:8	lifted 86:8,10	long 28:1 44:12 54:4 81:7 95:4 98:6 100:23	manage 87:8	matter 2:12 33:3,9
laughed 17:3	light 5:19 10:21 37:11	long-term 96:12	management 2:17,18 3:9,17,20,	matters 33:4
laundry 67:10	likeable 41:1	looked 15:2 39:3		Mazoue 9:23 51:23 58:12 67:18
lawsuit 104:19	likes 114:14	losing 75:6		Mazoue's 90:13
lay 116:4	Likewise 3:16	lot 78:19 84:13 85:11 116:11		meaning 109:8
learned 70:11 84:23		loved 116:17		means 12:25
learning 51:14 70:17 102:17		loves 84:4 95:6		meant 18:16 19:22 110:18
leave 81:8,24 92:20		lucky 53:18		measure 23:23 99:6
leaving 21:4 92:17		Luther 65:10		

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

measurements 11:3 38:20	memory 89:22	3:20 31:2 113:21 115:23	month 12:16 14:23	Nathy's 29:5
measures 17:18 18:2 22:4 27:19,21 31:11 32:1 35:18 36:21 40:5 44:1 46:2 77:12 103:9	memos 115:3	miscommunication 52:22 53:3 90:21, 25	months 5:15 16:18 22:13 26:7 28:3 43:18 44:16,20 47:20 55:24 85:12 99:22 111:24 112:4	nation 75:6
medical 8:22 24:20 41:2 66:7 70:25 71:20 72:9	mental 58:11,19	misinterpretation 18:13,15	morning 24:17,21 36:24 37:16,19 42:24 43:2,4 90:20 91:2, 6 95:7 99:9,10 101:5,7 102:9 103:3,6	national 65:10,17 75:5 92:21
medication 29:14	mention 11:2 32:7 35:8 39:15	misinterpreted 18:10	Mostriani 8:11	nature 2:24 32:1 72:23
medications 11:2 12:19,20,21, 25 14:15 23:10 29:11	mentioned 23:6 69:13 85:24 112:13,22 116:15	misled 108:22	motivation 8:17 9:1	naïve 58:9 90:13,14
medicine 2:21,22 4:19 5:5 16:3 18:18 48:15 88:23 89:11 92:10 115:15,16	mentions 77:9	misrepresentations 71:2	motive 48:10 66:3	necessarily 6:18 30:12 41:7
medicines 11:21	mentorship 68:12	misrepresented 70:25	move 3:8 14:4 51:16 54:19 80:5	needed 15:8 16:3 20:10 21:23 26:24 51:15 60:1,22 61:11 77:20 94:18 101:10
meet 17:17 24:9 26:24 36:3	mere 54:12	missed 55:4,9	moved 61:5 79:22 86:12	Needless 50:3 74:4
meeting 16:24 22:8 26:19 27:2,18,24 32:9 33:13,25 35:20,22 47:19 48:18 50:1 53:21 54:12,15,17, 18 56:17 60:18 65:6 75:16 80:1 95:21 103:13 108:14 109:18 110:9	message 24:24	missing 72:21 80:21 101:22,25 102:6	moving 10:24 57:13 75:11 86:13	negative 52:1 64:3 115:19
meetings 21:21	messages 52:16	misstatement 34:16	MRI 26:14,15 38:3 55:23 56:3,7,9,20 57:10 88:19 109:20,23 110:1	neglect 63:1
member 2:11	met 9:4 23:21,24 24:12 27:2 34:20 36:6 38:15 48:12 67:11, 16 76:11 79:25 95:9,15 98:9 102:16,17	misstatements 34:21	MRSA-POSITIVE 38:10	nerves 10:21 14:3
members 2:19,23 4:8 23:18 44:5 73:24 76:2 116:23	metal 11:12	misstep 67:24	multi-trauma 60:19	nervous 114:13
memo 17:20 22:10,13 27:1 32:10 62:19	Michelle 62:10	mistake 26:21	multiple 5:5 21:17 28:13 42:14,15 74:17 111:11	neurologic 37:17 69:14,15
memoranda 14:9	middle 8:4 16:21 40:2	mistakes 20:9,13,15,23 21:3 41:17 50:23 70:4, 8,15 72:14,22 80:2 83:9 102:15 114:16	Mumbai 71:11	neurosensory 99:6
memorandum 17:1,15 22:8 23:20 24:10 25:10 77:2 95:21 109:14	midnight 38:21 69:5 101:4, 23 102:9	misunderstood 17:6 19:2,7,21	N	neurosurgery 61:17 63:15
	midst 25:8 39:25 53:12	mitigating 45:20	names 64:12	neutral 47:3 111:18 116:6
	milligrams 58:12 89:16,18 90:4,6,10,12	MLK 65:13,16,17	narcotic 63:18 90:13	newborn 55:1
	million 53:10	moderator 2:10 3:5	narcotic-naïve 58:13	next-to-the-last 97:17
	mind 12:17 41:15 83:16	modifiable 35:24	narcotics 12:23 25:15 58:9, 20 71:20	niece 55:1
	mine 10:12 15:22 43:13 48:15 89:7	Mohan 2:19		night 11:13 12:12 13:11, 22 15:23 24:23 29:16 38:3 41:21 84:6 89:10,24,25 101:17 102:19,23 116:11
	minor 57:14 58:24 71:24 73:11	moment 22:18 85:23 93:25		nine-tenths 41:15
	minutes	Monday 38:5		non-narcotic 58:9
		money 40:2		
		monitor 39:19		

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

non-negotiable 19:11	32:19 88:17 115:3, 9	office 6:12 16:20 20:3 47:16 65:11 114:11	opposite 31:22 87:21,22	overslept 38:25
non-treated 61:6	numbered 4:25		option 63:16	overstated 49:25
normal 45:25	numbers 4:25	offices 65:11	options 91:14	overstatements 63:19
notably 63:1 67:15	numerous 31:25	oftentimes 83:7 110:19	order 2:6 11:15 25:3 72:21 73:16 104:19 114:8	oxycodone 58:12 89:15 90:2
notation 10:3	nurse 10:12 14:17 26:14 37:20,22 42:1,18 61:8 69:14	Ohio 93:6		<hr/> P <hr/>
notations 10:19		okayed 58:11,20 89:15 90:9,16	ordered 38:2	p.m. 61:1 84:6 92:24 93:4 101:1,4,12
note 5:25 8:4,9 9:2,11 11:9,16 12:9,15,18 13:7 24:6 25:8 31:20 38:8,10,11, 12 45:22 69:11 79:16 80:7,9 98:3, 10,16,19 99:3,5,8, 9,14 101:3,4,5,8, 20,21,23,24 102:8, 22	nurses 28:14,20,25 29:11, 17 35:5,6 42:1 61:14 85:4,5 86:9 88:13 89:23 116:9	older 115:11	original 53:16	packet 95:24
noted 7:12 10:20,22 11:22 14:2 15:1 17:5 20:6 38:13	nurses' 29:6 86:15	omit 20:22,23	orthopedic 5:2,14 6:1,15,17 9:3 11:5 18:22 27:3,6,16 28:13 41:14 42:3 47:10 50:22 51:19 60:2, 20,24 63:6 65:12 75:3,23 76:17 88:12 91:20 97:19, 24 115:12 116:13	packets 46:16
notes 7:13,16,17 8:11 9:17,23 12:18,24 13:10,16 16:21 32:5 35:24 39:14 80:17 94:18 101:22 102:1,6	nursing 10:15 12:8 14:15 42:4 61:7,23 63:5 84:22	omitted 20:20	orthopedics 4:7,8,17 5:13 20:25 22:12,16 76:23 82:20 91:9, 13 115:11	PACS 61:22
noteworthy 69:24 70:9 75:4,18	<hr/> O <hr/>	on-call 15:8	outcome 75:16	pages 4:24 6:21,23 18:1 24:10 25:25 29:4,5 32:5 34:15,19 35:16 36:4
notice 7:4 83:11	OB/GYN 2:20	on-site 37:7	outline 21:13	paid 66:11
noticed 20:8 37:21 68:5	obligations 40:18	one-on-one 32:20 47:12	outlined 24:7 54:1 57:16 65:7 66:2 112:18, 20	pain 11:2,21 12:19,20, 21,23,25 13:1 14:15 18:18 25:12 29:11,13 49:10,13 61:17 63:12 87:16, 17 88:23 89:11,13, 24 90:1,13
notification 35:10	observation 23:16 69:6	ongoing 27:22	outlines 77:11	painful 101:2
notified 19:15 34:9 37:19 39:21	observers 40:4	op 13:7	outpace 74:3	painted 87:20
noting 9:21 21:25	obtain 26:15	open 6:18 10:22 11:3 61:6 71:14	outpaced 67:21	Palmetto 2:9 3:2 47:9 63:25 64:10 67:2,6
notion 114:22	obtained 11:5	opening 115:25 116:4	over-communicate 52:24	panel 47:2
November 26:9 52:7 53:21 103:13	occasion 8:16	openly 53:17 58:6	overdose 12:23	paper 41:14
number 14:19 15:10 16:6,8 17:8 18:24 19:14, 17,21 20:5 30:20	occasions 8:9	operate 47:12 82:3 112:23 116:16	overhead 25:21	paperwork 114:3
	occur 98:6	operating 15:1 19:6 38:3	oversee 66:17,20	paragraph 13:4 18:5,11
	occurred 4:23 75:17 95:3	opinion 23:22 64:19 77:11 111:18	overseeing 66:24	paragraphs 101:8
	occurring 107:1	opinions 116:9	oversleep 103:6	paralysis 38:4 42:17 88:21 96:12
	October 51:21	opportunities 47:12		
	off-service 5:15	opportunity 3:17,18 32:12,23 47:13 64:7 68:11 75:2 82:25		
	offer 17:4	opposed 34:8 86:18 111:8		



Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

paralyzed 42:21 96:8 97:1	10,11,12,14,15,25 71:4 74:5,9,11 79:10,20,22 80:6, 16 84:2,3 85:10, 11,24 86:20,24	perception 18:10,15 81:22 86:15,16,18	PGY 9:10,12 10:8,9,11 16:9 37:11 47:21 54:24 56:21 67:21 73:12,18 103:19 115:10	planned 56:20
Pardon 94:7	88:17,21,23 89:6, 8,20 90:12 91:3 94:25 95:6 96:4,7, 23 97:1,25 98:4 99:10 100:7,20 101:1,6,10,11,13, 14 102:9 109:19 110:21,24 114:11	perceptions 33:7	ph 2:16 8:11 12:8 15:12 16:19 29:5 92:23	plans 8:18
paresthesias 58:11,19 89:13		perfect 50:22 83:9	philosophical 87:20	play 66:4 68:1
part 20:19 22:17 25:10 73:17 84:10 91:1 102:17 104:17 105:11	patient's 14:13,20 18:7 23:18 24:25 29:21 30:19 52:20 53:2 56:8,14 63:13 64:25 69:23 74:10 86:1,2,6,12,19 97:7	perfectly 29:9	phone 27:10,15 52:16 59:23 61:25 62:9 69:18 90:9,10,11 113:16	player 68:20
partake 68:8		perform 85:25	phoned 89:9,10	pleased 49:20 60:11
participated 24:25	patients 7:7,8 8:1,3 20:10 25:13 26:8 29:2 58:13 69:4 70:2,5, 9 78:3 83:20,22 84:6,8 85:8,9 87:8 88:18 90:22 97:20 103:19 114:22 116:10,11	performance 8:5 22:14,15,19 51:22 60:12 68:25 75:2	phrases 33:2	plethora 47:12
parties 61:15		performances 40:4	physical 10:20 13:25 19:23 20:4 37:20 38:6 69:18 98:25 99:1 100:6,12 101:14 103:2	point 3:24 17:5 20:4,6, 13,25 22:11 23:12 43:10 44:3 56:8 64:18 76:7 80:12 82:12 83:1,5,15 92:18 114:10
partner 2:16,18	pattern 51:2 60:4 71:14 73:11,16 75:22 82:19	performed 62:3,16 63:20 71:18 103:3	physician 11:24 16:2 47:13 66:23 72:6 73:2 84:10	pointed 49:10 65:16
parts 42:5 70:16	Paul 16:19 21:18 27:4	performing 61:19 78:14	physicians 64:17 72:15 78:4 84:9	points 17:2 51:14 58:7
party 42:7 47:3 107:23, 25 116:6	pay 33:1,7 39:25 40:2	performs 68:23	pick 62:19 85:8	policies 22:6 40:12
pass 44:9 58:25 71:24	paycheck 66:11	period 15:24 22:16 25:15 41:16 48:8 64:13 79:19 85:15 87:2	picture 87:20	policy 17:14 22:2 32:7 36:11 40:6 70:22 74:15 75:15
passed 33:8	peers 8:21 14:20 48:24 49:23 60:16 78:4	Periodically 30:7	pills 89:16 90:2,5,6	poll 85:4,5 116:8
past 4:23 64:21 71:10 75:7 112:3	penalized 70:21	persecution 71:10	place 27:25 28:4 59:24 87:12 103:10	poor 14:19,24 18:24 60:3,5 74:18 77:23 78:3 111:21
patently 34:23,25 35:1 73:15 114:2	pending 16:24 17:13	persisted 9:11	places 47:14 116:21	popular 64:19
patient 8:2,12,13,17 9:18, 20 10:4,7,10,22 11:1,11 13:4 14:2, 7 15:22,24,25 16:3,4 18:13 20:2 23:3,9,13,17 24:23 25:1,12,14 26:3,4, 6,13,15 27:22 28:12,13,15,20 29:10,12,13,15 30:2,9 37:14,20, 23,24 38:2,3,6,8, 10,11,12,17,18,22, 23 39:8,9,11 42:11,12,16,19 43:1,2,13 49:10, 11,13,14,19 52:7, 8,14,17,18 53:1 55:21,23 56:13,14 57:15 58:9,18,20 59:6,18,20 60:5 61:4,7,8,16 69:5,9,	people 2:5 7:2,18 9:1 21:13,16,18 30:7, 16 32:20 36:15 41:6 71:10 89:3 92:17,20 116:19	person 72:4 92:8,9,11 111:2	position 32:15	
	perceived 19:8 53:5 68:25	personal 50:2,8 70:4 83:2,6, 17 92:17 114:23	plan 16:15 27:13 36:7, 16,18 53:6,25 55:13 56:10,19 57:2 58:21 66:17, 24 70:3 91:5	positive 60:7 85:10
	percent 107:4,17	personalities 30:8	placing 47:17,18 67:8,12	possibilities 91:8
		personality 8:20 85:2		possibly 91:21,25
		personally 46:22 49:17 55:15, 16 56:7 61:20,21 62:15 111:20		post 55:24 58:10 65:11
		personnel 9:25		post-call 21:22 107:5,17
		pertinent 105:2		post-op 37:15,23 58:10,13 59:6 63:18 71:20 84:6 90:13
		perversion 63:22		post-reduction

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

11:6 postoperative 13:9 15:24 25:13, 15 26:3,8 100:4 potassium 43:15 potential 8:25 93:19 potentially 75:6 practice 64:17 115:14 pre-op 81:2 100:3 preliminarily 56:3 preoperative 11:9 80:25 preparing 36:23 present 4:9,12 23:18 30:17 46:15 49:23 56:12 57:4 74:7 76:12 presentation 67:2 103:22 108:24 111:4,24 presented 16:25 45:18 49:24 62:24,25 63:10,17 108:13,15,18,21, 22 110:10 112:11 presenting 50:11 71:15 president 2:8 pressure 31:20 pretty 77:11 79:11 82:7 prevented 74:25 previous 47:20 59:7 67:12 74:21 previously 69:22 primary 14:2 49:11 66:3 print 24:17 prior 23:12,15 34:7 52:24 63:13 85:15	86:24 92:22 94:16 prioritization 15:3 78:9 prison 24:12 private 50:2 privately 48:25 49:1 60:10 78:19 privilege 46:21 proactively 19:16 probation 17:19 44:13 50:6, 15 51:16 53:23 55:3,9 60:24 73:18 problem 25:12 26:7,13 31:6 43:20 51:4 57:8 106:3,4,6 problems 5:21 9:7,22 24:13, 14 37:4 84:25 89:24 94:1 procedure 63:8 64:4 81:6 procedures 40:11 63:4 proceed 46:13 proceeded 17:4 proceedings 2:25 3:7 75:17 process 4:2 21:14,20 22:1, 2,5 24:7 29:20 31:23,25 32:6,8 35:9 40:11 45:6,15 62:18 65:7,24 67:1 70:19 72:25 73:8 74:17 75:21 111:24 112:2,9 114:8 115:5 profession 73:2 76:23 professional 9:25 42:7 63:9 67:6 85:18 professionalism 85:16 profound 100:3	program 4:7,16 5:3 6:3 17:19 21:17 27:6 39:13 47:6,11,12 48:14,15,21 49:5,6 50:17 51:12 53:11 62:10,16 63:4 64:5 66:14 72:21 73:10, 13,23 74:7,13 75:4,8,14,18 92:5, 17,20 93:7,14,16, 24 107:20,24 108:1 109:5,13 114:25 115:7,9 programs 92:19 109:4 110:19 progress 23:23 40:15 64:21 66:16,18,21 76:15 progressed 40:8 promise 50:8 promised 62:15 proof 20:8 proper 53:7 57:25 proposed 66:20 prospects 73:3 protect 60:1 protested 74:20 proud 75:8 provide 14:15 19:14 27:21 43:11 67:25 provided 15:10 19:20 23:24 34:25 38:20 43:12 78:1,12,13 providing 64:12 proving 43:6 provisions 65:22 provoke 56:22	psychiatric 38:12 psychiatry 2:19 psychological 31:4,10 33:16 34:18 35:16 45:13 publications 5:5 publicly 50:9 pulled 39:18 pulse 10:22 14:3 Punctuality 9:18 punished 52:5 55:18 59:3 60:14 68:4 72:2 111:12,14 punishment 72:3 punitive 31:25 32:15 35:14 115:5 purpose 62:4 93:23 purview 56:23 put 25:2 69:11 79:21 80:6 81:1,2 97:11 98:10,15,19,20 102:21,22 103:10 putting 106:15 puzzled 48:8 60:6	17:16 27:5 44:6 46:9,10 76:3 82:23 85:20,21 94:12,15, 23 100:19 103:15 116:6 quickest-to-grab 112:12 quickly 47:15 51:9 quit 91:23 quote 104:4 quotes 104:6 <hr/> R <hr/> racial 71:6 racially 73:9 racially-based 116:3 racist 71:15 racked 50:25 radial 10:22 14:3 radiographs 11:4 radiology 56:6 109:25 raise 2:6 raised 72:8 ran 6:11 rank 41:3 ranking 5:10 41:4 rate 75:5 92:4,16,20 106:18 107:4 rationalize 17:4 Raymond 16:23 re-doubled 54:10
<hr/> Q <hr/>				
Q4 90:12 quality 30:19 84:19 question 76:25 79:12 87:23 89:5 91:7 96:13 101:25 113:7 questioned 54:18 questions 3:11,12,13,15,17, 18,19,24 4:2 12:17				

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

reached 48:21	62:8 101:17 109:24 110:4	referring 91:25 100:18	35:17 36:6,16,18, 21 40:5 46:2 47:17,18 48:23	requested 14:17 55:5 56:11 98:17
reaching 51:18	recommend 29:21 30:3 39:13	reflects 64:3	50:13 53:6,12,22, 25 54:1,3,13,16,20	requesting 66:10
read 7:17 15:14 36:18 84:15 96:19	recommendation 54:13 56:24 57:7 62:11	refresh 89:22	55:12 62:12 64:21 66:17,21,24 67:9, 13 68:1 70:3 71:7	requests 14:15 65:2 73:20
readily 72:14	recommendations 17:12,21 35:12,23 36:14 39:22	refused 11:22 26:21 65:14 74:13,19 104:20, 22	72:16,18 83:10 103:9 109:9 110:15 115:6	required 14:25 49:2 77:24 97:19,24
reading 12:17 36:23	recommended 16:14,17 19:9,13 31:9 46:1 53:22	regard 112:5	remediations 36:8	requirements 37:6 109:4
ready 3:23 6:15 36:24 46:13	recommending 69:3	regrettable 13:12	remember 41:3 85:11 95:18 100:15 103:23,24	requires 7:21
real 20:20 23:15	reconcile 48:2	regularly 49:4 71:7 74:24 75:15	remembered 49:15,16,19	research 5:6
reality 109:12	reconstruction 89:9	regulations 106:9	removal 55:24	reservations 66:12,21
realize 33:3	record 14:9 23:20 39:11 41:2 95:21 102:5 103:5 109:14 116:24	reinstated 67:7 104:20	removed 13:2 68:8	residency 4:9 27:23 32:2,14 41:14 43:19,22 47:11,16,22 50:16 51:3 73:19 75:9 104:14 115:14
realized 33:8 51:10,17	recorded 107:11	reinstatement 36:4	rendered 89:1	resident 2:19,20 7:16 8:15 10:9 11:5 19:13 20:3 21:17 24:8,11 25:6 26:11,17 36:1,17 38:21 39:1,7 40:4,7,20 43:15 47:20,21 48:24 49:8 50:4 54:9 56:4,6 58:17 59:13,14,15 60:8, 21,24 63:3 64:1,7 65:8,19,22,25 66:2 68:21 69:25 70:1, 13,15,16 71:18 74:4 75:7,20 78:18 82:18 91:25 101:21 105:9 109:7,23 110:19, 20,21,22 115:8
reason 9:13 94:10 114:24	recording 27:10,15,16	reiterate 29:24	reneged 75:24	resident's 66:4 88:13 102:19
reasonable 36:22 43:12 79:19	records 64:24	related 22:20,21 23:17	repeat 3:7 90:23	residents 5:21 6:6 7:14 9:4, 6,7,8 15:5,18 16:12 19:10,11 20:7 21:18 27:4,11 30:6 31:5 36:19 40:17,19 41:9 42:2,4 43:23 44:2 48:13,16,22 49:5 50:6,23 51:10 55:7,8 57:17 58:25 59:17,19 63:4
reasons 92:18 94:20,21	recount 89:10	relating 112:1	repeated 20:9 24:18 40:3 41:17 65:2 83:11	
recall 86:7 89:20 94:21 95:11,12,19,23 98:12 99:21,24 100:5 110:12	recourse 39:13	relationship 23:8,13 31:19	repeatedly 14:19,24 23:6 52:23 58:13 73:13, 15 76:5 77:23 80:19	
receive 7:23	recruit 6:3	relationships 8:21	replied 58:18	
received 16:6 44:7 57:15 60:6,25 61:25 62:9 66:9 68:17 108:20	redoubled 68:13	relative 22:25	report 105:21	
receiving 7:3 64:6 66:13	reduced 86:22	relevant 3:6 107:6 108:8	reported 105:22	
recent 44:16 71:11	reduction 49:12 85:25 86:8	relied 56:13 57:4	reporting 106:20	
recently 75:10 112:7	reductions 61:19	religious 71:10	representation 57:25 108:21	
recognition 97:6,19	reevaluated 50:21	reluctantly 44:4	Representing 2:16	
recognize 6:25 8:13 50:22 97:22,24	refer 4:25	relying 57:19	reputation 60:17 70:22	
recollected 13:11	reference 55:21 87:5	remaining 31:2	request 10:18 22:3 31:3 40:1 65:4,5 66:1, 24 74:21	
recollection 12:13,20 23:19	referenced 88:16,22	remediation 15:9 16:15,18 17:14,18 18:2 21:14 22:4 23:23 25:8,17 27:19,20 28:1 29:19,25 31:11 32:1,14		
	referencing 83:4			

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

68:8,24 71:25 74:1 75:1,5 78:15 83:13 92:5 106:1,2,5,16, 18,21,24 107:2,5, 12,13,17 111:1 112:23,24 113:12 114:17 115:20	resuscitation 14:13 74:10	rotation 5:13 8:19 16:9 41:10 44:8 74:25 81:17 111:21	scheduler 81:18	September 22:17
resides 71:12	retribution 71:19	rotations 5:14 68:7 74:24 80:24	schedules 46:22	seriousness 2:24
resolved 54:4	retrospect 51:2	rough 6:14 8:15 82:16	school 4:19 5:5 41:2 72:9	serve 68:12
resource 2:16	return 115:6	rounds 9:18,20 39:1 91:2 103:7,19	SCOA 101:20	served 4:19
resources 2:9	returned 56:8 70:10	routed 52:9	scored 5:7	service 6:15 7:12,18,23 9:19 10:19 14:23 24:2 37:1,2,3 40:17 45:3 67:12 68:9,19 70:1,11 84:3 85:9 91:3 110:16,20 111:2 114:10,15
respect 64:16 66:6	review 12:14 13:17 14:11 17:14 32:10,16 36:6 46:8 106:12	rumblings 41:6,12	scores 74:3	services 5:18 22:14 30:7 41:6,8 42:3,4
respectable 5:7	reviewed 13:25 23:22,23 27:19 36:7	<hr/> S <hr/>	second-to-the-last 10:3	sessions 52:3
respond 17:15,21 33:10 47:25 57:21 64:7, 13 80:13	reviews 76:20	sacrificed 75:23	secondhand 56:13 57:5,19	set 8:24 21:22 37:6 48:10 72:18
responded 53:8	Richland 52:8 68:9 81:19	sacrifices 46:25	secret 49:3	sets 81:14
responding 33:25 34:10 51:12	rid 104:6 114:9 115:20	saddened 62:6	secretary 62:18 81:9	setting 42:20 72:11
response 18:1,2,5,9 25:5 42:18 48:7,13 49:6 53:11 80:15 85:23 105:23 110:9	riding 93:6	safeguards 60:1	secretly 27:16	severe 28:14
responses 113:25	right-hand 4:24	safety 29:21	sedation 61:18 63:15	share 3:6 50:23 102:15
responsibilities 2:3	ring 100:4	salvageable 43:20	sedative 23:10	sheets 61:24
responsibility 8:2,11 22:22 26:22 32:25 34:6,12 72:12 114:2	risk 55:10 96:7,11 97:1	sat 20:12 25:19 34:4 80:24	seek 9:5	shine 6:17
responsing 51:11	Robinson 11:22	Saturday 59:7	selection 76:9	shocked 54:17 62:5 65:14 72:23 114:4
rest 42:21 46:23 54:23 58:7	rocky 82:14	Savage 10:13 11:13 13:16 28:19 35:6	send 53:11	shook 49:15
restorative 115:3	role 2:9 3:5 23:4 68:12 71:16	scab 59:7	senior 27:14 40:7 51:10 69:25 110:18,20	short 11:11 41:16
restore 32:14 43:21	rolled 25:20	scale 6:24	senior-level 110:23,25	shortcomings 96:3,22
result 17:18	room 2:25 10:12 11:1 15:1,7,23 18:21 19:6 26:20 38:3 42:8 56:4,8 70:14	scattershot 21:9	sensation 10:20	shortly 66:10
resulted 15:4	Ross 8:14	scenarios 88:17	sense 25:6 97:18 99:18 100:13	shot 50:20 86:16
results 4:1 67:20	rotate 30:6 41:9	schedule 5:13 21:15 56:3 57:12 68:6	sentence 97:2,8,17,20	should've 57:8,18 58:16 79:21,22 80:3 86:20
	rotated 10:23 20:5 68:10	scheduled 31:13 34:17 54:16, 21 56:2,7 57:11 68:6	separate 25:9	
	rotating 22:15 68:6		separately 28:22,23	

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

shoulder 58:10,13 89:9 90:13	simple 24:16 63:7	slip 81:1	specifically 5:19 90:6 95:23 115:4	standpoint 38:9 87:20 115:18
shoulders 41:23	simply 48:12 51:23 59:19 61:11 104:4	slow 9:17	specifics 22:24	Stanford 5:4 72:10
show 11:19 43:1 59:16 68:16,20 106:2,9, 10	simultaneous 105:6	smacks 43:7	sped 30:1	start 4:22 5:16 6:14,18, 19 7:2,16 8:15 28:10 47:1,8,10 82:15
showed 30:20 45:17 52:13 54:10 61:22 76:14, 20 78:22 82:17	single 11:6 30:13 43:20 50:7 88:25	small 47:11	speed 29:19	started 2:4 4:4,10 5:12 24:20 46:17 54:23 68:19 76:17 82:16
showing 83:12	singled 40:13 73:10	smallest 75:6	Spencer 11:22	starting 6:24 39:15 112:24
shown 7:20 52:11 79:7	singling 71:14	smart 41:1	spent 89:8	starts 41:5
shows 48:7 52:11 76:18 78:8 83:14 98:13 102:25 103:5	sinister 53:21	smooth 91:22	spine 37:14 69:13,25 84:1 85:11 95:5 97:20,24 110:21	stat 26:14
shucks 43:3	sir 85:19 97:14,21 103:1,5 109:11	snow-balled 82:10 83:16	splint 13:2	state 3:10,16 12:4 94:11
sic 51:11 63:11	sitting 2:13 26:20	snowball 82:13	splinting 11:4	stated 11:25 12:1 13:24 15:6 56:20 60:4,12 63:25 66:19 105:8 107:20 108:24 109:8,13,21 110:14 111:4,11, 23
side 4:24 6:13 32:12 34:22 57:5 64:14 74:13 110:10	sit 47:4 87:8	social 9:24 42:6	spoke 32:22 48:24 51:23 60:9 66:15 78:18 101:9 109:21,22	statement 3:21,22 48:23 56:25 96:8,10 97:12 98:1 104:9, 10,17 105:13 108:19 109:2,10, 16 112:4 113:22, 24 115:23,25 116:4
side-by-side 87:9	situation 38:1 41:25 42:10 43:16 55:18 59:2 60:13,22,25 61:3 64:20 68:3 72:1 75:21 92:8 96:13 97:7	sole 110:20	spoken 8:5,8 55:15 58:22	statements 50:12 59:25 62:24, 25 63:11,21 67:3 74:8 78:10 79:3 86:9 91:18 108:13, 18 114:3
sides 3:25 62:4	situations 89:6	solicited 23:22 34:22	sports 9:23 115:15,16	states 4:20 13:24 18:17 31:18 35:12 64:4 115:5
sigh 25:20	six-month 23:22	soliciting 72:20	spot 53:19 56:2 83:4 108:25	stating 16:22 23:21 24:24 25:5 93:11 95:15 107:10
sign 2:25 3:4	skill 8:24 22:25	solidifying 39:16	spotlight 82:13	station 61:22
signed 37:8 55:16 94:19	skills 9:1,24 14:20 60:5 78:3	sort 30:8 41:22 42:6 80:12,14 83:15 111:9 115:18	spread 90:19	status 55:24 58:10,11,19 100:4
significant 8:6 14:12 16:8 19:19 29:25 107:23 108:1	skips 81:8	sought 5:10 66:14	Sridaran 2:19	
significantly 53:16 92:20	slanders 70:23 71:14	sounds 27:12 95:12 101:18	stack 41:14	
signs 11:2 24:18 89:14	slandering 60:16	south 4:18 54:25 72:8	staff 4:18 8:21 13:13 23:18 26:10,13 28:17 38:5 42:4 56:1 60:3 61:7,23 63:5 70:24 75:3 79:1 85:7 88:18 109:20,22	
similar 7:9 26:7 60:4 71:25 86:12	slapped 62:20	spanning 82:2	stage 48:10	
Similarly 63:11,21	sleep 31:15	speak 28:18 51:23 53:14 64:24 114:1,9	stand 57:23 85:4,6,13 108:22 116:10	
Simon 28:19	slightly 42:6	speaking 13:15 20:6 28:22, 23 66:16 105:6 116:5	standard 63:8 70:21 90:13	
		speaks 48:16 115:1		
		specific 77:9,25 80:22,25 87:5 101:12 103:21		

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

stay 19:9,13	stunning 64:9	supportive 41:4	syndrome 38:19 69:6,8 79:13 88:24	tarnished 73:3
step 5:7 7:24 36:3 47:8 63:14 112:18	subject 47:5 70:23 72:25 73:9	supports 115:21	system 59:23 94:16,22	task 3:6 53:3
step-by-step 68:21,22	submitted 62:12 73:15	supposed 33:17	system-based 106:6	tasks 5:23 24:13
steps 91:20	subsequent 20:21 23:4 26:19 72:17 76:14	suppressed 47:15	system-wide 106:3	taunted 71:7
Stevens 12:9 16:23 18:3 24:9 33:20 34:2,7, 9,16,20,21 35:8 55:15 65:19 74:19, 20 105:18 112:19 115:4	subsequently 22:3 24:8 98:2 101:19 102:21	surface 114:21	systemic 61:18 63:12 87:15	taunting 71:6
Stevens' 21:25	substandard 15:10,11 16:6 19:14,17 40:4 43:12 58:14 78:22 86:20 111:22	surfaced 114:20	T	team 25:6 49:11 54:23 68:20
sticky 60:22,25	substantiate 116:7	surgeon 8:25 50:22 51:19 75:23 116:13	tail 32:17	teams 44:12
stone 21:22	substantiated 50:11 63:20 67:21 116:1	surgeon's 26:10	takes 35:22 83:7	teamwork 27:23
stop 7:16 11:20 50:11	succeed 9:1 114:7	surgeons 115:12	taking 30:13 52:3 55:10 59:10 75:5	tee 40:12
stopped 41:10 79:22 80:4 114:11	success 41:2	surgery 2:20 11:10 13:12 20:3,11 38:24 47:10 48:14 58:10 65:12 76:17 81:1,2 83:7 89:10 99:10	talk 6:7 41:23 43:24 61:9,12 63:9 84:4 89:7 92:16,19 94:2 111:17	telephone 16:1 100:11,14
story 6:13 28:19 32:13 34:22 57:6 62:4 64:15 74:13 110:8, 10	successful 44:2	surgical 8:24 22:25 38:9 89:14	talked 6:12 23:5 32:24 34:5 43:4 56:4 61:17,20 62:7 78:22 79:1 85:12 88:4 89:19 102:14 111:16 114:21	telling 24:19 34:7 52:25 90:7 106:14,23,25
story-telling 114:2	successfully 64:18 67:3	surprise 53:13	talking 15:17 25:22,23 27:12 29:12 40:25 42:10 49:5 63:14 72:20 77:15 86:23 87:2 92:2	temper 8:23
street 6:11 56:9 110:1,2, 5	suggestions 19:19	surprised 18:4	tape-record 27:17	ten 4:19 16:4 65:6 66:1 112:5
strength 37:17 99:6	summarily 66:24	surprising 54:11 63:24	tape-recorded 113:8,14	tender 38:18
stress 70:17 71:4	summarize 22:13	surrounding 17:10	tardiness 14:25 19:6,8 26:1 77:24	tendon 81:6,14
strived 68:16 72:19	summarized 113:24	surviving 50:20	target 57:13	tenums 15:15
striving 55:7 83:14	summary 24:24 25:3 52:21 73:5	suspended 36:5 40:2 62:2 67:3 69:3	targeted 70:20 75:22 111:5, 6	terminated 92:8
stronger 53:17	superiors 58:4 63:24	suspension 28:8 29:22 30:3 39:25 54:14 62:4 65:6 66:12 68:15 74:16 92:22 94:16	talks 41:20,21	terminating 44:4
students 24:20	supervise 60:24 68:11	sustained 14:14 37:9	tape-record 27:17	termination 2:13 4:15 17:19 48:11 69:4 75:11 92:23 94:17 104:5
stuff 77:23 81:3 83:12 94:4 116:4	supervision 40:20 49:8 70:15 75:20	suture 15:12	targeted 70:20 75:22 111:5, 6	terms 22:23 76:16 91:18 96:3,22 103:12
stunned 58:21 62:6	support 7:21 23:14 50:9 57:17	swollen 38:18	targeted 70:20 75:22 111:5, 6	terribly 51:8,9 55:3
	supporting 4:14	symptoms 101:15		terrorist 51:6,7 58:23 71:8, 11,23 73:13
				terse 25:5

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

testimony 103:16 104:4	thread 34:19	told 6:13 34:16 38:21 39:7,17 42:18	transpired 62:6	20:14 31:22 54:7 62:5,19 64:18 74:15
testing 37:17 99:6	threads 11:15	43:15 47:17 51:21 52:15 56:1,21	trauma 5:19 7:9 9:19 10:7, 19 11:1 14:13	tutelage 37:7
tetanus 11:4	threatened 53:17 58:24 88:21	59:7,8,13,14,17,20 61:17 63:15 67:15, 17,19 68:3 69:3, 15,18 81:24 88:10	23:10 27:16,17 28:12,15 29:18,22, 24 32:11,24 49:10 60:6 61:5 62:2,14 63:7 71:19 74:9	two-month 68:14 70:10
text 52:16	threatening 71:23	89:11,23 90:1 91:1,5 98:18,25 99:16 100:6,12	86:13 87:23,24 88:2,9,12,22 111:16 116:8	twos 6:25
textbook 84:15	three-month 28:8	101:14 102:10 103:11 115:10 116:7	traumatologist 88:12	type 7:3 37:16 41:23 43:12 105:12 112:1
texted 52:14 84:2	thrombocytopenia 38:11	toll 52:4	tray 81:14	typing 7:16
thanked 49:17	throw 41:22	tone 54:17 83:5	treat 49:10 69:10	<hr/> U <hr/>
thankful 13:4	Thursday 24:23	toned 53:16	treated 51:1 66:22	Uh-huh 84:17 92:25 93:9 96:9 97:9 98:5
theme 41:18	time 2:2 3:6,13 5:22 7:15 10:1 11:13 14:24 17:17 22:16 25:13 26:2 30:7 31:2,22 32:22 33:5,8 36:10,13 41:11,17 46:8,11 52:5 53:2,3 66:12 67:8 70:6 72:16 74:20 77:24 78:4, 11 79:2,3,19,25 80:3,18 81:5 82:2 89:8 101:12 102:8, 24 103:12 116:21 117:1	tool 68:24	treating 7:25 40:18	ultimate 49:18 50:21 62:20
therapist 37:21	time-out 28:9	top 5:10 7:5 18:11,25 95:18	treatment 58:21 66:13 70:18 71:19 95:5 111:8, 10 115:25 116:1	ultimately 52:2 82:8 96:3,21
thing 13:25 14:5 18:14 20:15 21:9 22:11, 18 23:15 25:2,9 30:8,20 32:17 35:14 43:20 45:25 51:18 59:1,13 64:22 80:12 87:18 99:4 115:2	timeframe 28:2	topic 18:20	tremendous 43:10	unable 53:14 73:21
things 4:13 5:23 6:4,19, 22 9:22 16:13 18:4 20:17,19,22,23 21:2 23:1,5,8 24:15 28:7 30:10 31:24 32:19 34:5 36:18,22,25 42:8 44:1 45:20 49:8 51:12 54:7 67:15 71:25 77:13 80:25 82:13 83:11 89:2 106:20 108:7 113:24 114:13,17, 19 115:7	timely 37:4	total 8:2 15:25 16:5 38:7 59:6 68:23	trick 34:1,7	unanimously 27:25
thinks 85:13 107:23	times 9:20 25:9 30:21 31:25 32:3,19 35:3,5 59:20 74:17 77:9 99:25 103:19 111:11,23	totally 87:21,22	troubling 48:6 51:2	unbiased 75:2
thoroughness 100:24	tired 33:17	touch 10:21 86:1	true 48:10 50:4 53:19 54:5 91:21 93:18 95:17 96:5,24 97:6 105:1 107:3 108:25 109:1,24	uncaring 55:14
thought 9:15 26:23 33:6,14 37:6 56:23 60:10 62:18 68:23 80:4 91:5 99:14 111:18, 19 112:11	today 2:9,17 3:1 4:1,22 31:14 47:2 78:11 89:3 100:16 110:1 112:12 114:1	touched 86:2	trust 41:6,7 43:11	unchanged 69:8,9
thoughts 25:17 96:18	today's 2:18 3:7 105:3	Toussant 63:14 87:16	truth 43:8 63:19 90:7 106:14,23 107:1	unclear 12:19 59:4
	toed 61:14	track 32:2 35:15	Tuesday 38:16 42:23 95:5, 10,15	uncompetencies 67:13
		trade 48:14	tunnel 81:3	uncouth 55:14
		training 10:5 35:13 47:14 50:21 74:3	tunnels 81:13	undergo 71:5
		transition 9:10	turn 6:18 7:4 8:10,14 53:21 74:19	undergraduate 72:9
		transparency 21:15	turned	understand 2:24 8:7 33:6 48:4, 9,19 60:7 64:20,25 65:3 72:12 80:8 90:21 92:15 96:13 114:14
				understandably 61:7,9
				understanding

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

21:8 29:8 56:9 57:2 65:17 66:7 110:5 111:15 understood 96:11 unethical 47:5 64:15 75:12 unfair 22:5 32:7 35:9 40:10 75:22 111:10 112:2 UNIDENTIFIED 44:7,11,15,18,23 45:1,5,6,10,12 76:4,22,25 77:2,5, 8,17,19 79:8,10, 15,18,23 80:8,11, 17,21 82:1,6 83:19,24 84:12,18 85:15 94:6,8 103:15 unintelligible 2:2,13 3:4 20:7 44:8,9 80:19 84:13 86:11,13 94:6,8 95:22 105:6,19 107:19 108:11 unique 8:20 United 4:20 university 4:18,21 64:3 72:10 unjustly 73:3 unmerited 70:18 unprofessional 51:9 unprofessionalism 60:5 unsatisfactory 40:14 73:16 unsolicited 58:1 unstable 29:15 unsubstantiated 52:2 73:19 unsupervised 70:10 110:16 unsure 13:2 untrue 59:21 63:12	unusual 5:25 6:5 7:2,22 9:2,5,6,8 13:23 40:1 64:10 unwillingness 73:7 uphold 35:11 upper 55:25 upset 61:7,9 83:3 upsetting 55:10 urgency 8:13 usual 51:25 <hr/> V <hr/> VA 8:15,16 15:24 25:1 26:7 37:4 52:7,14, 17 68:6 74:24 75:3 112:23,25 vacation 53:18 54:20,21,22 55:13,16 vague 17:2 52:1 validated 72:17 Vance 28:18 varied 29:9 variety 89:3 vary 29:4 vast 27:3 vendetta 83:2 veracity 59:25 62:23 105:12 verbal 16:11,12 40:6 41:20 65:2 105:23 verbalized 57:24 verbally	22:23 25:11 verification 73:21 verified 71:18 verify 37:22 version 12:15 14:6,7 29:5 32:11,24 35:7 110:8 versus 21:17 vice 2:8 Vicryl 15:12,18 17:9 view 11:6 12:7 vilified 70:20 vilify 54:10 violate 75:15 106:9 violated 49:3 63:25 64:11 106:8 107:10 violating 106:2 107:17 violation 67:1,5 74:14 105:24 106:18 violations 40:17 49:8 75:20 93:14,16,19,22 105:14,16,21 107:1,5,8,11,23 108:1 visit 13:6 54:25 vital 11:2 24:18 volunteered 49:16 Voss 9:17 10:2 38:15 42:25 45:2 68:23 95:4,9,15,20 96:2, 15 97:23 100:23 Voss' 37:1,2,3,7 43:14 44:16 68:19 97:11, 14	vote 3:23 4:1 16:24 17:13 voted 27:24 voting 2:11 50:13 <hr/> W <hr/> Walker 91:1 walking 6:10,11 Walsh 2:17 4:5,6 10:8 11:12 15:19 16:10, 22 19:23 20:2 22:8,10 23:24 28:22 30:4 31:1 32:9,10,13,17 34:23,25 35:20,22 39:3,5 40:24 42:15 44:6 45:17 46:11, 21 50:3 62:1,3 67:18 68:5 70:23 80:18,23 81:10,17 83:17 85:21,22 86:4,6,9,23 87:2,7, 11,19 88:2,4,8,11, 16 89:7,16,19,23 91:7,11,15,18,24 92:4,7,11,14,22 93:1,4,7,10,12,15, 18,21,25 94:9,12, 15,20 102:17 104:25 105:4,7 106:14,22 107:7, 19 112:19 113:6,7, 11,14,16,19,23 114:14 115:16 116:15 Walsh's 25:13 wanted 12:3,22 13:14,15 19:25 21:14,15,16, 17 28:4 43:21 48:19 56:15 60:7 64:20 82:24 94:10, 11 98:19,24 101:15 109:20 114:6,7 wanting 27:13 94:2 ward 24:14	waste 41:11 water 30:18 ways 7:1 54:8 weakness 58:11,19 89:12 wedding 55:4,10 Wednesday 33:24 week 31:14 37:11 45:3 49:4 53:23 60:19 80:23 81:16 weekend 26:5 weeks 20:5 28:3 34:23 45:4 47:16,22 50:15 53:20 54:12 73:18 75:8 Wehunt 62:10 weird 27:12 welfare 8:12 West 47:9 72:10 wet 61:24 whatsoever 22:23 33:15 115:21 wife 53:15 114:11,13 willingness 22:21 wise 54:19 wished 68:19 witch-hunt 58:2 114:23 withdrew 92:11 115:9 withholding 40:22 witnesses 13:10 64:6,11 wondering 56:23
--	--	--	---	--

Irani, M.D., Afraaz R. v.
Palmetto Health-Richland

Termination of Dr. Irani, Committee Meeting
April 30, 2015

Wood 24:11,15,19 25:2 26:20 27:4 38:21 39:5,6 51:23 60:21,23 101:5 102:10,12 109:23 Wood's 101:24 110:9 word 50:2,7 104:1,24 105:1 words 59:9 104:3 work 4:20 8:16 9:24 10:1 15:6 19:9,10 37:10 48:24 49:6, 8,22 51:17,19 52:25 54:23 55:6,8 68:15 70:12 75:19 78:1 83:13,18 84:25 115:8 worked 46:1 66:5 68:24 75:23 110:19 114:7 working 24:3 46:21 58:5 60:12 84:11 worried 52:22 57:14 89:14 worrisome 89:13 worry 83:19,21,24 84:8 worse 43:14,16 51:12 worsening 101:15 worst 13:17 49:25 worthwhile 9:16 would've 58:17 102:8 105:10 wound 11:2,3,7,18,24 12:22 13:1,17 14:18 15:11,18 17:9 26:3 59:9 71:21 write 25:7 66:10 99:3,17 writes 7:11	writing 17:21 53:9 64:7 97:16 101:7 written 2:5 7:19 40:7 41:20 48:3 63:25 65:2 80:3 99:2 101:3 102:8 110:11 wrong 33:10,12 43:7 52:4,6 55:19 57:12 59:3 60:14 68:4 72:2 78:7,17 80:1 83:6 89:3 111:13 wrong-or-right 89:5 wrote 11:10 23:21 24:11 35:4 44:19 58:1 79:15,16 95:20 101:5 102:6 105:17 107:3,16 108:5 <hr/> Y <hr/> year 9:10,12 10:5,11 41:16 54:24 73:12 75:6 76:8,21 82:16,20 103:19 years 4:20,24 5:3,8 10:14 41:9 42:2 47:20 53:10 75:7 92:7 115:9 young 72:15 <hr/> Z <hr/> Zach 2:19	
--	---	--